

**UNIVERSITY OF KWAZULU-NATAL**

**THE INFLUENCE OF THE MATRIC  
INTERVENTION PROGRAMME ON THE  
PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY OF THE LOCAL AND  
LEAD TEACHERS**

**XOLANI NGWENYA**

**2018**

**A DISSERTATION SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT FOR THE DEGREE  
OF  
MASTER OF EDUCATION, TEACHER DEVELOPMENT STUDIES**

**SCHOOL OF EDUCATION  
COLLEGE OF HUMANITIES**

## **ABSTRACT**

The KZN Department of Education's focus on improving the grade 12 (matric) results in the province has been the main priority in the past seven years. The Matric Intervention Programme (MIP) is one of the initiatives that the KZN Department of Education has implemented, targeted at schools who achieve less than 75% matric pass rate (T75 schools). Teachers referred to as Lead Teachers are those who are selected to assist T75 schools and Local Teachers are those who teach in T75 schools, and are assisted by the lead teachers. The assumption that teachers in the T75 schools lack content knowledge and that some are unqualified has led to the implementation of the MIP. Lead teachers are the drivers of the programme and assisted by local teachers. The main aim of the study was to explore to how the MIP influenced the professional identity of the local and lead teachers and how they experienced the programme.

The study was conducted within the qualitative interpretative paradigm, and the case study approach was adopted. Three lead teachers and two local teachers were interviewed, and document analysis was used to collect data.

Findings from the study indicated that local teachers, as teachers from poor performing schools, were dissatisfied by how the MIP and its lead teachers was introduced to them, that they were not recognised as teachers when lead teachers supposedly came to assist them. This affected their self-esteem and their image as teachers (professional identity). Furthermore, suggested that participants had a clear understanding of purpose of the MIP. Some of the lead teachers were working well with the local teachers, while others had neither relationship nor communication during the MIP process. Local teachers complained that they were not formally informed about the MIP programme and the visits from the lead teachers. The lead teachers fulfilled their roles with or without the presence and the assistance of the local teachers. The study also revealed that one local teacher was not entirely satisfied with the MIP processes. Her belief was that all the stakeholders should have been informed about the MIP prior to implementation. Lastly, the study recommended that there is a need for the MIP officials to formally address the local teachers about their roles in the programme.

## **DECLARATION**

I, XOLANI OSBORNE NGWENYA declare that:

- (i) The documented in this dissertation, except where stated otherwise, is my original work.
  - (ii) This dissertation has never been submitted for any degree or examination at any other university.
  - (iii) This dissertation does not contain anyone's data, pictures, graphs or other information, unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other persons.
  - (iv) This dissertation does not contain other anyone's writing, unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other researchers. Where other written sources have been quoted, then:
    - (a) Their words have been re-written but the general information attributed to them has been referenced;
    - (b) Where their exact words have been used, their writing has been placed inside quotation marks, and referenced.
  - (v) This dissertation does not contain text, graphics or tables copied and pasted from the internet, unless specifically acknowledged, and the source being detailed in the dissertation and in the references sections.
- 

Signed:.....

Date:.....

As the candidate's supervisor I agree to the submission of this dissertation

Supervisor:

Signed:

Date: 17 March 2019



## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

It gives me great joy to acknowledge all the individuals who contributed in so many ways to the completion of the most significant academic challenge of my entire life. This list is quite long, but I appreciate each and every contribution to my development as a scholar and as an educator.

I am thankful to God for giving me the wisdom and strength and for guiding me through the completion of a task of this magnitude.

I am indebted to my supervisor Prof Carol Bertram for the continual support, guidance, supervision, encouragement, and assistance throughout this project. Thank you for keeping me focused every time I was hopeless and thinking it cannot be accomplished. In you I had an outstanding leader and a great supervisor. It was an honour being mentored by such an incredible human being. I sincerely appreciate your contribution and input in this dissertation.

I wish to thank all the participants in the study who encouraged and supported me in this journey. I sincerely thank you for your involvement and participation in the study: Thank you!

Lastly, I wish to thank my family for your understanding, encouragement, and support and for having faith in me:

- My wife Ziyanda ‘Black Diamond’ Ngwenya for consistently supporting and motivating me throughout this journey. For respecting my study schedule and coping without me when I had to attend contact sessions and presentations at UKZN on weekends and was spending most of my time at the library.
- My daughter Uyikhokonke Sibongumenzi Ngwenya for her warm hugs and love when I came home at night from the library.
- My mother Jabulile Mdunge for the love, invaluable encouragement, and unwavering support.

To all my friends who supported me and always had my back especially Siyanda “McShube” Kheswa. Thank you for your selflessness and for allowing me to rob you of your quality time with your families.

## **ABBREVIATIONS**

DBE	:	Department of Basic Education
DoE	:	Department of Education
KZN	:	KwaZulu-Natal
LET	:	Lead Teachers
LOT	:	Local Teachers
MIP	:	Matric Intervention Programme
PGCE	:	Post Graduate Certificate in Education
TLO	:	Teacher Liaison Officer
UNISA	:	University of South Africa

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT .....	ii
DECLARATION.....	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	iv
ABBREVIATIONS .....	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS .....	vi
CHAPTER 1: ORIENTATION TO THE STUDY.....	1
1.1    INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.2    BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT OF THE STUDY .....	1
1.3    RATIONALE FOR THE STUDY .....	2
1.4    AIM AND KEY RESEARCH QUESTIONS .....	3
1.5    LITERATURE REVIEW.....	4
1.6    CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK .....	6
1.7    RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY.....	7
1.8    OVERVIEW OF THE DISSERTATION .....	7
1.9    CONCLUSION .....	8
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMING .....	9
2.1    INTRODUCTION.....	9
2.2    AN EXPLORATION OF THE CONCEPTS.....	9
2.2.1    Identity Formation and Identity Construction.....	10
2.2.2    What is Teacher Identity? .....	13
2.2.3    Ways to View Teacher Identity .....	16
2.3    INFLUENCES OF PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY .....	18
2.4    CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK .....	19
2.5    CONCLUSION .....	20
CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY .....	22
3.1    INTRODUCTION.....	22

3.2	AIM AND CRITICAL QUESTIONS .....	22
3.3	RESEARCH PARADIGM.....	23
3.4	THE CASE STUDY APPROACH .....	24
3.4.1	Advantages of the Case Study Approach.....	25
3.4.2	Limitations of Case Studies .....	26
3.4.3	The Case and Setting .....	26
3.4.4	Access Issues .....	29
3.4.5	Sampling of Participants .....	30
3.5	DATA COLLECTION.....	32
3.5.1	Interviews.....	32
3.6	ETHICAL ISSUES .....	35
3.7	DATA ANALYSIS .....	36
3.8	VALIDITY AND TRUSTWORTHINESS.....	36
3.9	CONCLUSION .....	37
	CHAPTER 4: PRESENTATION OF DATA AND DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS .....	38
4.1	INTRODUCTION.....	38
4.2	INTRODUCING THE LEAD AND LOCAL TEACHERS .....	38
4.3	THE EXPERIENCE OF WORKING IN A T75 SCHOOL.....	41
4.3.1	Local Teachers .....	41
4.3.2	Lead Teachers .....	43
4.4	UNDERSTANDING OF THE PURPOSE OF THE MIP .....	45
4.5	THE KEY THEMES EMERGING FROM PARTICIPANTS' EXPERIENCES ....	45
4.5.1	The Absence of Policies and Structures.....	45
4.5.2	The Informality of the MIP Process.....	46
4.5.3	The MIP: Is It Successful? .....	47
4.6	THE NATURE OF RELATIONSHIPS DURING THE MIP PROCESS .....	48

4.7 THE TEACHERS' PERCEPTIONS OF THEIR IDENTITY DURING THE MIP PROCESS .....	50
4.7.1 The Teacher as a Pedagogical Specialist .....	50
4.7.2 The Teacher as a Subject Matter Specialist .....	51
4.8 CONCLUSION .....	52
CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION .....	53
5.1 INTRODUCTION.....	53
5.2 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS .....	54
5.2.1 The Role of the MIP .....	54
5.2.2 The MIP in the Case Study Setting.....	55
5.3 THE EXPERIENCE OF LOCAL AND LEAD TEACHERS IN A T75 SCHOOL.	55
5.3.1 What Do These Disparate Experiences Exhibit? .....	58
5.4 THE INFLUENCE OF BEING PICKED AS A LEAD AND LOCAL TEACHER ON PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY .....	60
5.5 RECOMMENDATIONS .....	62
5.5.1 Recommendations for Future Research .....	62
5.5.2 Recommendations for Implementation of the MIP .....	62
5.6 REFLECTIONS ON THE THESIS PILGRIMAGE .....	63
5.7 CONCLUSION .....	63
REFERENCES .....	65
APPENDIX A.....	69
APPENDIX B.....	71
APPENDIX C.....	73
APPENDIX D.....	75
APPENDIX E .....	77
APPENDIX F .....	79

# **CHAPTER 1: ORIENTATION TO THE STUDY**

## **1.1 INTRODUCTION**

This chapter outlines the motivation for this study. The focus is on understanding and providing an in-depth influence of the Matric Intervention Programme (MIP) on the professional identity of selected local and lead teachers. The MIP is a KwaZulu-Natal (KZN) Department of Basic Education (DBE) initiative aimed at assisting learners and teachers in schools that are labelled as underperforming schools. A school is deemed underperforming when it has obtained less than 75% (T75) for the National Senior Certificate. The teachers who are assisted are referred to as ‘local teachers’ and those that are assisting are called ‘lead teachers’. The study aims to understand the connection between the lead and local teachers and their understanding of the MIP, whether it is working, and in what ways it influences or affects their professional identity.

This chapter starts with an outline of the background and context of the study. The second part of this chapter discusses the rationale for the study. The following section is on the aim and the key research questions. Thereafter, a brief review of related literature as well as the conceptual framework is discussed. The research design and methodology used are outlined in the next section. The last section of this chapter provides an overview of the dissertation.

## **1.2 BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT OF THE STUDY**

The 1994 democratic elections brought about many changes in South Africa especially in the education system. Currently, South Africa is ranked among the lowest in the Southern African Development Community region in terms of the quality of education, and the matric pass rate has been dropping. KZN is one of the provinces that has had fluctuating results and pass rates over the years, especially since 2013. KZN had a pass rate of 77.4% in 2013; 69.7% in 2014; 60.7% in 2015; and 69.5% in 2016. Therefore, interventions have been put in place to improve the results in the underperforming schools and the pass rate in the province. One of the interventions proposed and implemented by the KZN DBE is called the MIP. As mentioned above, the MIP was initiated with the aim of assisting poorly performing schools: Teachers from other high-performing schools, called lead teachers, were hired, paid a stipend by the KZN DBE, for different subjects to help these teachers, local teachers, who

‘apparently’ have a problem obtaining a 100% pass rate in their respective schools. Lead teachers are regarded as the best in their subjects and are hired to teach in the T75 schools.

This MIP is a provincial initiative focusing on rural schools in selected districts and circuits whose track records of poor results over the years have been alarming. Even though the lead teachers (LETs) are not trained to participate and partake in this initiative, the underlying assumption is that all the lead teachers are capable of producing good results and have great expertise in their respective subjects. The Department seems to assume that all local teachers are struggling in their respective subjects and are either inexperienced or not professionally qualified to produce good results; hence the poor matric results in their schools and in KZN. From my experience of the Programme, it appears that the assumption is that the problem of poor performance lies with the teachers and not the learners. These assumptions cast the teachers in a negative light and means that the teachers’ morale and sense of worth were affected.

A local teacher is a teacher who apparently is a problem and needs help from the lead teacher or the DBE. The lead teachers teach the local teachers’ learners during the holidays and they are paid a stipend and travel costs. The local teachers are supposed to observe the lead teachers. To be appointed as lead teacher in a subject to go teach in another school, one must have an excellent track record of producing good results in Grade 12. In June 2015, I was appointed as the lead teacher for English First Additional Language. My appointment as a lead teacher made me investigate the MIP: I discovered that subject advisers identified teachers in their districts who had a good track record of results in their subjects to become lead teachers. A good track record is when a teacher has obtained a 100% pass rate in their subject for some years. This study focused on two schools within the Umgungundlovu district, in the Elandskop circuit.

### **1.3 RATIONALE FOR THE STUDY**

My personal interest and motivation for this study was triggered by my appointment as a lead teacher and by my reading about the regulation of teacher work identity theory and its effects in practice. The implementation of the MIP suggested that by employing lead teachers, the results of poor performing schools will change (KZN, DBE). Consequently, I wanted to find out more about the significant role of local teachers in the MIP. I started out as a very motivated lead teacher; however, after my first session with the learners, I started thinking about the impact of my presence as a lead teacher on the local teacher’s motivation. I also

thought about the local teacher's commitment, sense of effectiveness, and sense of worth. I assumed that my commitment and sense of effectiveness differed from that of the local teacher because I was always 20 minutes early even though I was travelling 72km to and from the T75 school and I did not see the local teacher while I was there.

I was excited to go and teach as a lead teacher. However, after teaching a section that we as lead teachers, were supposed to cover in our respective schools, I realised that what the learners had learned was wrong. I was saddened when I realised that the kids looked up to this teacher and trusted her! I developed a strong desire to understand how local teachers feel about, experience, and receive the MIP. This led to my decision to research the issues of teacher identity, teacher morale, level of motivation, sense of worth, devotion, and the effectiveness of the teachers for this study. Generally, teachers' lives are filled with countless challenges and anxiety, and they require support from all levels in the education sector and the DBE. Therefore, I consider leadership in a school and/or any other organisation as fundamental to transformation. This viewpoint is supported by Rosenholtz (as cited in Day & Gu, 2010) who perceive the support of teachers and their performance through school leadership and culture as significant. Hoadley (2002) argues that teachers' work is constituted through encounters with other teachers, the state, learners, the school, and the community and that it is through this set of relations that teachers' identities are constituted. Day and Gu (2007) posit that the potential of educators to be productively involved in learning and development rely on how the management of the school proposes ways and/or solutions that present a span of opportunities to learn and be developed, aiming at the need to underpin teachers' devotion and flexibility.

What stimulated my interest in this study further is that there has not been much research about the MIP especially with the concepts of lead and local teachers in the province of KZN and its influence on teacher professional identity. The study would be a success if it benefits the implementation of the MIP.

#### **1.4 AIM AND KEY RESEARCH QUESTIONS**

Research shows that teachers' identity and work is influenced by a variety of factors, including the school context; the relations between the teacher and learners and among colleagues; the external regulation or inspection from the DBE officials; how teachers perceive themselves and their professional practices (internal regulation) (Hoadley, 2002). This motivated me to undertake this study on teachers' professional identity with two local

teachers from Gatsheni Secondary School and three lead teachers from Jacobs High School. I will provide an in-depth influence of the MIP on the professional identity of the local and lead teachers. I intend to use the following questions to guide this study:

1. What are the experiences of local and lead teachers who work in the Matric Intervention Programme?
2. How does being identified as a lead and a local teacher, respectively, influence teachers' professional identity?

## **1.5 LITERATURE REVIEW**

This section introduces the literature reviewed for this study. The conceptual framework that structures this study is briefly discussed after this section. I concur with the South African Council for Educators (1997) that the noble calling of the profession of teachers is to educate and teach the learners of this South Africa. As teachers/educators, we are expected to fulfil and/or satisfy the needs of the South African learners. The needs of the learners should be considered within the contexts of their physical, social, intellectual, and emotional development. In this regard, teachers must plan, monitor, and respond to each learner to promote academic growth. While trying to execute our duties as educators at work, our social and private lives are greatly affected and failing to strike a balance can cause a lot of stress. In this section I review significant literature to understand different concepts that are pertinent to my research. Firstly, I define the concepts of teacher professional identity and then discuss identity formation and outline the influences of professional identity. Secondly, I distinguish between the types of identity. These are fully discussed in Chapter 2. Thereafter, I discuss the two discourses that shape teacher identity: The managerial professionalism and the democratic professionalism. The remainder of this section briefly explores the three regulations of teacher professional identity, namely external, internal, and core regulations.

Beijaard, Meijer, and Verloop (2004), when discussing the essential features of professional identity, argue that every teacher is expected to reason and conduct themselves in a professional manner. Although professional identity is not clearly defined by most researchers, they seem to explain the features of it and what it is made of. Beauchamp and Thomas (2009) feel that there is a link between professional identity and agency and that this is what triggers the teachers' goals to pursue development and the need to learn. Hoadley (2002), on the other hand, claims that teachers' work identity is explained between roles,

rights, and responsibilities regulated at different levels, internal, external, and core (discussed more fully in Chapter 2).

Teachers' identities shift and change because of their experiences and their encounters with either the challenges or the environment they work in. According to Kelly (2006), identity is the manner in which an educator perceives themselves in response to acts of others toward them. Teacher identities are in a pattern of movements or in a state of gradual development because of their (teacher) experiences in different communities. There is no doubt that teachers assume a variety of roles in their respective schools to support their learners' success and/or to support their colleagues. Harrison and Killion (2007) posit that whether the roles of teachers are assigned formally or shared informally, they build the entire school's capacity to improve.

Day (2003) claims that the formation of identity is a continuous process that has to do with how teachers interpret their own experiences. They argue that the more teachers engage with others, the more teacher identity will continuously change. I agree with Van Veen, Sleegers, and Van De Ven (2005) that the way in which teachers become conscious of and understand reforms within the school and in their classroom will be influenced by the way teachers test and reconstruct their existing identities. Professional identity develops and changes as individuals/teachers grow up and face different challenges in life (Anne, Kaarina, & Satu, 2014). Additionally, Hoadley (2002) claims that teachers' work identity is elucidated in relation to the tensions between roles, rights, and responsibilities regulated at different levels: that is internal, external, and core regulations.

Welmond (as cited in Hoadley, 2002), states that teacher identity refers to 'being' and 'doing'. It should be noted that the growing research on teacher identity provides different views from the different researchers. The literature review on teacher education reveals a notion that identity is evolving. I discovered that there are different types of identity and these are entrepreneurial identity; activist identity; nature identity; institution identity; discourse identity; and affinity identity (these are all fully discussed in Chapter 2). On the other hand, Wenger (as cited in Zembylas, 2003) identifies five dimensions of identity and claims that these are useful when one thinks about professional identity. These are identity as negotiated experiences; identity as community membership; identity as learning trajectory; identity as nexus of multi membership; and identity as a relation between the local and the global.

Bakhtin (as cited in Zembylas, 2003) states that the way people see you as an individual is linked to identity. As a result, when educators' voices are not heard and they are not given recognition, they may see themselves as valueless and unimportant. Beauchamp and Thomas (2009) view identity as forever evolving, and the identity of teachers change after some time because of the influence of different intrinsic factors, like emotions, as well as extrinsic factors, like work and life experiences in certain contexts. Day et al. (2006), in a study involving primary school teachers, notes that it was found that dehumanisation was associated with professional uncertainty, confusion, and inadequacy among teachers because of the external inspection.

The literature review is aimed at providing theory and research that is relevant to my study. The description of concepts together with related aspects will highlight relevant issues of the research. The exploration of different concepts of teacher identity and professional identity discussed in the next chapter will assist in understanding how teachers construct and develop identity. The section will discuss identity formation and give a more detailed description of teacher identity and the types of identity. Teacher identity is influenced by a range of factors, and Hoadley (2002) identifies three regulations that influence teachers' work, which will be discussed explicitly in Chapter 2. These will be applicable to the study and help me analyse my findings. My rationale for including the external, internal, and core regulations by Hoadley (2002) in the literature review emanate from my belief about teachers' work. Teaching and teachers' work need to be monitored and supported and must be a reflective practice.

## **1.6 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK**

The conceptual framework underpinning my research is the regulation of teacher work identity. Hoadley suggests that there are three regulations that influence teachers' work identity (2002). A regulation is a rule or directive made and maintained by an authority. The first is external regulation that deals with the relation between teachers and the state and is important for this study because it deals with teachers' identity as a result of state intervention, the KZN DBE's decision to introduce the MIP with the assistance of hired lead teachers. Second is internal regulation that refers to how teacher identities are constituted with regards to their work within the school context. This refers to how teachers understand the purpose of their professional work. This regulation is vital to the study because according to the subject adviser, the MIP was put in place because the teachers are unqualified or lack

the necessary skills to produce good results. In my study because this regulation will unpack the social issues and the kind of support and training the teachers receive within the school. Lastly, core regulation refers to internal constructions of identity: How teachers define themselves as teachers and how their work of teaching is constituted in the classroom. These three modes of regulation at a theoretical level will be used for analysing the data on how teachers' professional identity is influenced by the MIP.

## **1.7 RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY**

This study is qualitative in nature and subscribes to the interpretivist paradigm. According to Polkinghorne (2005), a primary purpose of qualitative research is to describe and clarify experiences as they are lived and constituted in awareness. My aim is to describe the influences of this MIP on local and lead teachers and their professional identities. Scholars in the interpretive and critical paradigms are not concerned with statistics or with the question of whether their data is representative of an entire population. The research style that will be appropriate for this study is a case study. Bertram and Christiansen (2014), state that a case study is a systematic and in-depth study of one particular case in its context, where the case may be a person (such as the teacher, learner, or a principal). In this regard, lead and local teachers are the case study.

## **1.8 OVERVIEW OF THE DISSERTATION**

This chapter introduces the reader to the background and context of the study; the rationale; research design and the methodological approach; aim and key research questions; literature review; and the conceptual framework of the study. While Chapter 1 provides a very brief summary of the literature review, in Chapter 2 I engage with the local and international literature to interrogate the key concepts that inform my study and also to report and present what other studies have been done in the field of teacher professional identity. In addition, the conceptual framework that is used as the foundation of my research is also discussed in Chapter 2. Chapter 3 provides all-inclusive details of the research design and methodology used for the study. In Chapter 4, I present the findings of the study. In conclusion, Chapter 5 presents the discussion of findings and advocacy based on the study and for more research.

## **1.9 CONCLUSION**

The initial study is on the influence of the MIP on the professional identity of local and lead teachers. The main focus of the study is the teachers (local teachers) that have not performed well in their respective schools and have been given support by the KZN DBE via lead teachers who have a track record of producing good results. Both these sets of teachers will be interviewed. The next chapter covers the literature that is pertinent to my study.

# **CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMING**

## **2.1 INTRODUCTION**

In this chapter I review significant literature in order to understand different concepts that inform my research. Firstly, I discuss identity formation and explore the concepts of teacher identity. Secondly, I distinguish between and outline the influences of the types of identity: The entrepreneurial identity, the activist identity, the nature identity, the institution identity, the discourse identity, and the affinity identity. Thereafter, I discuss the two discourses that shape teacher identity: Managerial professionalism and democratic professionalism. The remainder of this section explores the three regulations of teacher professional identity: External, internal, and core regulations.

## **2.2 AN EXPLORATION OF THE CONCEPTS**

Teaching is one of the most demanding and challenging profession and this is true for student teachers, novice teachers, and the experienced teachers who have been teaching for ten years and more. Soreide (2006) maintains that teaching is demanding, exhausting and sometimes lonely. One of the roles of teachers is to holistically educate and teach the learners of South Africa. Teachers/educators are expected to fulfil and/or satisfy the needs of the South African learners. Teacher's professional identity is considered by Tsui (2007) as the most important element in the socio-political and socio-cultural environment of the classroom and in the professional development of teachers. Being a teacher can greatly affect one's social and private life and lead to a lot of stress if a balance isn't found. However, Soreide (2006) states that a teacher has to separate private and public time and school/work life from personal life. As a teacher myself, it is often difficult to separate my personal and work life in the sense that I sometimes work during the holidays when I should be spending time with my loved ones.

The support of colleagues who value them as teachers capable of doing well and developing in the profession is significant and invaluable to all teachers. I concur with Sutherland, Howard, and Markauskaite (2009) that teacher's identities are central to their beliefs, values,

and practices, which guide their actions within and outside the classroom. Consequently, for teachers to feel valued, they need to be supported.

Beck and Young (as cited in Hooley, 2007) mention that the relationship that practitioners have with knowledge is the driving force of professional identity. Hooley (2007) describes a professional as a person who has completed a certain prepared programme that involves specialised knowledge, decided by the profession. The concepts are fully explored below.

### **2.2.1 Identity Formation and Identity Construction**

The concepts identity formation and identity construction have been used by different authors as if there is a distinction between the two concepts. However, despite the distinctions made by various writers, these two concepts may overlap in practice. This is highlighted by Zembylas (2003) who claims that identity formation and emotion are inextricably linked, informing each other and redefining interpretations of each other, and that the search for identity requires the connection of emotion with self-knowledge. He argues that emotions find expression in a series of multiple features and that they encounter other emotions and expressions that profoundly influence most aspects of a teacher's professional life and growth. On the other hand, Anne et al. (2014) state that the proper construction of teachers' professional identity relies on the teachers' thoughts and the values they hold within the work environment. They argue that identity construction involves talking, interpreting, and reflecting their experiences and opinions. The construction of a professional teacher identity is an important component in the field of teaching and relates to the potential influence of the MIP on lead and local teachers' practises.

Soreide (2006) uses the term identity construction in her narrative study of teacher identity and claims that there are four identity constructions that emanated from discussions with the teachers she interviewed, these are: The caring and kind teacher; the creative and innovative teacher; the professional teacher; and the typical teacher. I work from the premise that a teacher should be professional in all circumstances, should kind and caring to the learners, and should be creative and innovative. This is very important for lead and local teachers involved in the MIP since lead teachers are working with learners they are not familiar with and the local teachers need to be professional and support the Departmental programmes and initiatives. However, Tsui (2007) states that identity formation is a dual process of 'identification' and 'negotiation of meanings'. These are discussed very briefly later in the

section. I concur with these findings because teachers' identity has to do with the accomplishments and performance of the teachers (Hoadley, 2002; Zembylas, 2003).

Seemingly, there is a consensus on the exact definition of the term identity formation. Day et al. (2006) posit that the formation of identity is a continuous process that has to do with how teachers interpret their own experiences. They argue that the more teachers engage with others, the more a teacher's identity will continue to change. Beauchamp and Thomas (2009) assert that emotion enters the discussion of identity as a dimension of self and a factor that has a bearing on the expression of identity and shaping of it. They argue that some periods in a teachers' professional life, especially those involving educational reform, may particularly affect teacher identity because of the high level of emotion involved. I concur with Van Veen et al. (2005) that the way in which teachers become conscious of and understand reforms within the school and in their classroom will be influenced by the way teachers test and reconstruct their existing identities.

Generally, it is accepted that change affects identity; this is also true for teachers in that reform and emotions are linked and affect their devotion to their work (Van Veen et al., 2005). This view is further supported by Lasky (2005) who claims that "emotion is understood as a heightened state of being that changes as individuals interact with their immediate context, other individuals, and while reflecting on past or future events" (p. 901). I agree with Anne et al. (2014) that professional identity develops and changes as individual/teachers grow up and face different challenges in life. For the intention of my study, I strongly accept that emotion is an integral dimension of self in the discussion of identity. This is important for the study and is further discussed later in this chapter under the three regulations of professional identity.

In the context of this study, I agree with a number of writers' definition of identity formation and construction of identity. I understand identity construction as the establishment of a person's image in the teaching profession or as a teacher. This constructed image informs the teacher's journey from being a student-teacher to novice teacher until one they are vastly experienced. However, one cannot create self-image in isolation: Teachers establish and construct their identities in the presence of or through their experiences with mentors and colleagues and through their experiences as student teachers. Williams (2009) maintains that social support is significant when one changes a career, especially if the career changer is to make a prosperous transition to teaching. Now the question is: Do all teachers construct their identities? All teachers go through trials in the education system, and some have bad

experiences, others have to leave the field and come back, while others even change schools. As stated before, even though identity formation and identity construction can mean the same thing in practice, it has been defined differently by various authors. The next section highlights the distinctions made by different authors about these two concepts.

As mentioned earlier, Soreide (2006) states that there are four identity constructions: Firstly, ‘the caring and kind teacher’ refers to teachers who feel very close to their learners and genuinely cares and love them. Soreide (2006), further highlights, that a good environment for teaching and learning to take place in is one where learners feel safe and secure. Thus it is important for learners to feel this in school. She adds that an unassailable environment is perceived as very important within identity construction. Generally, all teachers are expected to create good relationships with their learners and be patient with them. Johnson (2003) maintains that: “The caring relation involves one participant as the one-caring (in the position of authority and responsibility, as a mother, or teacher) and the cared-for (those of less power and authority, as a child, or student)” (p. 788). This explanation of a caring teacher by Johnson (2003) is relevant in the context of the MIP and thus significant for the purposes of my study. Teachers should care (as second parents) not only about their qualifications and salary but also about the success of their learners, whether they are from rural areas or not. O’Connor (2006) adds that caring is without a doubt one of the critical attributes of educators because it is not represented in standards and cannot be quantified by any objective means.

The second identity construction is ‘the creative and innovative teacher’ who, according to Soreide (2006), is exceptionally oriented toward recently developed ideas about teaching and schools. Thirdly is ‘the professional teacher’ that refers to the responsibilities teachers assumed in the profession. Chandra (2012) posits that “Professionals face complex and unpredictable situations, therefore they need a specialised body of knowledge, and if they are to apply that knowledge, it is argued that they need to make their own judgement” (p. 34). Freedom from external control/influence allows and teaches teachers independence; however, it is extremely important that teachers act in accordance to the profession and behave responsibly when they have freedom and collectively develop appropriate professional values (Chandra, 2012). I agree with Hooley (2007) who defines a professional as someone who has finished a programme involving specialised knowledge as per the profession and who has trained and been prepared to make professional judgements. Finally, there is the ‘the typical teacher’ who does things the way they have been done in the past, is not keen on changes

implemented by the school or the Department, and does have a problem with changing or improving their teaching methodology.

Soreide (2006) clearly outlined identity constructions could be helpful to understand the ways teachers see and present themselves. Tsui (2007), as mentioned above, discusses the dual process of identity formation. The first part of this process is ‘identification’, which according to Wenger (as cited in Tsui, 2007), has three modes of belonging as the sources of identification. These modes are: engagement, imagination and alignment.

Engagement refers to the way people invest themselves in their jobs and the relationships they have with other people in the profession. Goodson (as cited in Williams, 2009) stated that: “Life experiences and background are obviously key ingredients of the people that we are, of our sense of self to the degree that we invest our ‘self’ in our teaching, experience and background, therefore shape our practice” (p. 640).

The second mode is imagination which means “a process of relating ourselves to the world beyond the community of practice in which we are engaged and seeing our experience as located in the broader context and as reflective of the broader connections” (Wenger, as cited in Tsui, 2007, p. 660). Alignment is the third source of identification and refers to the collaboration of different people in a community sharing their ideas, actions, views, and practices with the aim of supporting one another. The last part of the process of identification is the ‘negotiation of meanings’, which is described as the degree to which an individual is allowed to be instrumental to and shape the meanings in which they are invested (Tsui, 2007). The above discussion of the three modes of belonging as the sources of identification echoes the necessity for local and lead teachers to utilise different methods and devise strategies to create healthy and fruitful relations with the learners for the programme to be successful.

## **2.2.2 What is Teacher Identity?**

The sector for education, particularly at school level, involves different stakeholders such as teachers, parents, learners, non-teaching staff, the school governing bodies, and the entire community within the vicinity of the school. Each one knows who they are, their role, and their identity. Teacher identity has been defined many times in the field of teaching and is often defined as teacher professional identity. Miller (2009) state that identity is how a person understands their relationship to the world; how that relationship is constructed across time and space; and how that particular individual understands possibilities for the future. It is a

constant ongoing negotiation of how people relate to the world. It is relational, constructed and altered by how one person sees other people and how the same people see that person in their shared experiences and negotiated interactions. It is also how individuals perceive themselves, and how they enact their profession in their settings. Identity is the instantiations of discourses and systems of power or knowledge that regulate and ascribe social values to all forms of human activity. Gee (2009) argues that it is transformational, transformative, and context-bound, and is constructed, maintained, and negotiated via language and discourse. Being recognised as a certain kind of person means identity is not connected to internal states but to performances in society (Gee, 2001).

In addition, O'Connor (2006) claims that identity refers to the means by which individuals reflexively and emotionally negotiate their own subjectivity. Moreover, Zembylas (2003) states that in the process of becoming, emotions define and inform identity. However, Day et al. (2006) have highlighted that teacher identities are not only constructed from emotional and technical aspects of teaching and their personal lives, but also as the outcome of an interaction between the personal experiences of teachers and the social, cultural, and institutional environment in which they function every day. I concur with Day (2003), who highlights that teachers are not only overwhelmed by the work they undertake in school but that the pressures that come with the profession also affect their personal lives, hence a distinction between professional and personal identities. The MIP affects lead and local teachers' personal life because they have to sacrifice their holidays to make sure that it is a success.

Research has proven that teacher identity develops and changes as a result of their experiences. Studies, such as Lasky (2005), have highlighted that teacher identity is linked to emotions. She argues that emotions is perceived and understood as a state of being that improves or adjust as people interact with others and during their reflections on the past. Moreover, Zembylas (2003) states that the link between teacher identity and emotion can be linked with the viability of teacher agency. On the other hand, Lamote and Engels (2010) posit that the development of teachers' professional identity lies in their commitment to teaching, their professional orientation, task orientation, and self-efficacy. Day, Elliot, and Kington (2005) mention that commitment is a necessity to professionalism and that identity is closely associated with commitment, motivation, self-efficacy and job satisfaction; Anne et al. (2014) state that identity is formed within social relationships with the contribution of emotions. To MacGregor (2009) teaching is an emotional process, and likewise to Hong

(2010) who identifies value, self-efficacy, commitment, emotions, knowledge, beliefs, and micro politics as the seven factors of teachers' professional identity. Day et al. (2006) maintain that personal and professional identities are closely connected and create job satisfaction, commitment, and motivation. Beauchamp and Thomas (2009) posit that a teacher's professional and personal identity may be affected because of the level of emotions associated with this profession; and Day (2003) claims that teachers' sense of professional and personal identity is a key variable in their motivation, job fulfilment, commitment, and self-efficacy and that these will be affected by the extent to which teachers' own needs for autonomy, competence, and relatedness are met.

I agree with Bell (1995) that external control of teachers' work may destroy the teachers' ability to make precise and well-informed decisions when it comes to teaching and learning. It is assumed that the decisions teachers take are in the best interest of their learners and based on the contextual factors of the school and their classroom. Teachers must be valued and their emotions must be taken into consideration at work in order to sustain commitment.

Miller (2009) mentions that identity is a situated, dynamic process of individuals developing the ways in which they perceive themselves as rational beings over time. As mentioned above, some researchers define identity without the concepts 'teacher' or 'professional'. Butler (as cited in Zembylas, 2003) defines identity as performative, meaning that it is supported by what teachers have done over a certain period of time, that is, their actions. On the other hand, Welmond (as cited in Hoadley, 2002) state that teacher identity refers to 'being', referring to teachers' rights that include their contractual arrangement, their salaries, and what they anticipate as a result of being a teacher, and 'doing', which is elucidated in terms of responsibilities. The growing research on teacher identity provides different views from the different researchers.

In a study carried out in the context of a three-year teaching programme in Belgium for lower secondary education teachers, using questionnaires to collect data, Lamote and Engels (2010) discovered that aspects of professional identity strongly determine the way teachers teach, their professional development, and their attitude toward educational changes. Similarly, O'Connor (2006), in a study using oral history interviews with eight retired secondary school teachers, states that during the conversations with the eight teachers, they highlighted three important aspects of their professional identity. These are representation, referring to posture in the classroom, the level of familiarity, and respect within the teacher-learner relationship; preparation, referring to training the teachers received, induction processes and/or teacher

education programmes; and dedication, referring to the innate interest in teaching as a career, their reason for entering the field, and the level of dedication teachers bring to work.

Sachs (2001) mentions that through changing times, one's identity cannot be perceived as firm. In addition, Day et al. (2006) agree that teachers' identities are essentially unstable and that their temporary stability is likely to be affected at any time by either their own biographical projects or by change in their working environments. A redefinition of a teacher's stance is greatly required as teachers work challenges their identity. According to Beijaard et al. (2004), teacher identity is what the new/novice teachers believe about teaching and learning as self-as-teacher, and it is of vital significance to teacher education as it is the basis for meaning making and being decisive. I agree with Van Veen et al. (2005) when they posit that the way and extent to which teachers perceive, adapt, and realise reforms in their classroom will be influenced by the extent to which teachers challenge and construct their existing identities. The shifting of identities in the profession is elucidated by McLean (as cited in Johnson, 2003) who argues that teachers' sense of themselves shifts with every newly-acquired skill, with every new expectation from their employers, with all kinds of fresh technological ideas to which they refuse to admit defeat, with new social context and with new questions.

### **2.2.3 Ways to View Teacher Identity**

The literature review on teacher education revealed that identity is evolving. Before the discussion on the influences of professional identity, the types of identities or ways to view teacher identity is briefly outlined. Sachs (2001) identified two types of identities, namely entrepreneurial and activist identities. Firstly, the activist identity emerges from the democratic discourses that have an emancipatory aim. She claims that under the activist identity there is an explicit flow of ideas that enables people to be as fully informed as possible. In this type of identity teachers are at liberty to use their own discretion to come up with creative ways to solve problems the learners are facing, or to reflect on their practice with the help of others (teachers) to try and resolve the problems. She further affirms that redefining teacher professional identity as an activist identity consists of two elements: The first is the effort to shed the shackles of the past, thereby allowing a transformative attitude toward the future; and the second element is overcoming the illegitimate domination of some individuals or groups over others. The second type of identity, according to Sachs (2001), is the entrepreneurial identity that is externally defined, regulative, controlling, and

individualistic. It does not give teachers the autonomy to be open to the flow of ideas that have the potential of coming up with solutions to problems they encounter.

Additionally, Gee (2001), who identifies four ways to view identity, claims that institution identity stems from a position recognised by authority. This implies that the teachers are expected to work, to a certain extent, under certain rules, laws, and principles set by the Department and are not at liberty to act autonomously. The entrepreneurial identity is externally defined and has four features, namely individualistic, competitive, controlling, and regulative. These features do not encourage or stimulate a democratic way of life for teachers, and these always have a negative effect on the personal life of the teachers and the profession itself. This view is supported by Fergusson (as cited in Sachs, 2001) who highlighted that:

The potential impact on the constitution, identity, autonomy, and authority of the profession is enormous. The socialisation of intending teachers into the mores, values, and understandings of what it means to be a teacher will switch from being developed in a collective setting of debate informed by theory, research, and evidence, to one in which socialisation is entirely dependent on two or three teachers. (p. 156)

In addition, Sachs (2001) claims that the bureaucrats encourage ‘designer teachers’. These are the teachers who comply with policy imperatives and perform at high levels of efficiency and effectiveness. Likewise, Hoadley (2002) maintains that the bureaucratic arrangements of schools are at odds with teachers acting as professionals. This is elucidated in terms of freedom from external control or influence and exercise of professional expertise.

On the other hand, Gee (as cited in Sachs, 2001) identifies five dimensions of identity and claims that these are useful when thinking about professional identity. These are identity as ‘negotiated experiences’ and refer to the ways us as professionals experience ourselves through participation and through the way we and others reify ourselves. In contrast, Gee (2001) refers to what he calls nature identity as the type of identity derived from a person's natural state. The second one is identity as ‘community membership’ that defines who we are by the familiar and the unfamiliar. Gee (2001) views affinity identity as the type of identity that comes as a result of one’s practices in relation to external groups. Thirdly, identity as a ‘learning trajectory’, where we define who we are by where we have been and where we are going. The fourth dimension of identity is identity as ‘nexus of multi membership’ where we define who we are by the ways we reconcile our various forms of identity into one identity. And the last one is identity as ‘a relation between the local and the global’ where we define

who we are by negotiating local ways of belonging to broader constellations and manifesting broader styles and discourses. However, Gee (2001) claims that the discourse of others about oneself is referred to as a discourse identity.

### **2.3 INFLUENCES OF PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY**

Sachs (2001) identifies two discourses, democratic and managerial professionalism, that shape the professional identity of teachers. Managerial discourses make two distinct claims: Firstly, that management can solve any problems, and secondly, that practices appropriate for the conduct of private sector enterprises can also be applied to the public sector. According to Pollitt (as cited in Sachs, 2001), the assumption is that the management is inherently good, that managers are heroes and that they should be given the room and autonomy to manage while the other groups should accept their authority. Hoadley (2002) posit that external regulation deals with the relation between teachers and the state and that the state-teacher relationship provides the contextual understanding necessary to interpret the influence of other forces affecting teacher identity. According to Jeffrey and Woods (as cited in Day et al., 2006), professional uncertainty and doubt among teachers is eminent when teachers get or receive external inspection, and these are associated with dehumanisation and deprofessionalism. Basically, the managerial professionalism is trying to, within the education sector, specify the meaning of teacher professionalism and what is it that teachers do to practice it, individually and collectively.

Democratic professionalism is the second discourse identified by Sachs (2001) and here prominence is given to collaborative, cooperative action between educators and other educational stakeholders. Apple (as cited in Sachs, 2001) notes that another alternative to state control is democratic professionalism, not traditional professionalism, because it seeks to remove the mystery of professional work and develop alliances between educators and excluded constituencies of learners and members of the community on whose behalf decisions have traditionally been made either by teachers or the state. Hoadley (2002) argues that teachers' identities are regulated through the way they are positioned in relation to their work (training and socialisation), and subsequently there is regulation at the level of the school. She describes internal regulation as referring to how teacher identities are constituted with regards to their work within the school context.

## **2.4 CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK**

The main conceptual framework underpinning my research is the regulation of teacher work identity. The regulations of teacher work identity inform my research and furnish me with the conceptual background to understand and give reasons for the influence of teacher identity. Therefore, the regulation of teacher identity is separated into three forms (Hoadley, 2002). In simpler terms, a regulation is a rule or directive made and maintained by an authority. In this case, the KZN DBE took a decision (made a ruling) to introduce the MIP with the assistance of hired lead teachers.

According to Hoadley (2002), these are ‘external regulations’ that deal with the relation between teachers and the state, and this form of regulation is important for this study because it highlights the issues of teachers feeling incompetent when the state intervenes. The second one is ‘internal regulation’ and refers to how teacher identities are constituted with regards to their work within the school context. This is vital to the study because, according to the English First Additional Language subject adviser, the MIP was put in place because the teachers were unqualified or lack the necessary skills to produce good results, and in my study it was significant to unpack the social issues and the kind of support and training the teachers receive within the school. Lastly, core regulation refers to internal constructions of identity that is how teachers define themselves and how their work as teachers is constituted in the classroom. This is significant to the study as it is assumed that local teachers should be assisted by lead teachers as they lack the expertise to help struggling learners in their respective schools in the classroom. A teacher’s relationship with the learners is important in the quest of transforming the overall results of the school and of individual learners.

In their study to explore the way teachers see themselves, Beijaard, Verloop and Vermunt (1999) identified three factors that influence teachers’ perceptions about professional identity. The first factor is ‘teaching context’: They posit that this context is made up of the ecology of the classroom and the culture of the school. They maintain that teaching cultures and school cultures ascertain, probably to a great degree, the representation of individual teachers, for example, the way they perceive their professional identity (Beijaard et al., 2000). These points to internal regulation, as to how the identity of teachers is represented in the workplace and within the context of the school. Secondly, the ‘biography of the teacher’ is significant to identity construction of teachers. This, according to Beijaard et al. (2000), emphasises the

transformation of identity, the adaptation of personal understandings and ideals to institutional realities, and the decision about how to express oneself in classroom activity. This is in line with the core regulation as it has to do with the self, how teachers perceive themselves and their work is represented in the classroom. Connelly and Clandinin (1999), on the notion of curriculum making and teacher identity, point out that institutional stories told by the three teachers they investigated are pivotal influences on teachers' identity. Moreover, the experience or lack thereof has an effect on the outcome of results of the learners and determines in the case of the MIP whether a teacher is identified as a lead or local teacher; although, at times even the vastly experienced can get poor results in matric. Thirdly, they also acknowledge that 'teaching experience' is a factor that influences professional teacher identity. They claim that the influence of experience on teacher knowledge can only be determined by comparing experienced and novice teachers (Beijaard et al., 2000). Calderheard (as cited in Beijaard et al., 2000) points out that because of experience, most teachers seem to have an established, well-organised and rich knowledge basis on which they can draw.

Therefore, the three different modes of regulation at a conceptual level will operate for analysing the data on how teachers' professional identity is influenced.

## **2.5 CONCLUSION**

The review of literature provided theory and research relevant to my study. The description of concepts together with related aspects highlighted relevant issues of the research. The exploration of different concepts of teacher identity and professional identity discussed in this literature will assist in understanding how teachers construct and develop identity. The section has discussed identity formation and gave a brief description of teacher identity and the types of identity. Teacher identity is influenced by a range of factors, and Hoadley (2002) identifies three regulations that influence teachers' work that I have discussed above. These will be applicable to the study by helping me analyse findings. My rationale for including the external, internal and core regulations by Hoadley (2002) in the literature review emanate from my belief that teaching and teachers' work need to be monitored and supported and must be a reflective practice. Therefore, the trial is whether the teachers' (local teachers) relationship with the government is good enough to support the interventions that are put in place.

In the following chapter, the research design and methodology underpinning my research is introduced. I explore matters regarding data collection methods, sampling, and ethical issues.

# **CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY**

## **3.1 INTRODUCTION**

In Chapter 2 I reviewed literature that focused on identity formation and construction of identity, and the influences of professional identity as a general facet of teacher identity and teaching in particular. The focal points in Chapter 3 are the aims and research questions, research paradigm, research design, data collection, and data analysis. The first part of this chapter outlines the aim and research questions, and then the research design used in this study is discussed. A comprehensive account of the research paradigm employed is presented, and the culmination of the methodology used is also outlined. Furthermore, this chapter presents the case and the setting, which includes the access issues, sampling and participants, and ethical issues. The second section of this chapter outlines a comprehensive account of the process of collecting data and how the data was gathered. In conclusion, the last section of this chapter clarifies the data analysis process, the ethical considerations, trustworthiness, and potential shortcomings.

## **3.2 AIM AND CRITICAL QUESTIONS**

Teachers' identity and work are greatly influenced by a variety of factors, including the school context; the relations between the teacher and learners and among colleagues; the external regulation or inspection from the DBE officials; and how teachers perceive themselves. This motivated me to undertake a study on teachers' professional identity in schools setting. The aim of this study was to address the influence of the MIP on the professional identity of the local and lead teachers. As highlighted in Chapter 1, a lead teacher is an educator appointed by the Department to assist in a school that has underperformed (in this case a T75 school) or that did not achieve a 100% matric pass rate. A local teacher is an educator being assisted by the lead teacher. I used the following questions to guide this study:

1. What are the experiences of local and lead teachers who work in the Matric Intervention Programme?

2. How does being identified as a lead and local teacher influence teacher's professional identity?

### **3.3 RESEARCH PARADIGM**

Paradigms are models or frameworks derived from a worldview or belief system about the nature of knowledge and existence (Morrow, 2005). Punch (2009) concurs and claims that a paradigm is a set of assumptions about the world and about what constitute proper techniques and topics for inquiring into that world. The interpretive paradigm is associated with qualitative research, and it involves unstructured interviews, hence the case study approach, to frame the investigation of the critical questions. This study was qualitative in nature and subscribed to the interpretivist paradigm. In an attempt to make sense of the paradigm used in this study, the two types of approaches, qualitative and quantitative data, is briefly discussed.

Punch (2009) states that quantitative data are in numerical form, whereas qualitative data are in word form. "What are the experiences of local and lead teachers who work in the Matric Intervention Programme?" is one of the critical questions that an interpretive researcher could not respond to numerically but in words. According to Polkinghorne (2005), a primary purpose of qualitative research is to describe and clarify experiences as they are lived and constituted in awareness. It would not be easy for the researcher to see the influence of the MIP on the teachers' emotions using a quantitative approach as it deals with numbers, and this approach does not require much participation from the site. Data are collected in both these approaches, but in qualitative research the interviews and observations are relied upon so that the participants' views are not restricted.

The purpose of this study was to understand, interpret and give full description of teachers' experiences of the MIP; hence the study was located in the interpretive paradigm. According to Morrow (2005), interpretivist positions are founded on the theoretical belief that reality is socially constructed and fluid. In other words, what we know is always negotiated within cultures, social settings, and relationships with other people. As a researcher, personal involvement had to be observed, hence conducting interviews and visiting the schools and teachers was significant for good relationships and to understand the setup and culture of each school, respectively.

### **3.4 THE CASE STUDY APPROACH**

This section outlines the research approach employed in my study. It explains why a case study is used to support the exploration of my critical questions. Different scholars within the extensive literature reviewed define this approach in various ways. Bertram and Christiansen (2014), state that a case study is a systematic and in-depth study of one particular case in its context where the case may be a person (such as the teacher, learner, or a principal). The case study approach is located in the interpretive paradigm. Scholars agree that the interpretive and critical paradigms are generally not worried with statistical accuracy or with the question whether their data is representative of an entire population (Bertram & Christiansen, 2014).

Since each teacher (lead and/or local teacher) experiences different challenges and encounter various contextual issues, each of them present a uniqueness that cannot be reproduced. This notion is supported by Gomm, Hammersley and Foster (2000), who state that the aim of case study research should be to express cases in their uniqueness, instead of using them as a rationale for vast generalisation or for a theoretical conclusion of some kind. Case studies are different from other social surveys in that case studies collect large amount of information about one case across a broad range of aspects, and a case may be an individual, an event, or an institution (Gomm et al., 2000).

Cohen, Manion and Morrison (2011), claim that a case study is a specific instance that is often drawn to exemplify a more general principle. They state that case studies provide a unique example of real people in real situations, enabling readers to understand ideas more clearly than when simply presenting them with abstract theories or principles. It is not easy to define what a case is, when a case may be simple or complex and merely anything can be regarded and/or serve as a case. It is for this reason that Punch (2009) claims that the aim of case studies is to interpret the case in depth and in its pure setting and identify its difficulty and its context. A case study approach has a holistic focus in that it aims to comprehend and maintain the integrity and oneness of the case (Punch, 2009).

One reason why I used the case study approach was because it was set in temporal, geographical, organisational, institutional, and other various contexts that allow boundaries to be set around the case. These can be elucidated with reference to characteristics defined by individuals or groups involved and their participation in the case (Punch, 2009). One of the main components of the case study approach is that it uses in-depth or thick description of the data. This allowed me to provide an in-depth exploration of the influences of the MIP on the

professional identity of these particular lead and local teachers. Consequently, for the basis of my study, the local teachers (Nancy and Nadine) from Gatsheni High School were my case as well as the lead teachers (John, Jane and Joe) that came to assist or were part of the MIP. My focus was on both the lead and local teachers' experiences of working in a T75 school, their motivation, dedication, effectiveness, and the influence thereof on their identity.

In trying to understand the case study approach, different scholars suggest that there are different types of case studies. According to Stake (as cited in Punch, 2009), there are three types of case studies. In no particular order, the first one is the instrumental case study where there is an examination of a certain case in which the intention is to give insight into an issue. The second type is the intrinsic case study, where the intention of the researcher is to get a better understanding of the case being studied. The third type is the collective case study, which Stake (as cited in Punch, 2009) describes as an extension of the instrumental case study where the aim is to learn more about the phenomenon and to cover a few cases. My case study was intrinsic because my intentions were to explore the influences of the MIP on the identity of particular teachers.

### **3.4.1 Advantages of the Case Study Approach**

One of the main characteristics of case studies is to maintain the wholeness, unity and integrity of the case (Punch, 2009). The idea of using more than one data collection method was not successful; however, using face to face interviews with the participants provided me with a rich description. Using observation would have been ideal and appropriate for the study; however, being part of the programme (working as a lead teacher in a different school) made it awkward for observation to be considered.

Cohen, Manion, and Morrison (2007) posit that there are six advantages to case studies; however, only two are highlighted in this discussion. Firstly, case study data are strong in reality but difficult to organise. The second advantage of case study research is the recognition of the difficulty of social truths. It allowed me to understand why some teachers were positively influenced, and others negatively influenced by the MIP. I have highlighted the advantages and strengths of this approach; however, there are also limitations and/or weaknesses. In the next section I briefly discuss the limitations of case study research.

### **3.4.2 Limitations of Case Studies**

Punch (2009) state that generalisation should not imperatively be the objective of all the exploration projects. Nevertheless, the main objective of my study was the outlining of things that happen in a certain context. The second limitation or weakness of a case study is that it is not easily open to cross-checking, meaning that it is not open for verification of figures or information by using an alternative source or method (Cohen et al., 2007). Basically, case studies focus on outlining ‘what it is like’ to be in a distinct position or location. This concerns my study in the sense that my intentions were to explore and describe the experiences of teachers working in underperforming schools and how their identity is influenced as a result. Lastly, Cohen et al. (2007), claim that case studies are vulnerable to complications of observer bias. My potential bias as a researcher who is also a lead teacher in the MIP could lead to complications regarding my study as I potentially know all the pros and cons of lead teaching in the MIP as well as the reaction of the local teachers upon visits of the lead teachers and/or the commencement of the MIP. As a result, an attempt to endorse all the concepts of a quality researcher was made. I aimed to remain as neutral as possible, and was sincerely interested in what the participants had to say rather than what I assumed I knew. The interviews were conducted through a semi-structured interview schedule (see Appendix E and F).

### **3.4.3 The Case and Setting**

This section outlines the description of my case; the lead and local teachers who participated in the research; and the schools in which they work and where my research was conducted. As highlighted in Chapter 1, the teachers that were part of the MIP are the case, particularly the two local teachers from Gatsheni Secondary School and three lead teachers from Jacobs High School. Both the local and lead teachers were the focus; however, the setting (the school) is also important as this is one of the centres where the MIP was implemented. The two local teachers were both women and both joined the school in the same year (2010), however, Nancy had taught previously in another school while this was Nadine’s first school. The school is located in a semi-rural area outside Pietermaritzburg. It is a high school that offers different subjects from Grade 8 to 12. The school used to be the best school in the circuit (according to Nadine, Local Teacher 2) before there were changes in the school management team in the early 2000s.

Upon my arrival at Gatsheni Secondary School there was no security guard at the gate, but I noticed that especially the administration block, two laboratories, and the Grade 12 blocks, were fairly new. In the administration block there was a nice foyer and five offices for all the School Management Team members. There was a photocopier room and the clerk's office is right there in the foyer. There is also a nice big staffroom with a kitchen that was used by the female teachers; all the male teachers stay in the laboratories during break time.

The first participant was Miss Nancy Zulu, who was an educator in her forties and had been teaching at this school for the past six years but had been teaching for more than 15 years. She specialised in Accounting in Grade 11 and 12 and Economic and Management Sciences in Grade 8 and 9. Ever since she started at the school, the learners or the school has never obtained a 100% pass rate in Grade 12 or above 75% in her subject. She was very passionate about her job and loved Accounting. Miss Nancy Zulu has worked in a number of schools before this one, and she had great expertise. She had a dynamic personality and a great sense of humour, and openly disagreed that the MIP was effective.

The second participant was Mrs Nadine Zungu who was in her early thirties. She had been a teacher at Gatsheni Secondary School for the past six years, teaching Mathematical Literacy in Grade 10, 11, and 12 and Physical Sciences in Grade 10. She was very passionate about numbers and said that she was actually a Mathematics teacher not a Mathematical Literacy teacher. Having taught only at this school, she had not been exposed to any other school cultures or environments. She was also one of the teachers who had never achieved a 100% pass rate in her subject in Grade 12, but she was consistently dedicated and committed to her work.

The pass rate in both my participants' subjects over the past three years had been poor. Both subjects had a below 40% pass rate in matric which had an impact on the overall results for Grade 12. The Grade 12 matric results for 2013–2015 were low and ranged from 32% to 52%. This represents a huge drop as between 2002 and 2008 the results ranged from 87% to 100%. This transition from outstanding to poor results had been due to the changes in the school management team that had led the learners to strike because they apparently did not like certain teachers, and there had been division among the staff.

The school's enrolment has dropped, and thus certain teachers were identified as surplus, which meant they had to move to other schools. There were 21 teachers including the principal, one deputy principal, and three Departmental Heads. Only seven of the teachers

were men and the rest were women. This was a no-fee school with an enrolment of not more than 600 learners. The school was under the government's feeding scheme, meaning learners were provided with food. All the educators were employed and paid for by the government, and they were all qualified educators; one of the educators in this pool of 21 was about to retire. Being identified as a T75 or an underperforming school meant the school was part of the MIP and that most of the subjects in this school were allocated lead teachers. Consequently, invaluable details about the MIP were furnished by the educators who had learners with a high failure rate in their subjects. Three lead teachers who were also part of the MIP provided me with worthwhile information about the MIP. The next section gives a brief introduction of these teachers.

All three lead teachers were from the well-respected Jacobs High School. It is known for consistently producing good results and had achieved above 90% from 2006 to 2016, except for 2009 when the school pass rate dropped to 60%. In 2016 the school obtained a 100% matric pass rate, and it had over 50 bachelors and over 40 diploma passes. Two men and one woman were interviewed.

The first participant in the lead teacher category was a Mathematics teacher who taught only Grade 11 and 12. He had been teaching for more than ten years and had been at this school for more than six years. He also taught Natural Sciences. His learners had achieved a great pass rate over the past five years, including a few distinctions. He said he loved Maths and solving mathematically problems.

The second participant was a Business Economics (now called Business Studies) teacher who had been teaching for more than 12 years and was well known for producing good results in Business Studies, including a number of distinctions in his subject. He taught Grade 11 and 12. He was a down-to-earth teacher in his late thirties, a disciplinarian, and a very dedicated Teacher Liaison Office (TLO). A TLO is a teacher who liaises with learners about matters relating to the school, such as learners' attitude and conduct, school uniform, cleanliness of the classrooms etc. He claimed that working extra hours and being committed to his work are the keys to his learners getting distinctions.

The only female lead teacher was a Life Sciences teacher who had been teaching for 26 years. She was a specialist in Life Sciences and had been picked to be a lead teacher over the past few years. She was teaching Life Sciences in Grade 10, 11 and 12.

I selected these participants because I needed access to teachers and schools to conduct in-depth interviews and I was familiar with both these schools. I worked at Gatsheni Secondary School for five years, 2006–2010, and also worked for a year with both the local teachers. One interview with a lead teacher took place on a Saturday at the school (in TLO's office), and the other two lead teachers' interviews were during our free periods in an empty class, and as a result teaching and learning did not stop because of my research. It was a bit awkward interviewing my current colleagues (lead teachers) and my former colleagues (local teachers), not knowing how they might react to me, and whether they would treat me as just a researcher or a colleague. Therefore, I had to re-emphasise to all the participants to treat me as an interviewer doing research. Moreover, I had to reassure the participants that the interviews would remain completely confidential.

#### **3.4.4 Access Issues**

Walford (as cited in Cohen et al., 2007) notes that gaining access and becoming accepted as a researcher is a slow process. As a researcher, it was not acceptable for me to access a school, organisation, or an institution without permission from the relevant stakeholders, for example, the DBE or the principal of the school. Moreover, maintaining good relations with the school and cooperation from all the participants was important when doing research. Even though I was familiar with the environment where both the lead and local teachers worked, I had to negotiate with all the parties concerned to gain access to the schools. Lee (as cited in Cohen et al., 2007) defines sensitive research as research that has the prospect of posing a substantial threat to the participants and everybody who is involved and could be involved in it. I was sensitive to the reality that the research should not affect the families of the participants and the participants themselves in any way and certainly not impact negatively on the teaching and learning in the schools of the participants. As a teacher myself, I was also sensitive to the fact that my research should not affect my duties and deprive the learners that I taught of the right to education. All the interviews with the local teachers were conducted outside the school premises, one in the car in the parking lot and one in my house; however, the interviews with the lead teachers were conducted in the school during their free periods at times convenient for them.

Gatekeepers play a very important part in research because they control who access the school, they are also responsible for re-access, and they may drive the course of a piece of research (Cohen et al., 2007). Firstly, access to the school involved obtaining consent from all

the relevant parties and the participants involved in the study. Walford (as cited in Cohen et al., 2007) states that letters of consent should be given to principals to gain or arrange an interview or a meeting with the principal so that an interview can be arranged .It is therefore the responsibility of the principals to provide access to the schools. The principal of the local teachers was very supportive and gave me the go-ahead to conduct my research with the teachers from his school. Written consent was acquired from both the lead and the local teachers as my participants (Appendix B and C). I made sure that the ethical issue of informed consent was not violated by not exposing issues that are in the public interest.

### **3.4.5 Sampling of Participants**

One of the most significant parts in both qualitative and quantitative research is sampling. The standard of a piece of research rise or falls not only by the suitability of the research methodology and instruments used but also by the appropriateness of the type of sampling used in the study (Cohen et al., 2007). Purposive and convenience sampling was used in this project because I targeted two groups of teachers (local and lead teachers) and I was obviously aware that they did not represent the wider population. According to Cohen et al. (2011), purposive sampling is used in order to access knowledgeable people. These teachers were appropriate to supply in-depth information about the MIP in Gatsheni Secondary School, its shortfalls and benefits, as well as the influence on teacher identity. Convenience sampling was used due to the fact that there was easy access, not necessarily to the school but to the participants. This was because all the local teachers were my former colleagues and we worked together in the school they were currently teaching at.

Cohen et al. (2007) maintain that this sampling involves choosing the participants that are nearer to serve as respondents. Furthermore, the sample was stratified as teachers were categorised as local teachers (both women) and lead teachers (one woman and two men). Stratified sampling has to do with separating the population into homogeneous groups, with each group containing subjects with similar characteristics (Cohen et al., 2007). They further state that the choice of which characteristics to incorporate should aim for simplicity as far as possible, because if there are more elements the sampling becomes more complex, and often more representatives of all strata of the broader population will have to be added to the larger the sample.

The lead teachers that I selected were well known in our circuit for producing good results in their respective subjects, and they worked in a school that was famous in the district for

discipline and for achieving outstanding results in Grade 12 over the past few years. On the other hand, the local teachers selected work at a school that was overwhelmed by poor results, ill-disciplined learners, as well as a few strikes by the learners for different reasons. Initially there were supposed to be three local teachers, but one withdrew and a replacement could not be made as time would not allow it. The total number of participants was five educators. All these teachers were included in the sample because they taught Grade 12 and would provide invaluable information about the MIP. One teacher from the case study school taught Accounting and the other Physical Sciences. These are very demanding subjects, both for the learners and the teachers. The mention of these subjects was relevant to the study because the MIP focuses mostly on these special subjects, among others. Both these teachers were isiZulu speakers and the Accounting teacher had more experience (in the teaching profession) than the other. The lead teachers, also isiZulu speakers, had worked together in the same school for more than five years.

All the selected teachers had vast teaching experience, and most of them had taught in more than one school, except for the local Physics teacher. The three lead teachers were selected for this study because of their great expertise and for being long serving members of the MIP, and the local teachers were picked because they did not produce good results in matric during the previous years.

**Table 1 Participant Summary**

Name	Gender	School	Qualification & Institution	Teaching Experience	Subjects Taught (Currently)	Rank	LET/L OT
John	Male	Jacob's High School	B.Ed. (Indumiso college)	16 yrs.	Mathematics	PL 1	LET
Jane	Female	Jacob's High School	B.Ed. (Indumiso college)	26 yrs.	Life Sciences	PL 1	LET
Joe	Male	Jacob's High School	PGCE (Unisa)	9 yrs.	Business Studies	PL 1	LET
Nancy	Female	Gatsheni High School	PGCE (Unisa)	6 yrs.	Maths Lit. & Physical Sciences	PL 1	LOT

Nadine	Female	Gatsheni High School	B.Ed. (Gamalakhe College)	15 yrs.	Accounting & Economics	PL 1	LOT
--------	--------	----------------------	------------------------------	---------	------------------------	------	-----

### 3.5 DATA COLLECTION

In this section I outline how the data was collected, what instruments I used to gather data. One of the strengths of a qualitative study is that various techniques can be used to gather data, exploiting the strengths of interviews, questionnaires, and observation as data collection instruments. However, being a beginner researcher, I only managed to use two techniques to gather information: Interviews and document analysis. An informal conversation with the English First Additional Language Supervisor Miss OK Mata also gave me background information about the MIP. I faced a few challenges as a researcher, among others; one of the participants withdrew from the study. Another challenge was that the participants were overwhelmed with work as most of them were Grade 12 teachers who also taught on Saturdays and had to spend time with families and go to church on Sundays. It was very stressful because I could not collect data during this time. What was also stressful was that the teachers were not entirely comfortable being interviewed, especially in English, even though they could choose to speak in the language they can best express themselves in. The process of collecting data took three months as a result of delays and rescheduling of appointments for interviews.

The following section presents the method of data collection and the technique used. I used semi-structured interviews and document analysis as instruments to collect date. I also provide my rationale for choosing these methods and instruments. In addition, I briefly discuss the weaknesses and strengths of the method chosen.

#### 3.5.1 Interviews

Artefacts and observation would have been the two most appropriate data collection tools to supplement the interviews. However, the interviews were not the only data collection tool used and it allowed me to obtain biographical information from all five teachers involved in this project. Interviews are often used in qualitative research for data collection and they are appropriate tools for accessing people's discernments, meanings, definitions of situations, and constructions of reality (Punch, 2009). Cohen et al. (2007) note that interviews are a changeable tool for the gathering of the data because they enable the use of multi-sensory

channels. Consequently, I used semi-structured interviews to collect the data. I designed an interview schedule that I considered appropriate to answer the critical research questions. The interviews were conducted using the written questions as guidance, and the environment was quite formal and reasonably structured. Although the order of the interview was maintained, there was also room for spontaneity to allow the participants to talk about sensitive issues (Cohen et al., 2007).

As already mentioned, five teachers were interviewed in my study. All three lead teachers were interviewed at school during working hours in their free periods; one local teacher came to my house and the other interview was conducted in the car as there was no convenient appropriate venue. The interviews lasted between 28 minutes and 36 minutes each. I had called the participants to arrange interviews, and they could choose a venue and time that was convenient for them. I used the laptop to read the interview schedule to the lead teachers as there was no hard copy available on the set days. Before I could commence with the interviews, all the participants were reminded of what was written in the consent letters that I gave to them weeks before the interviews. It contained a request for them to participate in the study and an agreement between them and me which stipulated the issues of confidentiality amongst other things. It was in my best interest to ensure that the interviews run smoothly without any distractions and interruptions. On the days of the interview, I also requested their consent to record the interviews. I was aware that the recording might constrain the respondents, but I concur with Cohen et al. (2007) that an audio recorder is unobtrusive. Transcribing is a crucial aspect of this data collection tool as it prevents losing the data, reduction of complexity, and distortion (Cohen et al., 2007). I chose to transcribe the generated data.

One of the weaknesses of interviews, according to Cohen et al. (2007), is that they have little flexibility in terms of relating the interview to certain individuals and circumstances. Moreover, interviews might compel or limit the relevance and naturalness of the questioning and answering process (Cohen et al., 2007). I was very aware of this and during the interviews participants were at liberty to respond in their home language (isiZulu), allowing for more flexibility. Furthermore, all participants were asked the same questions during the interviews, making the answers and data easier to compare (Cohen et al., 2007) (see Appendix E and F).

It was significant to supplement the data gathered from the interviews. I needed to gain some facts and figures about the matric pass rate from the DBE officials involved in monitoring,

initiating, and facilitating the MIP. Document analysis, including the learner and teacher support document, enabled me to examine and interpret the data so I can develop knowledge and gain understanding about the fact and figures of the MIP pass rate. Bowen (2009) defines document analysis as a systematic procedure used to review or evaluate documents that are both printed and electronic (computer based and Internet transmitted) material. Analysing documents provided me the chance to evaluate the results and the success or failure of the MIP. Furthermore, document analysis afforded me a new perspective on the usage of documents. Bowen (2009) discusses five specific functions of documentary material and I considered two as most appropriate for the required data. The first one is that documents can provide data on the context within which those who are part of the study work or operate because documents give background information as well as historic insight; secondly, documents provide a means of tracking development and change (Bowen, 2009). Even though I had gathered background information in terms of the results and the school performance from the interviews, document analysis appropriately supplemented the interviews with the information from the DBE official reports.

Some of the advantages of document analysis are that it is less time-consuming and therefore more efficient than other research methods, and that it requires data selection, instead of data collection (Bowen, 2009). Document analysis was not my primary source of data collection, but it was a reliable source of information. On the other hand, document analysis had its challenges as it produced insufficient details, especially for research purposes. Learners had booklets as study materials that were compiled by the DBE to enhance and assist the revision process during the MIP. Some of the reading materials that learners used were obtainable at the learners' camp or stand-alone sites. In as much as this methodology assisted me in this study, I could not retrieve the actual changes in learner pass rate except for the overall pass rate of the school (if they were any) in the MIP after the learners had written their final examination in November/December. I would have appreciated seeing the individual learners' statements, only the learners that were part of the programme. I concur with Yin's (as cited in Bowen, 2009) view that access to documents may be deliberately blocked. It was difficult to retrieve all the documentation especially regarding the improvements or changes in the pass rate after the implementation of the MIP. Nevertheless, this method was helpful in my study.

### **3.6 ETHICAL ISSUES**

Ethics is the moral principle that governs a person's behaviour or the conducting of an activity (Bertram & Christiansen, 2014). Empirical research in education unavoidably brings ethical issues because it includes collecting data from human beings and about human beings (Punch, 2009). It was therefore significant and appropriate in this study to point out and take into consideration the issues of ethics involved. In addition, Punch (2009) state that some qualitative studies concern the most intimate, innermost and sensitive matters in people's lives, and ethical matters inescapably accompany the gathering of this kind of information. Furthermore, Hitchcock and Hughes (as cited in Cohen et al., 2007) state:

Doing participant observation or interviewing one's peers raises ethical problems that are directly related to the nature of the research technique employed. The degree of openness or closure of the nature of the research and its aims is one that directly faces the teacher researcher. (p. 69)

I therefore personally ensured that the establishment of good relations was given cautious consideration because of the inclusion of human beings in the study. Consequently, the development of a sense of affinity between me and the participants spearheaded the element of trust and confidence.

The focus of my study was how the MIP influenced teachers' identity and their perceptions of its effectiveness. I applied the three principles of ethics: Autonomy, non-maleficence, and beneficence (Cohen et al., 2007). I maintained and respected the autonomy of all the participants by getting their consent. Prior to that, I obtained consent and ethical clearance from the university. I also obtained ethical clearance and permission to conduct research in the KZN DBE institutions from the DBE. Upon receiving the permission and clearance, I was exceptionally conscious of the conditions of its approval. Consent was also obtained from the principal (as the gatekeeper), and the principal was given a letter that outlined and provided an explanation about the study. I ensured that the confidentiality of all the participants was guaranteed by using pseudonyms, maintaining anonymity, and keeping all the information in a safe and secure place. Punch (2009) maintains that confidentiality, protection, and the subsequent use of data gathered for the purposes of research are of great significance.

I adhered to the principle of non-maleficence. I made it clear to the participants that the study had no intention to either do harm to any of them (participants) or bring the school and the

teachers into disrepute. I assured the participants that any information or data gathered would be made available to the school for especially the local teachers to read.

### **3.7 DATA ANALYSIS**

Analysing qualitative data includes accounting for and explaining the data, and organising and making sense of the data with regards to the participants' clarification of the situation while noting themes, patterns, categories, and regularities (Cohen et al. 2007). Silverman (as cited in Punch, 2009) makes an interesting distinction between analysing qualitative and quantitative data: There are clear conventions the researcher can utilise when analysing quantitative data; however, analysing qualitative data has limited guidelines for protection against self-delusion and the presentation of unreliable or invalid conclusions to policy-making audiences. It was therefore a difficult and taxing task to reduce and interpret the data in a significant fashion. Cohen et al. (2007) claims that "at a practical level, qualitative research rapidly amasses huge amounts of data, and early analysis reduces the problem of data overload by selecting out significant features for future focus" (p. 462).

In analysing the data, I employed the three components of data analysis as recommended by Miles and Huberman (as cited in Punch, 2009) which comprise data reduction, data display, and drawing and verifying conclusions. During data reduction, subdividing, editing, summarising, coding, and memoing associating activities such as themes and patterns took place. Organisation of information/data was displayed using charts and diagrams so that I could move the analysis forward. Lastly, it was significant for me to interpret and make meaning of the data. In this regard, Punch (2009) states that the main aim of drawing and verifying conclusions is to consolidate all that has been in the data reduction process and data display into a meaningful and logical picture of the data.

### **3.8 VALIDITY AND TRUSTWORTHINESS**

This section discusses briefly trustworthiness and reliability in qualitative research. In qualitative data a number of factors contribute to a degree of biases, including the respondent's opinion, their attitudes, their subjectivity, and their perspectives (Cohen et al., 2007). Many writers view validity as a crucial element to effective research. Validity is often described as a key requirement for both qualitative and quantitative research and Cohen et al. (2007) claims that reliability is a necessary but insufficient condition for validity in research. According to Kumar (2005), if there is stability and consistency in the research tool, hence it

is predictable and accurate, it is reliable. Using one method of data collection was not a sufficient evaluation to triangulate and verify the data collected for this study. Conducting a pilot study and doing a presentation on it and the instruments used and being critiqued by colleagues assisted me in my research.

Dealing and working with human beings in my study required sufficient levels of trust. In this regard, putting forward trustworthiness was essential. Morrow (2005) states that credibility can be achieved by prolonged engagement with participants, peer researchers, researcher reflexivity, participant checks, and validation. It is also enhanced by a thorough description of source data and a fit between the data and the emerging analysis as well as by ‘thick descriptions’. Using one method of data collection could diminish trustworthiness. However, prolonging the engagement with the data enhanced trustworthiness.

### **3.9 CONCLUSION**

The chapter discussed the research paradigm and methodology employed in this study. The nature of the study required a full description of the approach (case study), including the advantages and disadvantages. I outlined a brief account of the ethical considerations and the procedures followed to safeguard the issues of validity and trustworthiness. I was very selective in choosing the participants for my study, and this is highlighted in detail under sampling and participants. The following chapter presents the data collected and discusses the findings.

# **CHAPTER 4: PRESENTATION OF DATA AND DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS**

## **4.1 INTRODUCTION**

The main aim of Chapter 3 was to outline the methods and research design applied in the study. This chapter focuses on presenting and discussing the findings from the data. The data was collected using interviews and document analysis. This chapter seeks to respond to the critical research questions. The first level of this chapter firstly introduces the lead and local teachers involved in the MIP, followed by the description of their experiences. I then discuss their understanding of the role of the MIP and their feelings toward it. I also present the implementation/occurrences of the MIP and thereafter the nature of relationships during the MIP process. In addition, the influences of the MIP on local and lead teachers' identity are outlined. The second level presents the themes that transpired from the data relating to teacher identity. It is important to assist the reader and recall the critical research questions as these played a significant role in the guidance of structuring and analysing the data.

- What are the experiences of local and lead teachers who work in the Matric Intervention Programme?
- How does being identified as a lead and a local teacher influence teachers' professional identity?

There were five participants involved in this study, three lead teachers (LET 1 John, LET 2 Jane, and LET 3 Joe). All of them are from Jacobs High School. The two local teachers (LOT 1 Nancy and LOT 2 Nadine) are colleagues at Gatsheni Secondary School. I wanted to include at least two subject advisers, but I was unsuccessful as it was their busiest time of the year and they were attending back-to-back meetings. They would have given valuable data as they are part of the MIP. However, I managed to get the English First Additional Language subject adviser to assist me with the documents and report of the MIP.

## **4.2 INTRODUCING THE LEAD AND LOCAL TEACHERS**

The study participants are three lead teachers and two local teachers. The first lead teacher (LET) is John who is a Mathematics teacher and belongs to the Science department, and he is an acting departmental head. The Mathematics department in Jacobs High School is big

(seven teachers: two women and five men) with a couple of veteran teachers and Mathematics experts. Most of the teachers under his guidance and leadership in the Science department had been teaching for more than ten years and most of them teach either Mathematical Literacy or pure Mathematics. John started teaching in 2001 and has been teaching Maths since then, so he is in his sixteenth year as a Maths teacher. He also taught Arts and Culture in 2002, when he was a novice teacher, but he has great expertise in Mathematics. Furthermore, teaching is both a vocation and a passion for him, and he says that he first wanted to be a teacher when he was in primary school and in Grade 11 the interest was still there. He went to a college of education in Pietermaritzburg for his training. He majored in Mathematics, Electrical Trade Theory, and Technical Drawing. He says that what he enjoys the most about teaching is simplifying concepts, and that is why he is a Maths teacher.

Jane is a Life Sciences (previously known as Biology) teacher who has been teaching for 26 years. She has also taught English and Physical Sciences, which she has been teaching for 20 years. She trained at the Indumiso College of Education in Pietermaritzburg and majored in Applied Science and Nutrition. Teaching was not her dream career, but she believes that it was a calling because she had a scholarship to study Social Sciences and she turned it down to pursue a career in teaching. She enjoys teaching, especially when her learners are working hard and are successful. It fulfils her seeing the learners having a bright future. She thinks she is the best teacher in both her school and in her circuit because she has a dynamic and accommodative personality that makes people (particularly the learners) around her free and comfortable.

Joe belongs to the Commerce department at the school and currently teaches Business Studies. He has been teaching for nine years, and the subjects he has taught include Economics and Management Sciences and Economics. He believes teaching chose him and not the other way around: He had wanted to be a teacher when he was young but then he did a degree in Office Management, but later on realised that he was lost, and that is when he studied teaching. Unlike his colleagues, he had a degree prior to his teaching career. He enrolled at the University of South Africa (UNISA) for his Post Graduate Certificate in Education (PGCE) and majored in Business Studies and Economics and Management Sciences. He enjoys teaching, and even though Business Studies is mostly theoretical, it is easier to teach as learners can easily relate to it. Joe is a very confident individual who believes in his abilities and says that he is the best teacher in his school because he takes his

work seriously; he is always professional and always tries his best to be ethical by putting the learners' and the Department's interests first. This teacher obviously loves teaching, and when asked to explain what makes him a good teacher, he said the following:

Well, I think it's the passion that I have for teaching, the love that I have for learners and my passion for touching and changing lives of the young people. I am also committed, dedicated to my work, and I think that's what makes me outstanding.

His attempt to do this involves a lot of sacrifice. Joe starts teaching at 6:30 (morning classes) and finishes at 16:00. He is also a passionate TLO in the school. The role of the TLO is to liaise with the learners with or about school related matters like discipline or addressing matters like absenteeism through the Representative Council of Learners who then communicate with their respective classmates.

There were two local teachers (LOT) involved in this study and both were woman and taught at the same school. Nancy belongs to the Science department. She was teaching Mathematical Literacy and Physical Sciences and has taught Physical Sciences for four years. Teaching was not a calling for her and she says that teaching chose her. She said that she was forced by circumstances to become a teacher. She had a degree in Chemical Engineering. She enrolled at UNISA for her PGCE and her majors were Physical Sciences and Mathematical Literacy. She enjoyed teaching Physics Sciences more than Mathematical Literacy because she believed the Physical Sciences learners are hard workers. In addition, the fact that she started in the field of Science (Chemical Engineering) makes her more comfortable teaching Physics. This teacher is clearly passionate about teaching and explains why she thinks of herself as a good teacher:

I think that hard work and loving what I do. Even though I didn't choose to be a teacher, I do enjoy what I do. I have accepted that maybe teaching is a good career for me. It makes me proud and feels good when learners pass, and it makes me feel good to be making a difference.

Her attempt to draw her motivation from the experienced teachers has been the driving force in her career. Learning from other teachers keeps her motivated and always striving to be the best.

Lastly, Nadine was a very humble, down-to-earth, and passionate teacher who worked in the Commerce department. She was teaching Accounting and Economics. Very different from the three lead teachers and Nancy, she chose teaching because of her eagerness to help

people, particularly because in her sapling days as a learner Accounting was difficult and challenging, even for her. She obtained her teaching qualifications from Gamalakhe College of Education and majored in Accounting and Economics. This teacher enjoyed teaching Accounting simply because learners can relate to it as it is about selling and buying and keeping records for a business. Over and above, she enjoyed explaining about figures and making learners understand. She thought she was the best teacher because she had the ability to prepare a lesson before going to class.

The discussion of the first critical research question gives details on the local and lead teachers' experiences of working in a T75 school.

### **4.3 THE EXPERIENCE OF WORKING IN A T75 SCHOOL**

This section outlines the experiences of the lead and local teachers in their respective schools, the relationships between the local and lead teachers in a subject and their attitude towards the MIP and working in a T75 school. Initially there were supposed to be three lead teachers and three local teachers with all the participants being paired. As explained in Chapter 3, the third lead teacher withdrew from the study. There would have been a Mathematics pair (one lead and one local teacher working together), the Business Studies pair and Life Sciences pair. Unfortunately, the pairing of lead and local teachers was not effective since they were not working together. The three lead teachers involved in the study were not working with the local teachers participating in this study, but with other local teachers who were not participants in this study. I would have preferred to group the teachers according to the subjects they teach and the department they belong to in a school. Since this was impossible, I will begin by looking at the experiences of the two local teachers first.

#### **4.3.1 Local Teachers**

There is a great distinction between the local and lead teachers' experiences. O'Connor (2006) claims that educators' work is emotionally engaging and personally demanding, yet the caring nature of the teaching role is largely neglected in educational policy and teacher standards. In this regard, Nancy says the following when asked about the experience of working in a T75 school:

It's stressful to work in an underperforming school, especially when the DBE officials visit the school. All they do is criticising the teachers; they never understand what the problem is. The learners that we have are learners who have been repeating

grades and most teachers are discouraged and not positive about the programme [MIP].

Despite being under intense scrutiny and working under unbelievable pressure from the DBE, Nancy was certain that the reason for underperformance in her school was the huge number of progressed learners, that is learners who even though they had failed a grade dismally are moved to the next grade because they are old and have spent two or three years in the grade. In this regard, she does not see herself as contributing to the learners' poor performance. However, this teacher is passionate about teaching, despite the challenges she faces as a local teacher. She is greatly motivated by the fact that some learners do pass, even if only 10 out of 40 learners pass in a class, and make it to tertiary level. However, she is also demotivated by the kind of learners she usually has in her class: Learners who do not submit their work or tasks on time. She further mentions that absenteeism is another factor that leads to her demotivation. Her school receives external support from the DBE, they receive revision documents compiled by the Department, and all teachers attend workshops to equip themselves. The learners also get external help via the MIP where they visit a school allocated for them where they meet the lead teachers who will teach them.

The second local teacher is Nadine. As explained earlier, she belongs to Commerce department, and she teaches Accounting and Economics as well as Economic and Management Sciences. When Nadine explains her experience of working in a T75 school, she mentions that sometimes she goes to the school to assist (assisting the lead teacher during the school holidays and during the MIP) and at times sit at home and enjoys the holidays.

As teacher, there is nothing more disappointing to me than seeing learners fail to make progress. Nadine mentions that the pass rate percentage in her school (matric results) drops every year and claims that all the hard-working teachers in her school are worried about this. The matric pass rate in the past two years was 52% in 2015 and below 70% in 2014. She maintains that the main reason for the drop is the progressed learners. This teacher is greatly demotivated by the underperformance of her school and says that she feels like a failure. She also points out that the lack of support from the parents is another contributing factor for the poor performance by the school. Nevertheless, teaching is her vocation and she wants to teach and improve the lives of black children, particularly those in rural areas, and this keeps her in the profession and motivates her to stay and teach in the T75 School. Over and above this, the will power she has is enforced by those few learners who know what they want (supposedly those who work hard and pass). She mentions that the DBE supports the school,

and that this year they attended workshops focusing on Accounting and Economics and Management Sciences where they were shown how to start a term's work and teachers could share teaching methods among themselves.

#### **4.3.2 Lead Teachers**

As mentioned earlier in the study, three lead teachers, John, Jane, and Joe, are all educators at Jacobs High School. They all have had different experiences with the MIP and they teach different subjects. The first lead teacher is John who has taught in a number of schools and his experiences of teaching new learners has been positive. Like all the lead teachers, he was chosen to be a lead teacher and assist learners from other schools because of his expertise and reputation for producing good results in Mathematics and in his school in Grade 12. As explained in the previous chapter, the MIP would at times run for two weeks or during the school holidays (winter and spring classes) and over the weekends. John started his intervention programme by discussing ground rules with the learners. He says that most learners in these T75 schools lack discipline and they treated lead teachers like unwelcome guests. He says:

I think the culture of the school is mostly affected by the community the school is situated at. You find that the management of the school have the knowledge and the values to take the school to a better level, but you find that there is no support from the parents and then the school lacks discipline. When a school lacks discipline there are fewer chances of good results, so the reason most schools underperform is the lack of discipline. Even if learners aren't good academically but are disciplined, the teachers are able to groom them, so they can pass.

He also says that the DBE assists the lead teachers during the MIP by providing transport to the respective schools as transport could be a problem as some of the schools are in deep rural areas.

The second lead teacher is Joe who is in the Commerce department and teaches Business Studies, Economics as well as Economic and Management Sciences. He has been a lead teacher for more than three years now, working in different schools or centres. Some of the schools he has worked at are not T75; some were T60, schools where the matric pass rate is under 60%. Joe fully supports the MIP and thinks it is working. However, he has faced some challenges during the programme. He mentions the issue of learners being difficult when they see someone (lead teacher) they are not used to, and that they become rude when there is no

local teacher to monitor and help with maintaining order and discipline. Joe further suggests that, “the challenge is how the recipient [the learner] of the program is receiving it. If the recipient does not receive it well or positively then we will not be able to achieve the results we want to achieve”.

However, Joe was able to overcome the challenges because of his experience as a teacher. The teacher-learner relationship is of high significance for the success of the programme but especially for the benefit of the child. In the case of the MIP, the relationship between the educators, that is the lead and local teachers, is also of paramount importance as this rubs off on the learners. At some stage Joe felt unwanted at a school where he went to assist.

The last lead teacher is Jane who teaches Life Sciences and Physical Sciences. She is the most experienced teacher in this study with 26 years teaching experience. She has been a lead teacher for more than eight years, long before the other two teachers were called as lead teachers. With so much experience, her great expertise in Life Sciences, and excellent reputation for producing wonderful results, being appointed to be a lead teacher is inevitable. Generally, different learners react and behave differently to teachers from other schools. How learners behave sometimes depends on the subject and subject content the guest teacher has. Jane says the following about her experience as a lead teacher in a T75 school:

Sometimes you are faced with learners who have serious problems especially concerning the subject content. You then realise that they are hopeless. What I discovered is that patience helps to build a foundation. When we went to the camps [the MIP camps] most of the learners were a clean slate, most of them failed the pre-test getting 6/40, but what made me feel good is that at the end of it they all passed the post-test where some of them even got 100%.

Even though Jane faced challenges in the beginning, she still enjoyed herself as a dedicated teacher who transformed the learners’ results and perhaps their attitude toward the subject. Just like any other teacher, she was worried on the first day, not knowing what to expect and not sure where to start with the learners. However, as passionate as she is about teaching and the profession, she was driven by her positive attitude and that she was there to help the learners. The positivity helped her to get through the obstacles.

It is important to explain to the reader how the matric intervention camps work. The camps are called winter or spring classes, and learners from different T75 schools and various circuits are accommodated at one school. They sleep and eat there for the duration of the

school holidays under the supervision of their respective teachers. Each school sends one teacher with the learners who have to ensure that the learners are safe. Learners are not allowed to leave the camp to go to town or anywhere else. They learn four subjects a day starting at 8:00 in the morning, each subject is allocated two hours per day, the lunch break is 12:00–13:00, and they finish at 17:00. They also attend tutorials from 18:00 to 20:00.

The next section briefly discusses the lead and local teachers' understanding of the MIP process and their feelings toward it.

#### **4.4 UNDERSTANDING OF THE PURPOSE OF THE MIP**

Nadine's understanding of the purpose of the MIP is as follows:

I think they are trying to improve the results for Grade 12, but at the same time it makes other educators inferior because they will be exposed if they don't teach learners accordingly. The purpose is to help local teachers to pick up new methods of teaching.

All five teachers agree that the purpose of the MIP is to improve the Grade 12 results of the identified T75. Joe's opinion about the purpose of the MIP, not necessarily deviating from the others, is the following: "I think it's to improve the pass percentage for the province and also to improve the performance of those schools that are underperforming or to change the lives of the young ones". The idea behind the MIP was to improve the pass rate of the schools that were T75 by creating the winter camps. Different camps were also organised for learners who are high flyers from T75 schools. These camps were monitored by the district officials as well as the subject advisers who were responsible for the running of the camps as resident monitors.

#### **4.5 THE KEY THEMES EMERGING FROM PARTICIPANTS' EXPERIENCES**

##### **4.5.1 The Absence of Policies and Structures**

The English First Additional Language subject adviser mentioned in an informal conversation we had about the MIP that "the first MIP was in 2011; however, the idea of lead teachers, though they were not called lead teachers, dates back to the year 2000 when some teachers joined advisers to facilitate workshops in GET". This perhaps suggested that it was a semi-formal initiative as there are no specific policies for the MIP and the subject advisers were responsible for choosing the lead teachers. All the study participants mentioned that

they were not aware of any policy or structure regarding the MIP except for the circulars that are sent to principals to release the LETs and to the principals of T75 schools who should anticipate assistance. Nancy underlines that they have not received any written documentation regarding the MIP: “Local teachers develop an attitude toward lead teachers. I think maybe it is the way it was introduced: Teachers were not formally addressed about the intervention hence the lack of support for lead teachers and the attitude toward the MIP”.

The general agreement among the LOT participants was that there were no written policies for the implementation of the MIP. On the contrary, the LETs mentioned that there were structures that comprise of supporting learner and teacher documents as well as the programmes underpinning the intervention programme. In one of the responses, Joe says the following: “the resource material that we use, financial support in terms of stipend and transport claims, as well as subject advisers to support and develop us professionally and academically”. LOTs mentioned that without policies, the structures of the MIP are non-existent. When support documents (learner and teacher support material) were provided, there were not enough and an overcrowded class must share. They admitted that because of the lack of policies, the implementation of the MIP is not monitored, and in cases where LETs do not show up, there is no accountability.

#### **4.5.2 The Informality of the MIP Process**

Both Nancy and Nadine stated that the MIP process was casually introduced at their school. In relation to the informal introduction of the MIP, Nancy said, “The way this programme is received is kind of negative with local teachers”. On the other hand, the study revealed that LET participants felt that the MIP was officially introduced. All the LET participants agreed that a meeting was called for all the LETs across different subjects that were covered by the MIP to formally introduce and address all the LETs and principals of poor performing schools. Jane highlighted this: “We received a circular via the principal, inviting all the LETs to the MIP meeting and I was expected to attend, and I did. It was not even training, but we were being addressed on what to cover for that particular subject and teacher support documents were issued out as well”.

Nadine provided a comparison of her experiences in the MIP. She mentioned that her experience of the program when it was implemented was totally different to other LOTs she communicated with from other schools. With regards to her experience as a local teacher and her feelings toward the LET appointment she explained that, “Firstly it came to my mind that

maybe it is because you are not good enough in your subject, but I wasn't scared because I know that when I teach, I give my all". She also acknowledged the informality of the MIP when she described how "the programme to me didn't work because the lead teacher came once so far". To summarise, there was a clamour, especially by the LOTs, for the formalities and proper structures of the MIP where all the teachers could possibly account more so when LETs do not show up for duty. The perception for local teachers was that their learners should definitely pass since lead teachers are brought to assist struggling learners and that if they do not help them (learners), they should account.

#### **4.5.3 The MIP: Is It Successful?**

All the participants agreed that working or being part of the MIP was not easy and the process was not flourishing. There are shortfalls and different experiences, whether one was observing as a lead or local teacher. A comment by Jane about the MIP's success and shortfalls emphasised that the programme has not entirely accomplished its goals. She feels that, "It is working but the problem about it is that for how long is 'lead teaching' going to be there for! It is not a solution". She thinks that a permanent solution is required because without it, lead teaching will go on forever. Jane further added, expressing her feelings about the MIP that, "... it won't help the problems our education system is facing, so it's more of a cover up". Nancy also felt that the MIP is working but also fails at some point. She says the following:

It [MIP] doesn't work because teachers only assist during the winter programme, so they only come for five days, two hours a day, and then again in September for one week, so they don't cover work for the whole year.

I learned during my conversation with the English First Additional Language subject adviser that the lead teachers are sent to T75 schools to assist learners in specific subjects and sections identified by the DBE as frequently failed sections in respective subjects. Furthermore, Nancy also commented on the shortfalls of the MIP, especially regarding the local teachers who are being assisted by the programme. She acknowledged that, "When lead teachers come to assist, local teachers don't attend and that means they don't learn anything. They don't pick up tips for lessons because they are never present".

On the other hand, John was very positive about the programme and believed it was successful and can only improve if there were programmes established to support the

mentality of the learners toward the MIP and the lead teachers. The following excerpt captures his feelings about the MIP:

The whole thinking behind it is good. I think it is working and I support the programme, but the challenge is how the recipients of the programme is receiving it. If the recipient is not responding positively, then we will not be able to achieve the results we want to achieve.

#### **4.6 THE NATURE OF RELATIONSHIPS DURING THE MIP PROCESS**

The scope of the MIP proceedings and the way it was arranged suggested that various activities and experiences existed for both local and lead teachers. These activities and encounters span from favourable encounters to undesirable experiences. The area of interest to me was the kind of relationships that existed between the lead and local teachers. The two local teachers mentioned that they had anticipated a formal meeting with the lead teachers. Nadine agreed that she saw the lead teacher when she came to the school but only made the copies he (lead teacher) requested and left. All the lead teachers in this study were friendly and appreciated the presence of local teachers as this was meant to assist both the learners and the teachers, over and above the performance of the school.

This following section discusses the nature and types of relationships according to the participants in the study. The fact that these are the opinions of only the participants of the study might not be valid; however, it is necessary to mention their views as they are important for the study in terms of sharing their experiences. The terms used to describe these relationships emerged immediately after I understood the nature of these relationships. These were grouped from the more effective to less effective relationships and paired according to the department (Commerce or Science) each teacher belonged to.

Firstly, ‘the instrumental relationship’: The relationship between Joe and the local teacher was beneficial to both the learners and Joe. Joe mentioned that after the pre-test and teaching the learners, the marks of the learners in the post-test had improved. The local and lead teachers both benefited from working cooperatively (team work) with each other; the local teacher provided support with discipline and Joe provided the strategic teaching methods and content knowledge. Jane and her local teacher also fell into this class; they both belonged to the Science department. The relationship between them was smooth and beneficial in the

sense that it allowed for ‘support mechanisms’ to be a significant part of the relationship and the programme going forward.

Secondly, Nancy and her lead teacher had ‘a benevolent relationship’. The supportive and sympathetic relationship experienced by both teachers as well as the learners is in keeping with the notion of a ‘caring’ connection between the teacher and the learner. O’Connor, (2006), maintains that teachers’ encounters of caring are affected both by their desire to sustain positive professional relationships with their learners and by their individual beliefs about their role as a teacher. They both teach in the Physical Sciences department in their respective schools. Nancy also describes how supportive she was of the program and appreciative about the lead teacher’s presence: “It makes me feel happy because at the end of the day it’s about the learners, and they must get good results and go to university”. It was clear that she was partly in favour of the programme but I also noticed a dislike for some parts of the MIP. The nature of the relationship allowed her to be more relaxed, remain hopeful, and did not compromise her confidence. She says, “I won’t think less of myself as a teacher”. My observation of this relationship suggested and proved that she embraced the lead teacher’s support and presence and that a lot of sharing occurred.

The nature of the relationship between John and his local teacher, who are both in the Science department and specialising in Mathematics, could be well described as a ‘quintessential’ relationship. According to the Pocket Oxford Dictionary (1994), ‘quintessential’ represents the most perfect or typical example of a quality or class. John is the acting Head of Department in the Science department and has been teaching for 17 years. He is a perfect example of a mentor and a lead teacher. This is evident in the following excerpt when he says:

It is always my strategy to make sure that I don’t give an impression that their teacher is inferior to me, but I address the learners in such a way that they understand that this is a Departmental process, because learners start developing ideas that maybe their teacher needs help and they might lose confidence in their teacher. So as result I make sure that whether a teacher is there or not, when I first address learners I tell them that they have a good teacher, even if I do not know the teaching strategies of that teacher.

In trying to describe the nature of the relationship, he said, “I always encourage resident teachers [local teachers] to be part of the class, so that even if he/she is a good or experienced teacher but they might pick up some teaching strategies”. The data in this quintessential

relationship suggest that the relationship was beneficial and that it worked with what the local teacher had to offer.

A discussion of the second critical research question gives details on the teachers' perceptions of their identity during the MIP process.

## **4.7 THE TEACHERS' PERCEPTIONS OF THEIR IDENTITY DURING THE MIP PROCESS**

### **4.7.1 The Teacher as a Pedagogical Specialist**

The word pedagogy refers to the method and practice of teaching, especially as an academic subject or theoretical concept. Both the local and lead teachers had a variety of experiences during the MIP, and as anticipated, different challenges were encountered in the different schools and subjects, respectively. John mentioned that "When I teach I make sure that I try by all means to be at the level of the learner and I am good in probing questions, questions that will be able to assist them [learners] to understand concepts". Pedagogical characteristics like knowing the learners' private and personal problems and what is on their minds, and the way teachers communicate with their learners are significant and crucial to teachers' personal and professional role. Beijaard, Verloop, and Vermunt (1999) state that the teachers' perceptions of their own professional identity affect their efficacy and professional development as well as their ability and willingness to cope with educational change and to implement innovations in their own teaching practice. In trying to cope with change in the educational system, John uses different teaching methods and explained that, "I don't tell learners what to do in my method of teaching, but instead I ask them because I believe that they know, it's just that they need someone to guide them".

Jane proved that she possesses the pedagogical aspects anticipated from a pedagogical specialist when she said: "I have a dynamic and accommodative personality, making people around me comfortable/free when they are with me rather than being tense. I have a serious look but the friendly environment that I create makes the learners comfortable". To a great extent, this attitude and pedagogical characteristic appears to benefit both the learner and the teacher (Jane). In line with the pedagogical characteristics of a teacher, Joe highlighted that, "the love I have for learners and passion for teaching ..." as relevant to teachers' personal and professional role. Beijaard et al. (1999), mention that educators should be conscious of a number of norms and values involved in their interactions and relationships with learners.

Furthermore, it was evident that Nancy is a loving and caring teacher who also possesses some pedagogical characteristics. She said that she “feels good when learners pass” and further emphasised the significance of “making a difference” in the lives of the learners, their families, and the community. The teacher and learner relationship is essential to both the learner’s success and to the teacher’s personal and professional role. In support of this view, Sachs (2001) mentions that teachers’ professional identities are rich and complex because they are constructed in a fruitful and complicated set of relations of practice. Nadine mentioned that she “never want to be the cause of failure for learners’ future”.

#### **4.7.2 The Teacher as a Subject Matter Specialist**

There is a general consensus that teachers need a deep understanding of the subject/learning area they are offering or teaching. All the participants in this study are qualified teachers who were professionally trained for the profession. The experience varies with age. The longest serving participant is Jane with 26 years of teaching experience and 20 years teaching Life Sciences. All the participants went to colleges of education except for Nancy and Joe who both went to UNISA for a PGCE with six and nine years of teaching experience, respectively. Apart from the teaching experience acquired during their training as teachers and the number of years they have taught, Nadine mentioned that “they do workshops for us”: This is in line with keeping the teachers updated with latest changes in the education system by the DBE. These workshops are facilitated by subject advisers who, I discovered upon my investigation, usually visit schools that underperform. The data also proves that teachers are further equipped in their respective subjects by subject advisers. Joe highlighted that they get support from “subject advisers [who] develop us professionally and academically”. Their great expertise and subject matter knowledge is highlighted in the following excerpt by the Jane:

When we went to camps, most learners were clean slate. Most of them failed the pre-test getting 6/40 and 2/40, but what made me feel good is that at the end of it they all passed the post-test where some of them even got 100%. That alone proved to me that those learners have a potential. It’s just that they need dedicated teachers, teachers that will honour the teaching time. The learners showed improvement from 6% to 70%.

The change in the learner’s marks from poor (6%) to very good (70%) also shows that Jane is a supportive teacher who overlooks the learners’ geographical background and the school’s

performance. The data also proves that she is a caring teacher. Despite the learners' pre-test results, she never gave up on them.

#### **4.8 CONCLUSION**

It was established from the data that all the teachers' involved in the programme understood the purpose behind the MIP. While most of the teachers in this study saw the need for this programme to be properly implemented, only lead teachers were formally informed about the programme and the need for policy and structures. Local teachers were informed by their respective principals. All the teachers in the study except for Nadine agreed that the MIP is indeed significant, and it is beneficial to both the teachers and especially the learners. To what extent did the MIP benefit the learners and the teachers? The data highlighted that it was beneficial to some of the learners as they improved their results during the pre- and post-tests. All the lead teachers involved in the study agreed that the MIP was formally introduced as they attended a meeting informing them about the implementation of the MIP. However, Nancy and Nadine said that there was no orientation or meeting for the local teachers to inform them of what support they had to provide, hence they thought it was informally introduced. On the basis of their current status as lead teachers and their experience in the MIP, all the LETs acknowledge the need for more structures and policies, and the importance of extending the programme instead of making it a three week process. These findings are not only helpful for comprehending their positions, either as lead or local teachers, and assisting them to reflect on themselves as LOTs and LETs; it is also helpful to them as teachers, their identities, and them as pioneers transforming learners' results and progress.

# CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

## 5.1 INTRODUCTION

The aim of this section is to give a brief synopsis of the findings of my research. Firstly, I provide brief discussion of lead and local teachers' understanding of the role of the MIP and then the exploration of the way the MIP was carried out. I then outline the influence of being a local or lead teacher on professional identity followed by my recommendations for more research are presented. Lastly I contemplate on the journey of this dissertation.

The objective of my study was to explore the influences of the MIP on the professional identity of local and lead teachers. Consequently, the aim was to understand the challenges that both local and lead teachers encountered during the MIP process, the relationships between the teachers, and how they see themselves after and during the MIP. The questions below guided my research:

1. What are the experiences of local and lead teachers who work in the Matric Intervention Programme?
2. How does being identified as a lead and a local teacher influence teachers' professional identity?

The participants in my study were five teachers, three lead teachers and two local teachers. The data collection methods used was interviews and document analysis. I was unable to use various techniques, for example, observation, to gather information as a qualitative researcher would. Observation would have been ideal for my study as it would have allowed me to watch the behavioural patterns of the lead and local teachers during the MIP (Johnson & Christensen, 2012). This technique could have strengthened the trustworthiness of the interview data from the local and lead teachers. However, I managed to use two techniques and consequently took advantage of the strengths of using different data collection instruments.

A discussion document from the KZN DBE under the *Curriculum Management and Delivery* section had in place a plan to improve the provincial performance in National Senior Certificate examination from 2013. Winter schools and learner camps were initiated in May 2013. The findings show that in 2012, 127 000 candidates wrote the National Senior Certificate examination and 93 003 candidates successfully completed and obtained the

National Senior Certificate qualification. In 2012, out of the 12 districts in KZN, the top 4 were Umlazi with 79.9%, Amajuba with 77.7%, Pinetown with 77.4% and Umgungundlovu with 74.4%. Umlazi and Pinetown had 18 554 and 15 556 candidates, respectively, who wrote the National Senior Certificate examination in 2012, which were the highest totals in the district.

## **5.2 SUMMARY OF FINDINGS**

### **5.2.1 The Role of the MIP**

The research showed that all the participants understood the role of the MIP and its concepts. There was a general understanding of what the MIP entails, that is that it aims to assist learners in their respective schools to pass matric with the aid of the lead and local teachers. The participants emphasised the impracticality and the appropriateness of the MIP, which are crucial elements. All the participants indicated that the programme was welcomed and supported by the five teachers (local and lead teachers). However, Nadine was not entirely pleased about how it was carried out, particularly the learners' attitudes after the programme. She mentioned that the learners seemed to be more confused by being taught by a new teacher. All the lead teachers were cognisant of their duties and carried it out as mandated by the DoE. Over and above, they knew that their task was to improve the pass rate of the identified T75 schools. They each taught one two-hour period a day.

As previously mentioned, some learners showed improvement in the pre- and post-test assessments. Even though they supported the MIP, the local teachers were not as enthusiastic about the programme as lead teachers. All lead teachers received a stipend for partaking in the programme, while local teachers, whether they participated or not, did not receive any payment. However, they knew that their role in the MIP was to give all the support they can to the lead teachers, and they were also aware that the initiative was meant to help improve the Grade 12 pass rate. The research revealed that there is a need for the MIP to be better structured and for all the stakeholders involved to be alerted when it commences, particularly the local teachers as this contribute positively in the outcome of Grade 12 results as well as improving the local teachers' attitude towards the programme.

### **5.2.2 The MIP in the Case Study Setting**

As mentioned in Chapter 3, the local and lead teachers were the main focus of the study but the setting was a school as a centre. A school as a centre refers to a school that accommodates learners from different T75 schools during the MIP. Teaching and learning takes place in this school and lead teachers for different subjects come to this one school. It is identified as a centre because it is central to other schools. Transport to and from as well as foods are provided for these learners. A stand-alone centre only accommodates learners of that particular school. It is a stand-alone centre because it is very far from other schools. There is no transport allocated for stand-alone centres, but they do get food. A camp is a venue or a school where learners are accommodated for the duration of the programme with meals and rooms provided.

The findings revealed that there were no policies to support and guide the MIP process in the centres, camps, and schools. It was however mentioned that there was a meeting/workshop for the lead teachers that the principals of the T75 schools and the top achieving schools attended. The two local teachers in the study were aware of the meeting, but they were both concerned that the local teachers were generally not invited to the meeting or even called to a separate meeting to update them about the MIP proceedings. Furthermore, their principal did not tell them that they should be available when the lead teachers visit the school.

The lead teachers did visit Gatsheni High School, and teaching and learning happened. Nadine was there to support the lead teacher despite the lack of policies and formal structures of the MIP. It was confirmed that the principal was not there during the commencement of the MIP as was anticipated. It was also acknowledged that the local teachers were informally informed about the MIP. The significance of informing the local teachers informally about the MIP was neither an issue nor a problem; however, what was important was the attitude of the local teachers toward the lead teachers as the result of not being formally informed about the purpose of the MIP. This affected the relationships between the local and lead teachers as well as the lead teacher and the learners.

## **5.3 THE EXPERIENCE OF LOCAL AND LEAD TEACHERS IN A T75 SCHOOL.**

The research indicated that there was a distinction between the experience of lead and local teachers. The lead teachers got a stipend for partaking in the MIP, and this could have been a motivation for all the lead teachers who were part of the programme, including those who

were not part of the study. It could have also easily been a demotivation for the local teachers, knowing that the lead teachers were getting paid for teaching during the MIP while they were not getting anything for assisting the lead teachers and supporting the programme. Additionally, the two local teachers were aware that the MIP was for a good cause, they appeared to be supportive of the programme, and understood that the lead teachers were there to assist their learners; however, they felt that the programme's timeframe was insufficient considering that it was introduced and implemented during June and September holidays.

Upon closer assessment of their reaction toward the MIP, it was evident that Nadine was not only dissatisfied by the fact that she was working in a T75 school and has been appointed a lead teacher to assist her; she was annoyed because she felt that the lead teacher was confusing her learners. She mentioned that the MIP made her learners worse: They were struggling academically already and she felt that she could have managed without the assistance of the MIP. This is in line with core regulation, where teacher dispositions is regarded as crucial, including how teachers think and feel about what they do, their feelings, their attitude etc. In this regard, Nadine feels like her feelings as a local teacher were not taken into consideration by the Department during the MIP process. Nadine also pointed out the issue of promotional requirements for the learners from one grade to the other as one of the factors that contribute to a high failure rate, which eventually leads to the school being identified as a T75 school. This point to the issue of external regulation where the work of the teacher is regulated by the state. In this instance, Nadine feels like she does not have control over her work as a teacher because the state's promotional requirements stipulate that a learner should be progressed to the next grade because of age, even if they have failed.,

In addition, Nadine mentioned that these officials do not look at the contextual factors of the school as the cause of poor results, instead they interrogate the teachers and look at files and lesson preparations; turnaround strategies of the school that could assist struggling learners and another one for the potential high flyers (top achievers) if there is any, these are improvement plans. She finds this stressful as it suggests that the teachers are not skilled or competent enough to produce good, quality results. This undermines her identity as a competent teacher who believes that she could manage well enough without the MIP. The Department officials are external monitors, while a principal is regarded as an internal monitor, of what goes on in the schools, checking the teachers' readiness to deliver the curriculum and the extent to which a teacher prepares for a lesson. This is one of their duties.

Nancy, on the other hand, seemed patient and supported the MIP. She seemed to be more understanding and a bit excited that an initiative such as the MIP has been put in place to try to improve the matric pass rate. Thus, she responded to the external regulation of the MIP in a more positive way than Nadine and did not see the presence of the lead teacher as a loss of her autonomy as a teacher. She wanted the learners to have as much help as possible, and she was open to let anybody teach her learners, particularly if it would improve their results. This suggests that she saw this initiative as a means of increasing management control in line with the external regulation and indicated that her experience and reception of the MIP was different to Nadine's.

However, she did experience the way in which the DoE officials monitored the teacher files as harsh. They crush the teachers if they discover problems like an incomplete file monitoring system of the school. These don't allow the teachers to feel independent and free in the workplace. Moreover, the nature of the external regulation makes the teachers feel they are incompetent. On the other hand, the lack of support from the school management team, and the principal and the Head of Department being absent during the MIP indicated that the school lacked the structure that supported the MIP processes. As a concerned teacher she pointed out that one of the reasons for local teachers not giving enough support to the lead teachers was because the programme was not clearly introduced to them as local teachers. It seems that the lead teachers were treated more professionally by the DoE as the programme's purpose was clearly explained to them, but the local teacher were not afforded the same treatment. It is therefore evident from Nancy's comments that even if the programme was successful in different schools, the local teachers were not fully supporting and embracing it. In addition, the MIP might have been a success in some schools and maybe not in Gatsheni High School; however, it had gaps that should be filled.

Nancy and Nadine both experience the same kind of difficulties with the learners at Gatsheni High School, who are ill-disciplined and struggling to cope with the volume of work in Grade 12, hence unsatisfactory results.

The lead teachers, despite the challenges they each encountered in their respective centres, appeared to be more positive about the programme and almost all of them believed it was working. They were all confident in their teaching methods and expertise. Upon careful examination of their responses after the interviews and transcription, it was evident that these lead teachers were optimistic and had the characteristics of capable lead teachers. They were

lead teachers at different schools or centres, had different experiences, and encountered a variety of challenges.

Firstly, John complained about the lack of support from the parents and members of the community of the school where he was a lead teacher. School governing bodies play a significant role in a school when it comes to the running of the school and to assisting in informing the community (parents) about the contextual factors of the school and other related matters that could hinder the success of the school. Even though John did not struggle with the learners as a lead teacher, he did mention that most learners are ill-disciplined in the MIP camps and centres and that this subsequently affects the results of the Grade 12.

Secondly, Joe expressed disappointment at the level of rudeness and disrespect by the learners and claims that this is how learners react to a new teacher in these camps/centres. Apart from this minor ordeal, Joe was not shaken by the minority of ill-disciplined learners.

Jane pointed out that the biggest challenge she encountered as a lead teacher was that of learners lacking subject content. She believed that this could have been the result of a teacher who is not knowledgeable in the subject because some learners did well in their post-test after failing dismally in the pre-test. Dedication, commitment, and passion inspired and motivated her to help the learners regardless of their knowledge or lack thereof.

### **5.3.1 What Do These Disparate Experiences Exhibit?**

#### *5.3.1.1 Negative Elements of the MIP*

The experiences of all five participants were definitely unsatisfactory in various ways. None of the lead teachers had the local teachers' support and backing in terms of them being available during the lesson to help and assist with discipline when learners were rude and disruptive. The three lead teachers were all determined to help the learners improve their marks and empower them in a way, considering the pass rate of the school they taught in. These were not bad learners, but they were a bit demotivated by their results. However, not all learners were mean to the lead teachers; some were focused and had the willingness and drive to learn. It was noticeable that these lead teachers took the MIP seriously as part of an intervention for the matric learners and also as a learning experience for themselves as teachers.

Nadine was not entirely pleased with the programme. She did not have a problem with the lead teacher who came to assist her but the way the programme was introduced was not taken

well. As a result, she did not stay as long at her school as she was supposed to when the lead teacher was teaching. Nancy was determined that the programme should help the learners succeed as was intended. She liked the idea of the MIP but was not happy about how it was introduced. Upon careful reflection of the local teachers' experiences, it was evident that both local teachers were not pleased about the implementation of the MIP, particularly because they were not invited to the introductory meeting.

The development of a good relationship between the lead and local teacher is significant for the success of the programme and helpful to the learner. The experience and relationship between Nadine and her lead teacher was unsatisfactory. One of the reasons was that Nadine was not notified in time about the commencement of the MIP and the visit of the lead teacher. It can be assumed that this could also have been the case in other camps with other local and lead teachers. The local teachers would definitely prefer to also be formally informed by the DoE like the lead teachers. It must be acknowledged that not informing all the parties involved, learners and local and lead teachers, in the programme hinders the success and objective of the MIP.

Nancy acknowledged that she was not approached by the principal to inform her about the MIP and the visit of the lead teacher and felt undermined by the principal. The data suggested that being a local teacher and working in a T75 school overwhelmed by lack of transparency did pose a challenge and raised the issue of lack of leadership skills on the part of the principal. Are principals or local teachers responsible for collecting information from the DoE? Should the DoE be blamed for not cascading information to the local teachers accordingly? How do local teachers deal with these viewpoints? I argue that lack of communication and inappropriate leadership did have a negative influence on how the MIP was received, particularly by the local teachers.

Furthermore, what became clear in this study on the MIP is that this process is facilitated and conducted by other educators (lead teachers) and monitored by the subject advisers. These lead teachers took the initiative and worked during this process beyond the scope of the MIP and engaged with learners outside the prescribed time. According Tsui (2007), engaging with learners in practice is a powerful tool in that it involves teachers investing themselves in what they do as well as in their relations with other stakeholders (learners, parents, the community, and teachers). Consequently, it is very necessary to encourage teachers to be innovative leaders with good leadership skills. The MIP has some effect on team teaching and networking between teachers (local and lead teachers) and schools, and this may impact on

the school in the long run and have an effect on the performance of a school. Even though Gatsheni High School is still categorised as a T75 school, there was a slight improvement in their results after the MIP in 2017 as they moved to 68% matric pass rate from 55% in 2016. These numbers were confirmed during the orientation workshop by the English First Additional Language subject adviser.

Furthermore, none of the teachers involved in this study indicated that they had a meeting with the principal about the MIP processes to welcome to or inform them about the programme. The lead teachers did not meet or see the principal during the MIP. On the other hand, local teachers were not informed nor introduced to the lead teachers or vice versa. In fact, Nadine was the only local teacher who briefly met the lead teacher! In addition, it is through the MIP and engaging in practice that the lead teachers in particular find out how they can participate in activities like the compilation of the MIP documents, and the competence that is required during this process. Some of the lead teachers that were part of the MIP, eventually were part of the groups that compiled the MIP documents including learner revision booklets. In this regard, the local teachers' participation and support of the MIP is of significant importance.

#### *5.3.1.2 Positive Elements of the MIP*

The study revealed that the MIP was started as an intervention to assist struggling learners in their respective schools and camps and to improve the matric pass rate. Ideally, teachers are supposed to be networking, collaborating, and working in teams to benefit the learners. Creating a good environment that enables effective teaching and learning is one of the factors that enabled the lead teachers to be confident during the MIP process. There are many teachers involved in this programme and the rewards for the lead teachers in teaching during the MIP were derived from their core regulation, which is their commitment to their work, the values they hold about the profession. However, I established that the lead teachers are open to work together with the local teachers.

### **5.4 THE INFLUENCE OF BEING PICKED AS A LEAD AND LOCAL TEACHER ON PROFESSIONAL IDENTITY**

Using Hoadley's (2002) framework for the regulation of teacher work identity, the MIP represents the external regulation of both the lead and local teachers' work. Particularly the local teachers felt that they had little control over their participation in the MIP. Since the

local teachers were not invited to participate in the programme and were not clearly informed about it, they did not participate. All the lead teachers, to a certain extent, enjoy and feel privileged to be picked to be the drivers and facilitators of the MIP. The monetary incentive (the stipend they get for working during the holidays), the passion they possess for teaching, and seeing learners do well are the driving force behind the success of the MIP. They are not given room to exercise their discretion should they feel that the allocated time for the MIP is insufficient, and thus the learners who could have benefited from more teaching are disadvantaged. This point to the external regulation of teachers' work, where LETs lose control over their work in the sense that they are expected to comply with the implementation of the MIP. Both the LOTs and the LETs have a similar core regulation in that both are committed to helping the learners succeed. Thus, to LETs, participating in the MIP is not losing control but taking necessary orders and carrying out the task at hand that is teaching the learners who are part of the MIP.

However, it is different for the LOTs. Having someone else assisting their respective learners is an indication that they are overlooked. Therefore, losing control over their work by having a LET come in to teach means that the learners may see them as incapable. They do not perceive it as team work, particularly because they feel that the MIP was imposed on them. This is external regulation, and the LOTs felt that they lost their autonomy and began to doubt their craft knowledge and skills.

Although the aforementioned arguments emphasises the tensions brought about by the loss of autonomy through external regulation by the DBE, there is the counter-argument that the DBE takes control over teachers work in T75 schools because they do not take full control over their responsibilities as lifelong learners. Jane highlights that some teachers in poor performing schools are unqualified and this can lead to teachers not completing the syllabus. She says that teachers in under performing schools should take responsibility for their own professional development. However, the local teachers highlighted that one of the major concerns and contributing factors to the poor results in the T75 schools is the lack of support from the communities where these schools are located. This point to internal regulation, which is the support provided by the school organisation and by the community (parents and governing body) in which these schools are located.

## **5.5 RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **5.5.1 Recommendations for Future Research**

This study focused on the influence of the MIP on the professional identity of local and lead teachers and on the teachers' experiences of participating in the programme. Nevertheless, more research on the MIP and its lead and local teachers could be conducted in KZN, South Africa. Hereunder are some suggestions for further research:

- An extensive case study of all the local and lead teachers, principals, and subject advisers that are part of the MIP could be conducted. Moreover, the research could include more schools that are identified as T75 schools. This would give perceptions of other lead and local teachers and comparisons could be made between teachers and schools.
- Are there provincial policies about the MIP in the KZN schools? Conducting a document analysis on the MIP policies and on the revision packs given to the learners during the MIP would be useful.
- No observation took place in my study; thus, it could be productive to observe the teaching and learning practices during the MIP in more than one school.

### **5.5.2 Recommendations for Implementation of the MIP**

The teachers (lead and local teachers) in this study all taught in rural areas, most of them in schools that are under resourced, overcrowded, and understaffed. These teachers worked in disadvantaged communities and under difficult contextual factors; however, despite the drawbacks, the lead teachers worked with dedication and commitment to try and help black children in impoverished communities. Some local teachers continued to support the MIP and its processes despite the feeling of being belittled by the programme by not being informed timeously and formally like lead teachers. Consequently, there is a need for the facilitators, initiators of the MIP, and the DoE to properly address and inform the local teachers about their role and responsibility in and during the programme at the level of practice. Moreover, there is a need for the policies of the MIP to be formally addressed and structured. If the policies are formalised and structures are properly set, there is a bigger chance that the MIP will be successful and that all the stakeholders or participants, particularly the local teachers, will be more supportive of the processes of the MIP. These policies could be addressed through workshops or meetings of the MIP.

These workshops or meetings, which previously focused on lead teachers, need to strengthen the local teachers' understanding of the MIP. The MIP is not entirely about which schools perform better and which teachers are not producing good results. These meetings or workshops should focus on developing local teachers through the assistance of and working together with lead teachers. The local teacher can learn different teaching methods from the lead teacher and they can work as a team without considering the issue of the stipend.

MacGregor (2009 as cited in Connelly & Clandinin, 1999, p. 2) claims that the influences that shape teachers' professional identity have been theoretically described as part of a changing landscape. There is a strong need for the DoE and schools to encourage both lead and local teachers to attend the workshops and meetings of the MIP, as this programme is a temporary project for that particular year aimed at assisting struggling learners, schools and teachers.

## **5.6 REFLECTIONS ON THE THESIS PILGRIMAGE**

When embarking on a research project there will always be challenges and that creates a different experience for different people. Anything that involves human beings, such as a course with participants, is bound to include some inconvenience or hardship. I started this journey with great enthusiasm but it was without doubt taxing and a bit frustrating at times. Conducting research has its advantages and disadvantages. I felt like giving up a few times during this expedition; I have felt like a failure and struggled with most concepts and elements of the processes of research. The excitement of pulling through and making it past the obstacles taught me a lot about life and its ups and downs.

This research also affected the local and lead teachers as all of them have learned more about matters concerning the MIP. And as a result of our informal conversation about this research, the English First Additional Language subject adviser is aware of the challenges encountered during the programme.

## **5.7 CONCLUSION**

Lead teachers believe that they contribute positively to schools they assist. The local teachers should be as influential during the MIP. The study suggested that all the stakeholders (local and lead teachers, principals, and the DoE) of the MIP be involved or informed about meetings and arranged workshops about the MIP. It was also indicated that lead teachers require all the support they can get from local teachers, as much as they (local teachers) need

the support from them and the DoE. The external regulation and consistent monitoring of the MIP by the DoE officials will ensure that the MIP is functioning effectively, and this will assist the lead and local teachers by ensuring that they work together. To achieve the objective of the programme, local teachers must be recognised as teachers and informed of any developments set out by the DoE or the school so they will not perceive themselves as inferior to lead teachers. I suggest that the DoE together with the MIP initiators develop and devise strategies that will not offend or insult anyone involved or affected by the MIP. Lastly, the influences of the MIP on the professional identity of local and lead teachers revealed that the MIP processes helped to further develop lead teachers more than local teachers.

## REFERENCES

- Anne, K., Kaarina, M., & Satu, U. (2014). The birth and development of Vocational Education Teachers' (VET) professional identity. *International Journal of Research Studies in Education*, 3(5), 85–101.
- Beauchamp, C. & Thomas, L. (2009). Understanding teacher identity: An overview of issues in the literature and implications for teacher education. *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 39(2), 175–189.
- Beijaard, D., Verloop, M., & Vermunt, J. D. (1999). Teachers' perceptions of professional identity: An exploratory study from a personal knowledge perspective. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 16(20), 749–764.
- Beijaard, D., Meijer, P. C., & Verloop, N. (2004). Reconsidering research on teachers' professional identity. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 20, 107–128.
- Bell, J. (1995). *Teachers Talk about Teaching: Coping with Change in Turbulent Times*. USA: Open University Press.
- Bertram, C., & Christiansen, I. (2014). *Understanding research: An introduction to reading research*. Van Schaik Publishers: Pretoria.
- Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative Research Journal*, 9(2), 27–40.
- Chandra, D. V. (2012). A critical review of “our work”: Re-thinking teachers’ professional identity-issues and challenges. *The Online Journal of New Horizons in Education*, 4(3), 33–40.
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2007). *Research Methods in Education* (6<sup>th</sup> ed.) USA: Routledge.
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2011). *Research Methods in Education*. USA: Routledge.
- Connelly, F. M., & Clandinin, D. J. (1999). *Shaping a Professional Identity: Stories of Educational Practice*. New York: Teachers College Press.

- Day, C., & Gu, Q. (2007). Variations in the conditions for teachers' professional learning and development: Sustaining commitment and effectiveness over a career. *Oxford Review of Education*, 33(4), 423–443.
- Day, C. & Gu, Q. (2010). *The New Lives of Teachers*. USA: Routledge.
- Day, C., Elliot, B., & Kington, A. (2005). Reform, standards and teacher identity: Challenges of sustaining commitment. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 21, 563–577.
- Day, C. (2003). School reform and transitions in professionalism and identity. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 37(8), 677-692.
- Gee, J. P. (2001). Identity as an analytic lens for research in education. *American Educational Research Association*, 25, 99–125.
- Gomm, R., Hammersley, M., & Foster, P. (2000). *Case Study Method*. Britain: SAGE.
- Harrison, C., & Killion, J. (2007). The challenges of teacher leaders. *Teachers as Leaders*. 65(1), 74–77.
- Hoadley, U. (2002). The regulation of teacher work identity: Core considerations. *Journal of Education*, 28, 39–62.
- Hooley, N. (2007). Establishing professional identity: Narrative as curriculum for pre-service teacher education. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 32(1), 48–60.
- Hong, J. Y. (2010). Pre-service and beginning teacher's professional identity and its relation to dropping out of the profession. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 26 ,–1543.
- Johnson, B., & Christensen, L. (2012). *Educational Research, Quantitative, Qualitative, and Mixed Methods*. United Kingdom: Sage Publications.
- Johnson, K. A. (2003). "Every experience is a moving force": Identity and growth through mentoring. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 19, 787–800.
- Kelly, P. (2006). What is teacher learning? A socio-cultural perspective. *Oxford Review of Education*, 32(4), 505–519.
- Kumar, R. (2005). *Research Methodology, A Step-by-Step Guide for Beginners* (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.) Britain: SAGE.

- Lamote, C., & Engels N. (2010). The development of student teachers' professional identity. *European Journal of Teacher Education*. 33(1), 3-18.
- Lasky, S. (2005). A sociocultural approach to understanding teacher identity, agency and professional vulnerability in a context of secondary school reform. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 21, 899–916.
- MacGregor, D. (2009). Identity formation: Influence that shape beginning teachers' professional identity. Crossing the border from pre-service to in-service teacher. *Australian Teacher Education*, 32(2), 69-132.
- Miller, J. (2009). *Teacher Identity*. In A. Burns & J. C. Richards (Eds.), *The Cambridge Guide to Second Language Teacher Education*. 29 (1), 7-21. USA: Cambridge University Press.
- Morrow, S. L. (2005). Quality and trustworthy in qualitative research in counselling psychology. *Journal of Counselling Psychology*. 52(2), pp. 250–260.
- O'Connor, K. E. (2006). "You choose to care": Teachers' emotions and professional identity. *Australia, Teaching and Teacher Education*, 24, 117–126.
- Polkinghorne, D. E. (2005). Language and meaning: Data collection in qualitative research. *Journal of Counselling Psychology*, 52(2), pp. 137–145.
- Punch, K. F. (2009). *Introduction to Research Methods in Education*. Britain: SAGE.
- Soreide, G. E. (2006). Narrative construction of teacher identity: Positioning and negotiation. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 12(5), pp. 52–547.
- Sutherland, S., Howard, S., & Markauskaite, L. (2009). Professional identity creation: Examining the development of beginning pre-service teachers' understanding of their work as teachers. *Teaching and Teacher Education*. 54(3), pp. 37-45
- Tsui, B. M. (2007). *Complexities of identity formation: A narrative inquiry of an EFL teacher*. Wiley, 41(4), 657–660.
- Van Veen, K., Sleegers, P., & Van De Ven, P. (2005). One teacher's identity, emotions, and commitment to change: A case study into the cognitive-affective processes of a secondary school teacher in the context of reforms. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 21, 917–934.

Williams, J. (2009). Constructing a new professional identity: Career change into teaching. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 26, 639–647.

Zembylas, M. (2003). Emotions and teacher identity: A poststructural perspective. *Teachers and Teaching: Theory and Practice*, 9(3), 213–238.

## APPENDIX A

Gezibuso Area  
Box 82644  
Pietermaritzburg  
3200  
11 November 2015

The Research Officer  
Research, Strategy, Policy Development and ECMIS Directorate  
Private Bag X9137  
Pietermaritzburg  
3200

Dear Sir

### **APPLICATION FOR CONSENT: RESEARCH IN A HIGH SCHOOL**

I am an M.Ed student (student no. 209542726) at the University of KwaZulu Natal, Pietermaritzburg campus. I wish to seek consent from the provincial department of education to conduct research in a High school in Pietermaritzburg, Vulindlela circuit.

The research project is a requirement of the degree that I am engaged in. My research topic is: **The influences of the matric intervention programme on the professional identity of local teachers: A case study**

The rationale for this research is to get insight into the experiences of local teachers and the influence of the MIP on their professional identity. I will use interviews and journal writing to collect data. Semi-structured interviews will be conducted with the local teachers, lead teachers selected for the MIP and the principal of the selected school.

My supervisor is Dr Carol Bertram; she is located at the School of Education, Pietermaritzburg campus of UKZN. Email: [BertramC@ukzn.ac.za](mailto:BertramC@ukzn.ac.za)

I will conduct my research at a school in which I do not teach at. I will seek consent of the principal and the participants before I begin the research. I promise to present the findings or any report if I am asked to do so.

Thanking you in anticipation.

Yours faithfully

---

X.O Ngwenya

## APPENDIX B



University of KwaZulu Natal

Private Bag X01

Scottsville

3209

02/02/2016

**The Principal**

---

Dear Sir

My name is Xolani Ngwenya. I am a Master's student at the University of KwaZulu Natal, Pietermaritzburg campus, South Africa. I am presently engaged in an independent research study on the influence of the matric intervention programme on the professional identity of local teachers. In this regard I have chosen three teachers in your school as the case study because I believe that these teachers will furnish invaluable information to the study. Therefore, I wish to get insight on the influences of the matric intervention programme on the professional identities of these teachers.

I would appreciate your permission to conduct research in your school with the identified teachers. I would also like to assure you that this is not competence evaluation of the teachers. Confidentiality and anonymity will be guaranteed. When writing the report, I will be using pseudonyms.

The study will be sent for ethical review and approval by the UKZN Humanities and Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee.

My supervisor is Dr Carol Bertram; she is located at the School of Education, Pietermaritzburg campus of UKZN. Email: [BertramC@ukzn.ac.za](mailto:BertramC@ukzn.ac.za) My contact number is 033 5050722. You may contact my supervisor or me should you have any queries or questions you would like to ask.

Yours faithfully

X.O Ngwenya (Mr)

---

## **APPENDIX C**

University of KwaZulu Natal  
Faculty of Education  
College of Humanities  
Pietermaritzburg Campus

Dear Participant

### **Informed Consent Letter**

My name is Xolani Ngwenya. I am a Master's student at the University of KwaZulu Natal, Pietermaritzburg campus, South Africa. The main aim of my research study is to explore the influence of the matric intervention programme on the professional identity of local teachers. I would like to request you to participate in this study. I would like to use semi-structured interviews for the collection of data. I request your permission to tape record your interview.

Please consider the following: your participation is entirely voluntary and you have every right to withdraw from the study at any given time, should you wish to do so. I would like to assure you that your confidentiality and anonymity will be guaranteed. When writing the report, I will be using pseudonyms. The interviews should be an hour long, at a place and time that best suit you. I will use the data collected for the purposes of this research only.

The study will be sent for ethical review and approval by the UKZN Humanities and Social Sciences Research Ethics Committee.

If you have any questions or queries regarding this study, please do not hesitate to email the researcher at [nxolanixn@gmail.com](mailto:nxolanixn@gmail.com) or phone 0725464190. If you have any concerns about your rights as a participant of the study or any aspect of the study and of the researcher, please contact: UKZN Humanities & Social Science Research Ethics administration:  
Email: HSSREC@ukzn.ac.za              Telephone: 0312604557

You may also contact the Research Office through: P. Mohun HSSREC Research Office,  
Email: [mohunp@ukzn.ac.za](mailto:mohunp@ukzn.ac.za) Telephone: 031 260 4557

My supervisor is Dr Carol Bertram; she is located at the School of Education, Pietermaritzburg campus of UKZN. Email: [BertramC@ukzn.ac.za](mailto:BertramC@ukzn.ac.za) My contact number is 0725464190. You may email my supervisor, or may contact myself should you have any queries or questions that you would like to be answered.

Yours Faithfully

---

X.O Ngwenya (Mr)

## **APPENDIX D**

**Teacher Interview Consent Letter**  
**University of Kwa-Zulu Natal**  
**School of Education**

**Research Topic: The influences of the Matric Intervention Programme on the professional identity of local teachers: a case study of grade 12 local teachers.**

I agree to participate in this study to be conducted by Xolani Ngwenya of the University of Kwa-Zulu Natal on the influences of the Matric Intervention Programme on the professional identity of local teachers. I understand that no harm will result from my participation in this study, and this study is being conducted with the purposes of improving professional development programmes on site. I understand that the material will be used for research purposes only.

I have been given the opportunity to answer questions about the study and have answers to my satisfaction. I further agree to be interviewed as part of the study. I understand that everything I say will be kept confidential by the interviewer and my real name will not be used in transcripts. In addition the names of any persons I refer to in the interview will not be revealed. I understand that my actual words may be used in research reports as quotes, but they will be reported such that my identity is not known. I understand that the results of the study may be published in an academic journal, but my name will remain unknown.

I have voluntarily given my consent to be interviewed and I understand that I can withdraw from the study at any time.

I..... (Full names of participant) hereby confirm that I understand the contents of this document and the nature of the research, and I consent to participating in the research project.

.....  
Signature

.....  
Date

If you have any further questions/ concerns or queries related to the study, please contact the researcher on 0725464190.

If you have any questions or concerns about your rights as a study participant, or are concerned about an aspect of the study or the researchers then please contact:

UKZN humanities & Social Science research Ethics administration: Tel: 031 2604557  
Email: [HSSREC@ukzn.ac.za](mailto:HSSREC@ukzn.ac.za).

Yours Faithfully

---

X.O Ngwenya  
Cell: 0725464190

---

Dr. C. Bertram  
(Supervisor)

## **APPENDIX E**

### **Interview Schedule for the local teacher**

#### **A. Career Biography**

1. How long have you been teaching? Which subjects?
2. Where did you train to be a teacher? What are your majors?
3. How long have you been teaching this subject?
4. What do you enjoy about teaching this subject?

#### **B. Describing the Matric Intervention Programme**

1. In your opinion, what do you think is the purpose of the MIP?
2. How do you feel about this programme? Is it working?
3. Are there any changes or improvement from the learners resulting from this programme?
4. As a local teacher, what is your role during the MIP and how do you feel about the lead teacher's presence (if present) during the lesson?

#### **C. Describing the experience of working in a T75 school**

1. Do you know why this school is identified as a T75 school?
2. How does it make you feel to teach in an under-performing school?
3. What do you think are the main reasons for under-performance in your school?
4. What support do you get from the DoE to assist and change the results of the school?

#### **D. Characteristics of a good teacher**

1. What do you think makes you a good teacher?
2. What motivates you to teach in a T75 school?
3. What aspects of teaching keep you committed to your work?

4. How does it make you feel being assisted by a lead teacher? Does it motivate you in a way? How?

## **APPENDIX F**

### **Interview Schedule for the lead teacher**

#### **A. Career Biography**

1. How long have you been teaching? Which subjects?
2. Where did you train to be a teacher? What are your majors?
3. How long have you been teaching this subject?
4. What do you enjoy about teaching this subject?

#### **B. Describing the Matric Intervention Programme**

5. In your opinion, what do you think is the purpose of the MIP?
6. How do you feel about this programme? Is it working?
7. Are there any changes or improvement from the learners resulting from this programme?
8. As a lead teacher, what is your role during the MIP and how do you feel about local teacher's presence (if present) during the lesson?

#### **C. Describing the experience of working in a T75 school**

1. Do you know why this school is identified as a T75 school?
2. How does it make you feel teaching and/or assisting in an under-performing school?
3. What do you think are the main reasons for under-performance in this school?
4. What support do you get from the DoE to assist a poor performing school?

#### **D. Characteristics of a good teacher**

5. What do you think makes you a good teacher?
6. What motivates you to teach in a T75 school?
7. What aspects of teaching keep you committed to your work?
8. Does being a lead teacher motivate you? How?