Women and Social Protection in South Africa post 1994:

A case study of eThekwini Municipality

Nomusa Catherine Duma

204000530

A Thesis submitted to the School of Management, IT and Governance, in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Public Administration

University of KwaZulu-Natal

Supervisor: Professor Betty Claire Mubangizi

2019

DECLARATION

I Nomusa Catherine Duma "declare that;

(i)   The research reported in this thesis, except where otherwise indicated, is my original research.

(ii)   This thesis has not been submitted for any degree examination at any other university.

(iii) This thesis does not contain other persons' data, pictures, graphs or other information unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other persons.

(iv)   This thesis does not contain other persons' writing unless specifically acknowledged as being sourced from other researchers. Where other written sources have been quoted,

   a. Their words have been re-written, but the general information attributed to them has been referenced;

   b. Where their exact words have been used, their writing has been placed inside quotation marks, and re-referenced.

(v)   This thesis does not contain text, graphics or tables copied and pasted from the internet, unless specifically acknowledged, and the source being detailed in the thesis and in the reference sections".

Signature…………………………………………

ABSTRACT

This study focused on women and social protection in South Africa post 1994. It drew on organizational theories to understand and explain the realities on the ground as experienced by female beneficiaries of government's social protection policies in selected areas of Kwazulu-Natal province. The primary objective of the study was to establish whether the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government of South Africa has social protection programmes in place and whether these are sustainable and strategically aligned to the promotion of women empowerment. In addition, the study assessed the government's processes of policy and programme implementation and the extent to which they sustainably nurture social protection and empowerment of women beneficiaries. Further, the study sought to understand and explain the extent to which public policy makers and public administrators engaged in monitoring and evaluation of social protection programmes in the pursuit of women empowerment.

The study was of a qualitative nature thus, a case study method was employed. The study found that women remain economically disempowered and unable to fend for themselves post 1994. The study revealed a profound fragmentation in terms of the social protection programmes as the empowerment and economic development elements were found lacking. This was particularly due to a lack of targeting mechanisms in the conceptualization and implementation of social protection programmes.

The study recommends that the Department of Social Development, which is the custodian department, should strengthen its research thrust to establish adequate, responsive, and women-specific programmes. Specifically, a conscious and concerted effort to integrate empowerment in social protection programmes is more likely to yield results and will ultimately result in the unlocking of the economic potential, thus, the economic empowerment of women headed-households.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Contents   **Page**

List of Abbreviations

ABET   -   Adult Basic Education and Training

APP   -   Annual Performance Plan

CCG   -   Community Care Giver

CSD   -   Commission on Sustainable Development

DSD   -   Department of Social Development

EPWP   -   Expanded Public Works Programme

GDP   -   Gross Domestic Product

HIV/AIDS   -   Human Immuno Deficiency Virus/Acquired Immune Deficiency

                     Syndrome

ILO   -   International Labour Organization

INK   -   Inanda, Ntuzuma, KwaMashu

KZN   -   KwaZulu-Natal

NDP   -   National Development Plan

NPM   -   New Public Management

NSFAS   -   National Student Financial Aid Scheme

OSS   -   Operation Sukuma Sakhe

POSDCORB -   Planning, Organizing, Staffing, Directing, Co-ordinating,

                     Reporting and Budgeting

SASSA   -   South African Social Security Agency

SMME   -   Small and Medium Enterprises

UNIDO   -   United Nations Industrial Organization

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1.   INTRODUCTION

South Africa made history in 1994 when apartheid and its discriminatory political ideologies and   administrative systems practically ended. Social protection was one area which was administered along racial lines. However, reality suggests that, post 1994, some segments of the previously experienced challenges in terms of social protection, still remain, however informed by lack of policy direction and systemic administrative challenges.   Further, the reality suggests that, social protection challenges are felt by women in the majority of cases as they are the main caregivers and heads of households in terms of the recent statistics discussed below.

This study focused on women and social protection in South Africa post 1994 when the country became a democracy. The study was conducted in two municipal wards within the greater eThekwini metropolitan municipality in the KwaZulu-Natal province of South Africa. The study focused on women of an economically active age group, were heads of households, had children and were without employment.

This chapter provides the background of the study, and a brief contextual overview. The chapter additionally outlines the problem statement and research objectives of the study, as well as certain conceptual issues related to women and social protection in South Africa post-1994. It further discusses policy implementation within the context of public administration.

1.1   BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY

The South African government has a constitutional responsibility to ensure that its citizens are protected in all possible aspects, including social protection; that is, areas beyond the realm of law and order. This research focuses on women and their social protection post-1994, which is the post-apartheid era. Section 27 (1) (c) of South Africa's constitution recognizes social security as a basic right for all citizens. In the context of this study, however, the focus is on women because women are generally poorer yet are the main caregivers in the majority of cases in South African households. In commenting on the feminization of poverty, Mubangizi (2018:31) had this to say:

> *…. the poverty impacts on many facets of the life of African women, including the violation and abuse of their human rights. In South Africa, this impact is felt most by black rural women. They live in areas with poor infrastructure, lacking in socio-economic development and employment opportunities. They have little or no access to education and other basic services such as electricity, water and sanitation. They continue to be socialized into prescribed gender roles in their societies. As a result, they suffer the impact and effects of poverty more than men do.*

Attesting to the above, StatsSA (2012) highlights the overwhelming amount of responsibilities that women have in terms of heading households in the respective provinces, with social grants being their main source of income. This report further indicates that the percentage of female-headed households is larger in successive age groups, rising from 30.6% for the age group 18-34 years old to 54.7% for the age group of over 70 years, with specific reference to KwaZulu-Natal province, this same report indicates that 43.5% of households are headed by women.

The reality suggests that poverty, inequality and underdevelopment are geographically identified and gendered. Popenoe (2004) alludes to the gendered geography of everyday life, mentioning that the social orientation of women and men are totally

different as men gravitate constantly outwards toward the wider world while women gravitate to, and occupy, the centre. Attesting to the above, May, Sulla and Zikhali (2016:3) observed that "*by 1993, 68 percent of Africans were poor and Africans made up 94 percent of those categorized as being poor, almost 75 percent of the poor were found in the rural areas of South Africa, and over 70 percent of rural African households existed in conditions which could be described as inadequate or intolerable in terms of access to housing and essential services*".

Consequently, beyond 1993, May *et al* (2016) indicates that the status quo has remained despite over two decades of democratic government and its policies. It is argued that with the above economic and statistical background, remaining at the centre automatically results in the shouldering of social responsibilities by women, which includes caring for the unwell, taking care of the children, ensuring that they attend school, looking after the aged, and so on. All of these require a balanced socio-economic coverage where there are economic means on the part of women as the main caregivers. Cebekhulu (2003), in her study on gender inequalities, asserts that women become elevated to the status of symbol within the community and are bound to assume reproduction burdens. Cebekhulu further asserts that their role as spouses and mothers are dignified and fetishized, which, in a sense, confirms them as women or as mothers and not as workers, students or citizens. Clearly, women are understood as having to play the caring role. However, they again find themselves with additional responsibilities of providing for their families and extended families without any proper economic means to do so.

Further, around the geographical identification of poverty and women as the vulnerable group in society, it is clear that unfavorable economic conditions are mostly found in townships and in informal settlements such as the wards where this study was conducted. This is despite the legislative framework in South Africa and the constant analysis and statistics provided each year. For instance, the National Development Plan (NDP) (2013), identified the challenges faced by those who are vulnerable. The NDP (2013) estimates that around a million of suitable children are not receiving sustenance grants owing to the documentation process required to

access social grants. It is stated in this crucial government document that this places an immense weight on the underprivileged and impacts adversely on the poorest of the poor.

Without a doubt, South Africa has made evidential advancement as far as its world-renowned constitution is concerned, which encompasses the Bill of Rights and a range of legislations which are meant to ensure equality, fairness and, most importantly, affirmative action and Black Economic Empowerment. The constitution and regulations have afforded an opportunity for open recruitment processes on the labour front, as well as participation of all races and gender in the economy through the tendering processes (open competition), especially with the Preferential Procurement Regulation (2011) in place.

In terms of social profile (2002-2009), households that are headed by women in the provinces are as follows: "Limpopo has the highest proportion of female-headed households (49% in 2009), followed by the Eastern Cape and KwaZulu-Natal with 45% and 44% respectively. Gauteng has the smallest number of female-headed households (29% in 2009), followed by the Western Cape with 30%." StatSA (2010) The figures support the notion that geographical identification of poverty and underdevelopment are greater in those parts of the country that are perceived as rural, with Gauteng and the Western Cape being the best off in this regard.

International Women's Forum in South Africa report (2011:6) corroborates this when it asserts that:

> *The government has produced a number of policies and legislation to enable women's empowerment. While successes are evident, as elaborated later on in this report, South Africa still carries elements of a patriarchal society. On average women still earn less than men, there still is the expectation that the role of women be restricted to child care, caring for the sick; and fetching water and fuel, rather than being economically productive and employed, and engaging adequately with the broader economy.*

Interest in this area of study emerged from reports like those quoted above, which reveal that many households are headed by women, and that these are mostly unemployed women whose main source of income is social grants or old age pensions. it is noted by the researcher that, even employed women in certain employment sectors do not receive the same income as men for work of equal value. Bosch (2015) asserts that gender gap in South Africa is roughly estimated to be between 15%-17%. She further states that this suggests that a woman in South Africa would need to work two months more than a man to earn the equivalent salary that a man would earn in a year. Such imbalances call for investigative research in terms of how the country can move forward towards formal institution of equal payment for equal labour.

Access to basic services for women has always been an issue. It has contributed to the rise in service delivery protests in the country, as it is mainly women who remain at the vulnerable centre of situations where there is minimal or no provision for social protection, and with the heaviest responsibilities. Writing about community protests, Ngwenya (2015) asserts that protest is a complex phenomenon which normally interplays with several factors, including but not limited to people's experiences of poverty that create expectation and dependency on the state for improvements to their living conditions. Ngwenya (2015) also cited multifaceted contestations over how state resources are expended as a significant factor. In terms of service delivery trends, Makhafola (2018) states that KwaZulu-Natal was at the fourth place at 14%, after Western Cape and Eastern Cape provinces respectively. He further observes that, in South Africa, service delivery protests have become a daily feature as the increase is alarming.

Against this background, the researcher's interest in this study had been developing owing to exposure to the challenges that are faced by women, mostly in townships and informal settlements surrounding the Durban area where the researcher resides. This interest was further encouraged by the researcher's engagement with literature on social protection issues which revealed that the economic exclusion of women

persists even beyond the political oppression era. Literature was further indicative of the fact that women are still vulnerable in many respects, for example around issues of patriarchy in the Province of KwaZulu-Natal. The literature triggered aspirations for investigative research into issues concerning women and social protection in this democratic state. For instance, the report on Social Profiles on Vulnerable Groups in South Africa 2002-2011, StatsSA (2012:31) reveals that

> *Male-headed households that contain children had a slightly smaller average household size than their female peers. The total dependency ratio for male-headed mixed-generation households was consistently measured at approximately one dependent for each person of working age. The burden of child dependency was highest for female-headed, mixed-generation households and lowest in male-headed, mixed-generation households. Female-headed, mixed-generation households had a total dependency ratio of approximately 1is to 3 dependency per adult, albeit with a slight decline since 2002.*

Concerning the living conditions of women, the report Sta-SA (2012:61) further states that:

> *Women's living conditions are directly affected by the basic services they receive. In addition to often being responsible to secure basic needs (fetching water and wood), women are often also the primary caregivers of children, orphans, the elderly and people living with disabilities. Improved access to basic services and social grants often assists marginal households to secure secondary sources of income. The persistent lack of access to basic services increases these poor households' vulnerability to disease. Larger percentages of households' income are often spent on increasingly less diverse and less nutritious sources of food, which does not promote the health situation in female-headed households.*

It would seem that the above-cited conditions contrast deeply with the constitutional promise on *"human dignity, the achievement of equality, and the advancement of human rights and freedoms"* as asserted in S1 of the South African Constitution (1996). They further contrast with S27 of the Constitution, which recognises social security as a basic right.

The study, therefore, focused on Wards 47 and 54 of the Inanda area, which forms part of the Durban Metropolitan Council. Informal engagements were made in advance with some female community members in the wards. This was useful in developing an indepth understanding and clarity of what the government is not doing correctly in so far as this concerns the empowerment of women post-1994 and their obvious need for support towards self-reliance.

In addition to discussing social protection and gendered poverty, it was also crucial, as part of this research report, to note the critical link between policy-making and implementation. This is because *S 27 (1) of the South African Constitution legitimises the right of access to social security for those who are unable to take care of themselves.* In other words, government promises safety nets for its citizens.

1.1.1 POLICY IMPLEMENTATION

The needs on the ground will always inform the need for policy review where necessary, and implementation thereof. Peters and Pierre (2009) indicate that "policy-making is a continual process of problem identification, formulating governmental responses, organising administrative mechanisms for executing the policies, and evaluating the extent to which policy objectives are achieved. They further state that the process begins when challenges are identified, challenges which might be resolved by governmental efforts.

This suggests that policy-making cannot be static as the needs of the people vary and change over time, hence the need for a continual process. Roux (2002:425) emphasises the need for constant policy review:

> *Of importance, is the fact that policy can never be static, it should always relate to current issues in society (for example, the continuous process of change,*

transformation and globalisation which are taking place in South Africa since 1994). It should constantly be adapted to match the impact of environmental variables and influencing factors.

When policies have been developed and approved, one assumes that they will be implemented, a stage which one would regard as the administrative interpretation of political processes. Norunzi (2011) says that *"*policy implementation is the stage of policy-making between the establishment of a policy and the consequences of the policy for the people whom it affects." He further says that "implementation involves translating the goals and objectives of a policy into an operating, ongoing program." In the same vein, De Leon and De Leon (2002) are of the view that execution "is the carrying out of a basic policy decision, regularly incorporated in a statute, which can also take the form of imperative executive orders". They are of the opinion that, ideally, policy decision identifies problems to be addressed, stipulates the objectives to be pursued and, in diverse ways, structures the implementation process.

Clearly, policy implementation appears to be a stage of discharge of the interpreted legislation through the development and approval of policies. The above comments clearly suggest that the state institutions become the implementing centres where service delivery takes effect, guided by the approved policies.

Denhardt and Grubbs (2003) note that managers establish administrative rules or policies to detail the legislation or to plug the gaps. Drawing a distinction between politics and administration when it comes to policy implementation, Denhardt and Denhardt (2009) are of the view that even though strategies are to be discussed and decided upon by politicians, they should be implemented by a politically unbiassed, professional administrative system. In this manner, the everyday conduct of government administration would be isolated from the possible corrupting political influence*.*

Similarly, Copeland and Wexler (2015) argue that execution is evolutionary, and is generally informed by the ideological, political and economic conditions in which it occurs. They also say that the "goals and objectives stated in legislation are interpreted initially by administrators responsible for policy implementation and that these interpretations become broader and more varied as the policy objectives filter down through the bureaucratic structure of the implementing organisation." Worthy of note is their assertion that the execution procedure can enable or hamper programme advancement, that is, when the programme development stage is finalised, what gets executed may differ significantly from the initial policy directive.

1.1.2 DEVELOPMENTAL SOCIAL SECURITY

In South Africa, in terms of social protection, the democratically-elected government took a strategic position to address the social exclusion that was along racial lines before 1994. This allowed all deserving citizens to benefit from government social security services in terms of the qualifying criteria which takes no race into consideration. The implementation of government social policy is under the auspices of the Social Development Department, through the South African Social Security Agency (SASSA). Plagerson and Ulriksen (2015) confirmed that the "South African government currently dispenses more than 16 million social grants, which means that nearly one-third of the population of 50 million people benefits from the social grant system". There are different types of social grants, ranging from old age pensions and disability grants to grants for child support, foster care, care dependency, grant in aid, and war veterans.

The above analysis of the distribution of social grants and the population benefitting from the system is appreciated. However, issues of the qualifying criteria, access and administrative systems and sustainability, remain a concern. According to Jacobs et al. (2010), the current social protection *safety nets* seem to be well-targeted at the projected beneficiaries *(the poor and vulnerable households)*, as indicated by the declined levels of income among social grants recipients. The levels, nonetheless, do continue to indicate that, in the context of structural poverty, the need exists to

understand the potential longer range developmental spin-offs of targeted social spending more effectively.

Having briefly pointed out the positive impact that has been made by government through the implementation of social safety nets, an argument is advanced that the economic development and economic emancipation of women remain critical for their own economic independence. Plagerson and Ulriksen (2015) are of the view that, while social grants in South Africa benefit more women than men, this programme is not planned to support the well-being and empowerment of women *per se*. They further state that, instead, women become the agents of the state as they end up mediating social assistance and deliver it on behalf of the state: that they "claim it, collect it, and are then expected to turn it into food, shelter, clothing, education, health and other aspects of a child's maintenance through their own labours".

Ncube, Shuimeles and Verdier-Chouchane (2012) alludes to the interdependence of social and economic development, that they are mutually reinforcing, as per the White Paper for Social Welfare, which was published in 1997. Furthermore, the Social Assistance Act, No. 13 of 2004 was enacted to guide the rendering of social assistance services and to provide mechanisms for its management.

In light of the above, the study aimed to establish why, despite the promulgated legislation and policies around women empowerment, there are still women who form that part of the population that is not actively participating in the economy, women who are still vulnerable to economic inequality and are consequently chronically dependent on government for daily survival.

Furthermore, the study aimed at determining whether the South African government understands the real challenges that are faced by women in the underdeveloped areas and whether there is proper alignment of programmes and consistent effectiveness in

the administrative processes. That is, whether proper delivery of the programmes is taking place.

The study, as part of its investigation of the issues in question, intended to cross-examine the degree to which the South African democratic government, with particular reference to the Province of KwaZulu-Natal, is able to align its strategic programmes with the existing legislation and policies concerning women and their social protection. In the same vein, the study intended to establish whether public administration processes are sufficiently ground-breaking to be able to ensure significant implementation at the service delivery level.

1.2   CONTEXTUAL OVERVIEW

Social protection has been, and remains, a priority for responsible governments and for humankind on the planet. It is an aspiration for a reasonably self-sufficient society that citizens should be able to provide for themselves and their families in all respects, an aspiration yet to be realised in South Africa. For this objective to become reality, citizens would need to be self-sufficient, contribute towards their own pensions, and have minimal reliance on government and international aid for survival. On a global scale, only 20% of the world's population has adequate social coverage, while more than half does not have any kind of social security coverage whatsoever (Geneva Consensus, 2001).

In the South African context, statistics suggest that women are the hope and the backbone of many households in South Africa. This is confirmed by the Statistics South Africa report (2002-2011), which shows that women make up a total of 52% of the country's population and are heading households with minimal or total lack of any form of formal income except social grants.

For the purpose of this study, it was therefore essential to analyse and understand social protection challenges on a broader scale in order to appreciate the critical need for sustainable social protection programmes, if there is indeed a serious intention to deal with the real core of social protection challenges, particularly for women.

Among many definitions of social protection available, Devereux and Sabates-Wheeler (2004) provide a clear indication of how social protection was conceptualised pointing out that "it emerged as a critical response to the safety net discourse of the late 1980s and early 1990s". They refer to the World Development Bank account of 1990 which states that "safety nets were very much the third prong of the World Bank's three-pronged approach to attacking poverty and were conceptualised as minimalist social assistance in countries too poor and administratively weak to introduce comprehensive social welfare programmes". Further, they assert that social protection is a joined strategy, both formal and informal, which is meant to provide social assistance to extremely poor individuals and households, social services to groups who need special care or who would otherwise be denied access to basic services, social insurance to protect people against the risks and consequences of livelihood shocks, and social equity to protect people against social risks such as discrimination and abuse."

For purposes of this research, the researcher considered the above definition of social protection, specifically in the South African context, in order to appreciate the progress that has been realized in relation to poverty reduction post-1994. Buthelezi (2001) found that in the majority of cases post-1994, women were heading households and that their social status and economic circumstances were lower than those of male-headed households. She further found that, among the rural poor, male heads of households often earned less than 50 per cent of the total household income and that they needed (and often did have) secondary earners such as women and children to contribute to the other half of income required in order to survive. However, she also observed that women's economic and financial contributions were constrained by a variety of factors, including problems of balancing multiple roles; for instance, women with children and with no child-care facilities to enable them to concentrate on

productive work; the pervasive characteristic of unpaid family labour; and disguised unemployed labour, not only in the agricultural sector but also in the non-agricultural sector. Regarding the overburdening of women, Buthelezi (2001) also touches on the fact that women's participation in the garden is seen as the extension of their domestic role, that education and marketable skills are lacking, and that this has also contributed to unemployment and underemployment.

Equally significant, Rogan (2011), in his study, found that there has, however, been a decline in poverty rates owing to government social grants. This suggests that there appears to be acceptance that the South African government protects vulnerable citizens from living below poverty lines, and this is mainly attributable to social grants. While there are positive reports relating to the decline in poverty, the reality indicates that more needs to be done if the country aims to reach a point where, physically and mentally, citizens are able to stand on their own economically, contribute toward their own daily survival up to pension stage, finance their children's education; and where access to health, housing and all other basic services is guaranteed for all citizens, and gender inequality is non-existent.

Rogan (2011), using income expenditure, finds that there has been a feminisation of the extent, depth and severity of income poverty during a recent ten-year period in South Africa. He further points out that while the data have shown, in line with the post-apartheid poverty literature, that poverty rates have dropped between the mid-1990s and mid-2000s, these reductions have, however, been greater for males and male-headed households, such that the gender variance in poverty rates has actually *widened* at the same time. This finding confirmed that declining poverty rates continue to leave women disadvantaged. The evidence suggests a need for further research into how social protection, with specific reference to women, could be better ensured in democratic South Africa.

According to Policy Brief 1 of February (2006), South Africa faces a serious challenge despite the good levels of investment and economic growth it experiences. The

above-mentioned policy brief states that since 2000, South Africa achieved a fastest increase in decades; however, with the official unemployment rate of 26%, a poverty rate estimated at approximately 50% and one of the most severe measures of inequality in the world, and that this requires urgent attention. The policy brief further states that "in 2003 approximately seven million South Africans, out of a total population of then 45 million, received one of the country's grants. Total spending in 2004/05 amounted to ZAR 41 billion (approximately US$7 billion), which represented 10.2% of total government spending, and 3.1% of GDP."

In the context of women and social protection, and the fact that women form a major percentage of recipients of social assistance, the socio-economic development of women is at the core of crucial issues. Eastern and Prakash (2013) suggest that "certain types of economic development erode gender equality, as dependency scholars note that the recruitment of males into the formal labour force leads to male out-migration to urban areas." They further argue that this process disadvantages women in terms of upward social mobility and formal employment, because it forces them to be remain at home and concentrate on agricultural and other responsibilities, which includes but not limited to reproductive responsibilities. Labour discrimination and female confinement to basic and subordinate roles reinforce pre-existing practices of inequalities. Eastern and Prakash say that discriminatory practices can be cultural and arise from gender specialisation in the division of labour.

It is found that the above contextualisation converges with the image that is created in terms of the realities in the country, which are confirmed by Lekgotla (2002-2009) in the preamble of the report, where he mentions *that*, although significant progress has been made to address gender inequality and discrimination in South Africa, women remain vulnerable. This report further indicates that poverty trends continue to be gendered and that female-headed households are more likely to have low incomes, to be dependent on social grants, and are less likely to have employed members. The report further mentions that both the aged and women are seemingly statistically dominant in the sector of the population that is vulnerable and needy.

Based on such realities regarding women and their chronic vulnerability, a robust debates and research around women and social protection becomes crucial. This need is grounded in the premise that the Constitution of the country (1996), in its founding provisions, asserts that "the South African Republic is one sovereign state, founded on human dignity, the achievement of equality, and the advancement of human rights and freedoms". In this context, there is a critical demand for research around strategies and programmes for women and social protection in democratic South Africa , and , if such strategies and programmes exist, whether they are properly aligned to the needs on the ground. Policy development, implementation and programme design around social protection finds its expression in public administration processes. It is in this regard that a further call arose for the interrogation of administrative processes and systems; that is, an assessment of the implementation processes in order to establish whether they are sufficiently efficient and effective to yield the desired results.

With the introduction of the notion of Public Management in Public Administration, bureaucracy and traditional models and systems in the field of Public Administration would seemingly be a thing of the past, although their values and principles will always remain. Hughes (2012:59) asserts that, in traditional public administration, an administrator would simply follow Planning, Organizing, Staffing, Directing, Co-ordinating, Reporting and Budgeting (POSDCORB) for the best way to achieve service delivery. He further says that during this time, administration means that instructions are being carried out (bureaucratic system). With the evolution of Public Management within public administration, strategies, emphasis on outputs and the level of accountability on the part of managers meant a critical modification in the field of public administration. The above is a logical call for further for academic research around social protection and women, where public policy-makers (politicians) and implementers (administrators) will have enhanced clarity in terms of needs on the ground and clear design of strategic programmes based on legislation and policies, which will ultimately feed towards implementation by administrators.

1.3 PROBLEM STATEMENT

There are several possible explanations for the contributing factors to the poor economic conditions of women and women-headed households post-1994 outlined in the preceding sections. These could include a lack of legislation and policies around the empowerment of women; or lack of optimal implementation of existing legislation and policy. However, there are well-crafted and internationally renowned legislation and policies in South Africa, for instance the "South African Constitution (1996)" which guarantees human rights, particularly S 27 which recognizes social security as a basic human right, "White Paper on Social Welfare (1997)", the "National Development Plan (2013)" which analyses social protection post 1994 and vision 2030, Employment Equity Act (1998) and other pieces of legislation which ensures equality and affirmative action in many respects, "Social Assistance Act (2004)" which provides for the rendering of social assistance and many other relevant pieces of legislation which have relevance to social protection. Hence the possible counterarguments that implementation is not the problem because these are implemented to the best of the ability of respective portfolios of government; or that the existing legislation and policies are in place and are being implemented appropriately. However, there is a possibility that the needs on the ground are not clearly understood and outlined by those who are in positions of power, in government and have influence in policy design, which then influences the design of programmes and ultimately their implementation.

Having pointed out the above, Rogan (2010:15) concludes that "female-headed households contain fewer employed members overall and a smaller number of employed males. Realistically, Rogan (2010) points out that 85.7 per cent and 87.2 per cent during the period of this study, female-headed households did not have an employed male resident in the household". Similarly, Dorrit and Rogan (2009:28) mention that "in 1997, an alarming 72.6 per cent of African females lived in poor households and by 2006, the proportion only fell to 69 per cent (a 3.6 percentage point drop decrease among African males)".

There is a possibility that South African public administration processes are not properly aligned with the policy ideals, and the country is therefore involved in a 'hit and miss' process. The alignment of policy ideals with policy implementation cannot be over-emphasized, a correlation which ensures favorable results in terms of service delivery. Peters and Pierre (2009) points out that, public administration is at the intersection of theory and practice, and that practitioners have seen academics as despondently wound up in theoretical arguments that had little or nothing to do with actually making a programme run effectively. On the other hand, academics regard many practitioners as hopelessly mired in manhole counting and incapable of seeing the larger issues that affect their practice. These problems relating to the disconnect between theory and practice make visible the gray areas concerning adequate understanding of the needs and challenges on the ground in order for the government to devise permanent solutions to the problem of creating sustainable social protection for women. This is an area urgently requiring further investigative research.

Research is a powerful tool and a way of adding to the existing body of knowledge. It is a means of bringing new knowledge to the fore that will support efforts to tackle challenging administrative issues. Research into these issues, therefore, are crucial. Public Administration is a wide and important area of specialisation, where developmental issues are debated for proper alignment of programmes. The actual needs on the ground need to be considered in public administration programmes, and the levels of effectiveness and efficiency in all administrative processes also need to be taken seriously. This study found that the available social protection programmes are more providing than empowering, unsustainable and encouraging dependency on the part of women. The study revealed that the "provision" factor contributes fundamentally to the economic challenges faced by women as it creates a dependency culture as opposed to believing in their mental strength to want to fend for themselves for self-sufficiency.

1.4   CONCEPTUAL OVERVIEW OF SOCIAL PROTECTION

Social protection is a broad concept which may be interpreted within different contexts and, therefore, has more than one meaning. On this basis, the researcher found it necessary to provide a brief overview of the concept in the context of this study.

1.4.1   Social Protection

According to Norton, Conway and Foster (2001), social protection refers to the public actions taken, responding to the levels of vulnerability, risk and deprivation which are deemed socially unacceptable within a given policy or society. They further clarify that social protection deals with both the absolute deprivation and vulnerabilities of the poorest, and also with the needs of the currently gendered for security in the face of shocks and life-cycle events. This definition suggests that social protection as a concept encompasses both proactive and reactive intervention strategies to protect citizens.

In the same vein, Holzmann and Jorgensen (2000:3) define the concept of "social protection as "the public interventions which are meant to assist individuals, households and communities manage risk more effectively and also provide support to the critically poor." They further provide an underlying framework of "social risk management (SRM)", a framework which appears to reinforce social protection as its main idea:

> *…the main idea behind SRM is that all individuals, households and communities are vulnerable to multiple risks from different sources, whether they are natural (such as earthquakes, flooding and illness) or man-made (such as unemployment, environmental degradation and war). These shocks hit individuals, communities, and regions mostly in an unpredictable manner or cannot be prevented, and therefore, they cause or deepen poverty. Poverty relates to vulnerability since the poor are typically more exposed to risk while they have limited access to appropriate risk management instruments. Hence the provision and selection of appropriate SRM instruments becomes an important device in order to reduce vulnerability and provide a means out of*

poverty. This requires striking a balance between alternative SRM arrangements (informal, market-based, public) and SRM strategies (prevention, mitigation, coping) and matching appropriate SRM instruments in terms of supply and demand.

Thus, there is a reasonable link between social protection as a concept and social risk management based on the depicted understanding that SRM seems to be focusing more on the strategies, be it towards mitigating shocks already suffered by the poorest individuals and communities or the provision of safety nets for the non-poor who, owing to the unpredictability of the future, are at risk of suffering future shocks.

Barrientos (2008) defines the concept from the perspective of labour as a concept which "is associated with a range of public institutions, norms and programmes aimed at protecting workers and their households from contingencies threatening basic living standards". He is of the opinion that these can be broadly grouped under three main headings, namely, social insurance, which consists of programmes providing protection against life-course contingencies such as old age or work-related contingencies or sickness; social assistance, which provides support for those who are trapped in poverty; and labour market regulations, which are there to ensure basic standards and extend rights and voice to organisation.

Despite the diverse definitions, social protection appears to be a concept which applies to both the poor and non-poor. Pursuing research for an even broader understanding of the concept, coupled with devising proactive and mitigating strategies, therefore remains central. Furthermore, the issue of policy implementation which is theory versus practice remains central in this study.

1.5   AIM OF THE STUDY

The study aimed to understand the link between economic empowerment of women and the government strategies geared to improve citizen's lives through South Africa's social protection programmes.

1.6   STUDY OBJECTIVES

The objectives of this study are:

- To determine whether or not the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government has in place social protection programmes that are strategically aligned with women empowerment

- To establish whether these programmes are strategically implemented with a view to ensure sustainable social protection;

- To understand and explain the extent of engagement by public policy makers and public administrators in monitoring and evaluation of social protection programmes for women including an outcome-based administration systems.

1.6.1 THE PRIMARY RESEARCH QUESTIONS FOR THIS STUDY INCLUDE:

1.   What social protection programmes in KwaZulu-Natal province are aligned to the empowerment of women?

2.   What strategies are in place to ensure these social protection programmes will sustainably ensure the social protection of women?

3.   In relation to an outcomes-based administrative system, are there mechanisms to ensure the monitoring of social protection programmes with particular respect to women's career counselling and education?

4.   What could assist in ensuring that social protection for women is sustainably realised in the democratic South Africa

1.6.2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The study was constructed upon three theories and one management approach, which are systems theory, complexity theory, sustainable development and new public management. The relevance of these theories draws on the view that systems theory,

complemented by complexity theory responds to the systemic challenges in the design and implementation of policies and programmes. Sustainable development is one other theory which adequately responds to the economic capacitation of women through access to natural resources and skills development.

1.7   SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

The significance of this study was drawn from a background literature review. The review covered previous academic research around the issue of women and social protection, as well as statistical evidence from Statistics South Africa reports which indicated the substantial percentage of women-headed households and the high level of responsibility which gets adversely created for these women. In addition, the researcher had a brief encounter with women of the two wards studied, both under Ethekwini Metro. This encounter provided an opportunity, albeit briefly, for a direct encounter in terms of the experiences and challenges that women who head households face in their daily lives.

1.8   RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

A case study method was employed in this study. Eisenhardt (cited in Ghauri et. Al, 1995:88), asserts that "case studies are particularly well-suited to new research areas or to research areas for which existing theory seems inadequate." He further mentions that this kind of work highly corresponds with incremental theory emanating from standard social science research. Other studies exist on the areas of the present research. Nevertheless, research is lacking precisely around sustainable economic mainstreaming of women, mainly, women who are perceived to be economically marginalised.   Cebekhulu (2003) focused on gender and inequality in the KwaMaphumulo area in KwaZulu-Natal. She found that patriarchy and subservience remain a concern and made recommendations that this calls for more women empowerment programmes and educational support to bridge the gap.

Following engagement with literature on social protection, including reports, statistical reviews, journals, and brief personal experiences in the identified area of study, the researcher was able to develop a sense of the critical issues of interest, which led to identifying the area of focus for this research. It is this aspect of research that Ghauri et al (1995) refer to in their assertion that it should be noted that broad exposure to information and incubation are considered important in most creative techniques. They go on to state that the exercise of literature review makes an immense contribution in deepening the researchers' understanding of strategy as an area of study. The topic chosen for this study is a product of this exercise.

The case study method was preferred because of its nature. As Yin (2009) argues that it provides two more sources of evidence; that is, direct observation of the area under study, and interviews of the participants taking part in the study. This study aimed to delve into the real lives of women in semi-urban areas. It aimed to obtain firsthand experiences in terms of the challenges they face in their daily lives, gain understanding of how they view government efforts in terms of dealing with poverty and enhancing the empowerment of women, and also learn something about their attitudes and aspirations in order to move forward in this constitutional state.

1.8.1 SAMPLING

Random stratified sampling technique was applied in this study. With regards to the community, the study mainly focused on two Wards in the eThekwini Metro in terms of exploration, observations and focus group engagements. Interviews are regarded as the most important source of data in case studies. Attesting to the importance of interviews in a case study project, Yin (2009:108) states:

> *Overall, interviews are an essential source of case study evidence because most case studies are about human affairs or behavioural events. Well-informed interviewees can provide important insights into such affairs or events. The interviewees also can provide shortcuts to the prior history of such situations, helping you to identify other relevant sources of evidence.*

From the two Wards, local leaders, particularly, Ward Councillors were interviewed, as well as four key informants from Non-Governmental Organisations and Faith-based Organisations in the area. Further, a sample of focus groups was identified with the assistance of the Ward Councillors. Three groups per Ward were envisaged, and this was realised as the local leadership showed interest in the study. The local leadership was key in the identification of participants based on the fact that they keep records of all households and activities in their respective areas, and the fact that they work closely with their communities. Groups varied in terms of sizes as these were not easy to prearrange. However, each group comprised not less than twenty participants. These groups included participants between the ages of 19 and 65, which, in essence, covered the females heading households and women who are categorised as economically active in terms of age. Their availability during business hours remained a concern as it confirmed the rising unemployment rate in the country.

Considering that the research project was on social development in terms of government administration, twelve officials from the service centre of the KwaZulu-Natal Social Development Department were requested to complete research questionnaires (open ended questions). From a total of forty-six social workers and community development officers, a sample of ten officials completed the issued research questionnaires. This constituted at least 20% of professional staff. Furthermore, an engagement with the head of the office staff provided overwhelming insight in terms of the operations, challenges and envisaged improvements in the systems. This assisted mainly with understanding the actual implementation of programmes, how statistics are collected and recorded, and reporting to the head office, which ultimately feeds into the overall departmental quarterly, half-yearly and annual reports. This was to provide a wider understanding of planning and implementation in terms of strategic direction and the rolling-out of programmes, as well as to determine whether the results intended by the department were achieved.

1.8.2 DATA COLLECTION

Primary and secondary sources were utilised for data collection. The process involved one-on-one interviews with local leaders who were ward councillors and leaders of faith-based organisations. This is where richness of information was realised. In addition to the interview process, focus group discussions were recorded using audio tape recorder, and these were transcribed to ensure that as much information as possible was accurately gathered. The language used was IsiZulu language, as most participants were not able to communicate in English. Research questionnaires were distributed to the professional staff of the Social Development Department, and these were completed and collected. The researcher also had a brief conversation with the office head, and hand-written notes were taken during the meeting. Hand-written notes were also made during the interview process to ensure effectiveness and to complement and create an alternative to the data collected that was audio-recorded. Structured and unstructured interview questions were employed in the interview process as in most cases, further probing led to questions not originally included in the designed questions. The researcher also kept a journal where all observations during the focus groups engagements were recorded.

In terms of data collection from the Department of Social Development, the study also relied on secondary sources, namely, Strategic Planning documents, Annual Performance Plans, Operational Plans. Annual reports, social profiles, journals and books also formed a major part of data collection. Previous studies conducted around this area of research, in the form of theses, were also used as part of secondary data.

1.8.3 DATA ANALYSIS

Analysis of data took the form of data review. Audio-recorded data was transcribed for language purposes. This was further reviewed and analysed in the context of the research project. Creswell (2009) asserts that the process of analysis involves making sense out of the collected data. Further, a table indicating the numbers of respondents was provided, views of respondents in percentages were formulated and captured

within the text. Contextual analysis of the above was also provided, a process which assisted the researcher to draw conclusions in terms of primary data collected.

A comparison of data sourced from documents, books and journals was analytically examined in the context of data sourced from interviews and focus groups discussion. It is contended that this form of analysis enhances the findings of the study in that any gaps that exist between what is written in documents, books and journals and the real-life experiences of women in both the identified wards of the Ethekwini Metro surface and are, therefore, taken into consideration. The advantage of using both primary and secondary data for cross-checking purposes becomes clear if one considers the observation of Ghauri et al (1995:56), which says that,

> T*here are some serious drawbacks in working with secondary data… one of the main problems is that these data are collected for another study with different objectives and may not completely fit our problem. It is therefore of utmost importance to identify what we are studying, what we already know about the topic, and what we want to have as further information on the topic.*

Supporting the use and importance of primary data, some writers, such as Creswell (1994:7), argued that "*information emerging from the natural setting would be valuable because it provides rich context-bound information that will lead to patterns or theories to help explain a phenomenon under study*" (Creswell 1994).

1.9   DEFINITION OF CONCEPTS

CAPACITY BUILDING

The term in this study refers to the skilling of women for economic independence, capitalising on their mental and physical abilities to help themselves out of the unfavourable poverty trap.

DEVELOPMENT-DRIVEN

This is a recommended strategy, intended to oppose the currently deduced social protection strategy which is more providing. The term refers to a system which will develop women than a system which mainly provides for women, which leaves them economically disempowered.

ECONOMIC EMPOWEREMENT

For purposes of this study, the term is used to express that political freedom is not enough without the economic means to survive. Economic empowerment thus refers to an ability to provide for one's self, that is, the balance between political freedom and economic emancipation.

POVERTY

The Oxford Dictionary defines poverty as the state of being very poor, which is precisely the context in which the term was utilised in this study.

PROGRAMME

For purposes of this research, the term refers to directorates in a government department, under which social protection functions reside and are delivered to the recipients.

SOCIAL PROTECTION

A precise definition of social protection is provided by Norton *et all* (2001), which appears under 1.4.1. of this write-up. They clarify that social proception refers to the

public actions taken, responding to the levels of vulnerability, risk and deprivation which are deemed socially unacceptable within a given policy or society.

The term was utilised in this study, precisely in the context of the government system which is not protecting the majority of women, most of whom are heading households.

SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

The conventional definition of sustainable development refers to the utilisation of natural resources for economic benefits, accruing to the current and future generations. The same definition applies in this study; however, the term is further utilised to emphasise on a systems approach in terms of the development of sustainable policies around sustainable development, which should contribute to capacity building within the society, particularly women.

SYSTEMS

Oxford Dictionary defines a system as a set of things, working together as a mechanism or network. The utilisation of the term system in this study, emphasises on the interconnectedness, each element having a role to play towards the attainment of a particular goal. Thus, the term refers to the analysis of the environment and the economic needs of women on the ground, which should inform the development of legislation, which will in turn inform clear policy direction, leading to design of relevant programmes, as well as clear implementation strategies. A "whole" which has a potential to ultimately result in favourable outcomes.

1.10 LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

1.10.1 GENERALISATION AND ASSUMPTIONS

Duma (2012) is of the view that data collected from a specific case study can sometimes misrepresent facts. This is because an interviewee might recount an event or incidence from his or her own personal experience and based on his or her perceptions of reality. Thus, interview data are subjective and sometimes may not be true or applicable beyond the specific case being studied.

Further, the research approach and methodology employed in this study had the potential to provide in-depth understanding of the phenomena under interrogation. The contention is based on the understanding that the research approach and methodology adopted relate more to studying specific cases with a view to understanding a particular phenomenon. Despite this, it remains critical to point out the richness of data that a case study method is capable of generating. This, however, does not take away the fact that findings from such a study cannot be generalised into a wider population beyond the studied area. Pointing out this limitation is crucial in an effort to avoid misapprehension and generalisation.

1.10.2 CROSS SECTIONAL vs LONGITUDINAL RESEARCH DESIGN

The study is informed by the currently perceived (*by both the researcher and the contemporary society*) socio-economic position of women in the identified geographical area. There is a likelihood that the socio-economic conditions of women in the Wards studied will either improve or regress due to emerging political and economic ideas, as well as local and global developmental research. It is due to this potential for change that cross-sectional research becomes a limitation, while a longitudinal research design would have afforded the researcher much time and space to track progress.

1.10.3.   POLITICAL INFLUENCES

Conducting research in a community setting may at times raise concerns to local political leaders and community members, even if the research work is purely

academic. Being granted permission to conduct the study in local wards might be a limitation. This has partly to do with confidentiality and trust that research findings should be as confidential as possible. Thus, gaining trust from political leaders as well as community members was not be easy.

Another aspect might be that local leaders may have a belief that the study is designed to question the current government administration policy direction, while the research process is ethically grounded and has no political interest. It is therefore critical to point out at introduction that the study is purely academic and bears no political influence. Signing of consent forms by political leaders - that is, ward counsellors - also assisted, for record purposes, to ensure that there is no political influence in the study.

The researcher experienced a situation where clarity had to be provided in terms of the purpose of the study before permission could be granted. Clarity was critical because there seemed to be a view that many different forces existed, some of which may come disguised as educational studies, while pursuing a hidden political agenda.

1.11 CHAPTER BREAKDOWN

This thesis is organized into six chapters.

Chapter One contains the study background, its contextual overview, and the purpose of the study. The chapter also highlights the impact the findings of this study is likely to have on women and social protection issues post-1994.

Chapter Two focuses on literature review, covering the planning and implementation processes of government, as well as the theories upon which the study was constructed.

Chapter Three outlines the research methodology that was employed for the study. The research procedure that was followed in the collection and interpretation of data is also covered.

Chapter Four focuses on the documentary study, primarily providing background information on Ethekwini Metro and related relevant information. It further analyses the Department of Social Development's strategic documents and reports within the framework of this study.

Chapter Five offers the analysis and evaluation of the data gathered through the primary data collection method.

Chapter Six wraps up with observations, conclusions and recommendations based on the researcher's analysis and evaluation of the collected data.

1.12 CONCLUSION

This chapter outlined the introduction and background to the study. It demonstrated the criticality of social protection and the conditions of women post-1994. It then proceeded to give a brief contextual review on women and social protection, highlighting the criticality of policy development and implementation within public administration. The chapter demonstrated the relevance of the study in the form of problem statement and the methodology that was employed in this research. The chapter concluded with a breakdown of the chapters in this research report.

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.   INTRODUCTION

This chapter presents the study's contextual background followed by the definition of the social protection concept and its evolution. Further, the chapter reviews literature on social protection and studies on women empowerment which have been conducted post-1994. Consequently, the chapter discusses the theories upon which the study was constructed and these are systems theory, complexity theory, sustainable development and New Public Management. The theories seek to provide a relevant contextual path towards a theoretical understanding of women and social protection, particularly, in South Africa post-1994.

2.1   CONTEXTUAL BACKGROUND ON WOMEN AND SOCIAL PROTECTION

The South African National Development Plan (NDP) (2013) clearly indicates that in 1994, the democratic government inherited a social security system that was fragmented along racial lines, a system that was characterised by inequities and low standards of living. As much as this is appreciated, a view is advanced which holds that after two decades of democracy, South Africa remains at a level where the reality suggests that the redistribution of the country's wealth remains open to question. This is due to the high percentage of citizens who continue to live below the poverty line. As the Statistic South Africa Report (2011) indicates, the standard of living for women and children in this democratic state is still at an unacceptable level, as are the legislation and policies around poverty alleviation and empowerment programmes for women. For instance, Hurlbut (2018) confirms that members of female-headed households, after more than twenty years of democracy, are up to 10 percent more

likely to slip into poverty, and are sadly only 2 percent less likely to escape poverty than male-headed households.

The situation confirmed by the NDP (2013) indeed indicates that South Africa's level of human development does not mirror the country's natural wealth and abundance of labour. Further, the NDP (2013) emphasises that special attention should be paid to "the needs of women owing to their socio-economic and cultural status, as well as the high concentration of poverty among them." The need for a greater focus on women is further informed by the level of responsibility women have in terms of care-giving in their role as heads of households, while men gravitate towards the wider world.

One might argue that social exclusion is embedded in administrative systems of South Africa, but what is of further concern is that this appears to be mainly felt by women. For instance, the Statistics South Africa report (2018) also showed that the expanded unemployment rate, which does not take the job search into account, was even higher and increased from 30.9% in 2008 to 37.2% in 2018. These are alarming statistics which attest to the view that women are the primarily affected in terms economic exclusion, and therefore there is an urgent need for shocks.

2.1.1 WOMEN'S VULNERABILITIES AND PATRIARCHAL TENDENCIES

While government appears to appreciate the need to deal with the social protection challenges of South Africa, the appropriate sense of urgency does not seem to exist. This is partly supported by Devereux (2010) when he suggests that structural change in South Africa can happen only if there is a fundamental change in the institutions that created poverty in the first place, and if there is real commitment to land reform and land redistribution. Devereux (2010) further suggests that the rich relinquish some of their wealth and property instead of the government's giving small monetary increments through social assistance (social grants) and human rights to the poor.

In a similar vein, Beneria and Bisnath (2001), in their review of agrarian reform in Latin America, assert that the mechanisms of exclusion are legal, structural and ideological. While their observations are based on Latin America, the same applies in the South African context. This includes the patriarchal tendencies in South Africa, where men are regarded as heads of households irrespective of whether they are able to take on the necessary responsibilities or not.

Beneria and Bisnath (2001) further support their view by pointing out that in Latin America, if both a man and a woman reside in the same household, the man is considered its head. This affords a man an automatic superiority, regardless of who it is who carries the major burden in terms of finances and care-giving in the household. The mere fact that a man is present in a household does not guarantee that he will take responsibility for its well-being. In a high percentage of cases relating to poor households in South Africa, women are left with a double responsibility, including maternal and financial responsibilities.

It is therefore argued that, despite existing legislation, such as the South African Constitution of 1996, the White Paper on Social Welfare of 1997, and the Social Assistance Act of 2004, as well as other policies and programmes, women remain disadvantaged and suppressed through their institutionalised exclusion from economic development and empowerment. The unfortunate reality is that when a woman who heads a household suffers from dire poverty, the children, the family, and ultimately the society, all suffer the consequences. Visvanathan et al. (2011) in support of this argument, states that regardless of a strong gender analysis and assessment of development and some progress which has been made in terms of the "mainstreaming this in development frameworks, policies and institutions, women continue to bear the brunt of poverty, ill health and lack of economic opportunities". This deduction is over and above the inheritance additional domestic responsibilities women have.

In essence, an argument is advanced that the economic mainstreaming of women is critical in the sense that it has a potential to contribute to the reduction of poverty. Thus, it eases the load on government in terms of provision through social grants, for physically abled individuals who should be fending for themselves through capacitation and appropriate exposure to economic opportunities.

2.1.2 SOCIAL PROTECTION POLICY AND WOMEN'S ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

While social protection and economic development are regarded as a development studies phenomenon, it is argued that social protection must be tackled from all angles. Hence the South African government's talk of an integrated approach in dealing with poverty. In this context, this study is conducted within the Public Administration discipline, with the understanding that government should lead through legislation, policies and programmes that would be influential through clearly defined and well-informed directives, leading to effective implementation and measurement of deliverables, performance monitoring, and evaluation of all government and social protection systems.

Within this context, the country's political and economic systems that are likely to have influence on development, or lack of it, and on the crafting and approval of legislation, policies and implementation strategies, and that would ultimately impact on the economic development and empowerment of women, should not be ignored. This perspective is based mostly on the view that the South African Republic faces a challenge of chronic dependency on government by a significant section of the population that is perceived as not actively participating in the economy and, therefore, becomes a burden. Women largely comprise that section of the population. Scholarly work, in an effort to support government's hard work, remains essential. It is in this context that literature concerning the development and empowerment of women is discussed.

2.2 THE CONCEPT OF SOCIAL PROTECTION

Social protection as a concept has been, and continues to be, discussed within the academic compass. However, its ongoing evolution remains essential in an effort to understand its complexities. Discussing the evolution of the concept of social protection, Scott (2012:5) states:

> *Social protection originates from the idea of the state as a provider and protector of citizens, enjoying a rich history in Western Europe in the post-World War II period. Originally, social protection was limited to supporting people in managing and mitigating shocks and heightened vulnerabilities, but in the last two decades, social protection discussions have expanded to encompass four types of interventions: protective (recovery from shocks); preventative (mitigating risks in order to avoid shocks); promotive (promoting opportunities); and transformative (focussing on underlying structural inequalities which give rise to vulnerability).*

This stresses the criticality of the state's intervention in terms of prevention, protection, and being proactive in an effort to reduce future risks. Adding to the above contextual background around transformation and social welfare, Jacobs, Ngcobo, Hart and Baiohethi (2010:3) define social protection from a South African perspective as follows: "Social protection is a redistributive tool to reduce the cost of living to the poor."

In the same vein, Devereux (2010) provides a precise account regarding how South Africa contextualises its stand on social issues. In terms of his account, one senses an urgent need for a complete overhaul of systems based on the dreadful historical past of the country. He states that, although the social protection systems in South Africa date back to the 1920s and contain elements of the European style, a diffusion theory was also embedded; that is, "social institutions were culturally diffused from some societies to others" (Devereux 2010:4). He adds that this provision was eventually extended to all races over time and with the abolition of apartheid.

Thus, the deep and unpleasant history of apartheid cannot be avoided as a base for discussions when dealing with issues relating to social protection. This research project, however, aims to place greater focus on transformation and on ways and means of moving forward in an effort to realise a better South Africa in terms of social protection, particularly for women post-1994, and avoid mere rhetoric in the process.

Neves *et al.* (2009) are of the view that, "South Africa is a highly unequal middle-income country in which its long-lasting structural poverty relegates millions of the needy population to the economic periphery". This suggests that South Africa, post-1994, offered a social protection system that was initially based on the needs of those who were meant to benefit at that particular point in time. Although it would seem that this was appreciated, fragmentation remained nonetheless. Therefore, research, which has the potential to a better understanding of the needs 'on the ground' post-1994 would have afforded the South African government an opportunity to redesign and construct relevant systems that would ultimately lead to more effective and efficient social protection programmes and their implementation.

What is remarkable in this approach is that all races are now treated equally. Devereux (2010) argues that South Africa's unique social policy history demonstrates a general truism that design choices on social protection programmes (the eligibility criteria, payment levels and linkages to other programmes) were and remain not only technical decisions, but are also having reflective implications for the distribution of state resources and for patterns of integration and social exclusion. The above assertion seems to confirm the advanced argument in this study that, if social exclusion was embedded in the social protection administrative systems, complete overhaul of the systems, informed by research for relevance, might be the lasting solution, an overhaul which will result in more aligned programmes. All these require an effective and efficient governance and administrative system in targeting the neediest of society.

In terms of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), there is no specific and precise definition of social protection. Zhang, Thelen and Rao (2010) assert that

there is no clear classification of social protection measures in the literature or in policy and in practice. They are of the view that when measuring the social protection components of each fiscal stimulus package, social protection is defined… (including transitory poverty and vulnerability due to economic or other shocks) as improving human welfare. They are further of the view that many social protection measures support the poor and vulnerable groups of people. These groups include the non-working, young, unemployed, working poor, non-working elderly and special groups (sick, disabled, elderly and minorities) to cope with economic hardships.

Governance and administration require strategic planning, appropriate programmes linked to available budget, effective implementation of such programmes and ongoing monitoring and evaluation. This, in essence, requires systems thinking on both political and professional leadership. Checkland (2000) suggests that the world contains structured wholes that are able to maintain their identity under a certain range of conditions and that exhibit certain general principles of wholeness. He says that systems are interested in elucidating these principles in the belief that this will contribute usefully to our knowledge.

2.3   PREVIOUS STUDIES CONDUCTED

Several studies have been conducted which focus on social protection and challenges faced by women in the post-apartheid era. For instance, Rogan (2011) focuses on female headship in South African households and on income disparities between males and females. He finds consensus that the poverty headcount rate probably decreased after 2000 and that social grant income played an important role in bringing about this decline. Importantly, he finds that the overall decline in the percentage of individuals (households) living below the poverty threshold obscures the greater decline for male and male-headed households relative to females and female-headed households. This confirmed that poverty has been gender-related in the post-apartheid period.

Rogan's (2011) work was based on secondary sources in the form of surveys and provided in-depth analysis of the poverty lines. This confirms that further probes are needed in order to establish *how* the country should bridge this widening socio-economic inequality between females and males.

Equally significant, in her research into the issue of women and their social protection, Buthelezi (2001) found that one of the ways in which discrimination against women has exacerbated, within a framework of limited resources, is the further limiting of women's access to resources. One of the factors contributing to such limitation is the lack of time to cope with all the demands made on them. Women also suffer a lack of alleviation of the heavy burdens they carry in having to engage in paid work and income generation in order to earn a living without assistance with their reproductive and domestic responsibilities.

In her study of gender inequality, Cebekhulu (2003) brought into focus another dimension, quoting Mandela (1993) when he observes that women's oppression is a direct result of the unequal power vested in both male and female parties. Cebekhulu (2003) further outlines that women have accepted subservience based on cultural background and social orientation, and are still subjected to extreme forms of discrimination including lack of exposure to education and developmental programmes.

This is supported in the study by Jolayemi (2003) on the empowerment and development of rural women which highlights that South Africa is a male-dominated country in terms of core decision-making organs. This was based on Jolayemi's (2003) observation of the working on water project which preferentially employed a workforce that was at least 60% women, but had fewer women than men in management positions due to the low level of education among women.

Research literature on women and their social protection reveals that various studies examined issues relating to the empowerment of women, specifically within KwaZulu-Natal post-1994. Some of these include Ndinda (1997), titled coping strategies of women micro-entrepreneurs; Groth (2009), focusing on women and livelihoods; and Manik (1999), focusing on the empowerment of women and on women's initiatives at Inanda. A further study was conducted by Ndinda (2002) on women's participation in housing delivery post-1994.

Despite these studies, the reality is that South Africa has a history that makes it unique in the continent, and in the world. This is in terms of its racial groups (a 'rainbow nation'); its record of racial segregation and the struggle against it; the strides that were made by South Africans through negotiations at the release of political prisoners; the interim South African Constitution of 1993; and the world-renowned South African Constitution (1996), which is the pillar upon which the country's democracy rests. The 1994 South Africa's new dawn raised many hopes as politicians, the intelligentsia and ordinary citizens, young and old, worked together "to build a non-racial, non-sexist and more economically equal country", and therefore bring about a better life for all. The promise implied by this transition brought hope to many struggling women that gender disparities would also be a matter of priority and would be fast-tracked.

The Reconstruction and Development Programme, when it was tabled before Parliament in 1994, was part of the initial efforts which brought more hope to the marginalized. In the White Paper (1994) it was "defined as a policy framework for integrated and coherent socio-economic progress that would seek to mobilise people and the country's resources" in ways that would assist proactively in eradicating the consequences of apartheid. The Government of National Unity, which started off tirelessly on a new slate, was to ensure a smooth transition. As described by Hepple (quoted by Dupper and Garbers 2009:3),

> *South Africa has been transformed from a country which had the worst legal inequalities in the world into one whose constitutional and legislative provisions promoting equality are now the envy of human rights activists everywhere.*

Having provided a contextual background on women and social protection post-1994, along with an overview of previous studies, the sections that follow will focus on the theories upon which the study rested. These are systems theory, complemented by complexity theory and sustainable development, as well as new public management. The latter being a public management approach and not a theory. The application of these theories was informed by the perceived complexity of the environment where public administration takes effect, which seemed to be resulting in an ever-increasing burden on government for sustenance of female-headed households.

2.4   THEORETICAL CONVERGENCE

The explored literature revealed the criticality of a multiplicity of actors, which ought to be involved in resolving a phenomenon of this magnitude. Systems theory appeared appropriate in the sense that it brings in some order of events in complex environments as it emphasizes interdependence, that is, each layer being dependent on the other in a structure for effectiveness. Justin, Cook and Tonurist (undated) affirm that "systems are elements joined together by dynamics that produce an effect, create a *whole or influence other elements and systems".*

Consequently, sustainable development as a theory, envisages a sustainable society beyond environmental terms. For purposes of this study, this theory focuses on the implementation of policies and systems, which are all vital for an improved economic ground for women. Writing on sustainable development, its challenges and innovation, McDonald (2017) argues that the role of public managers is to play the leading role in developing sustainability goals and translating them in management and operations. new public management was explored from a public sector reform perspective. This encompasses the management connotation in the public sector setting with the intention to curb government inefficiencies. Greuning (2001) clearly states that part of the theoretical basis for new public management is performance measurement and improved accounting on the part of managers. He further mentions that this new public management is basically what informs the reform which informed the idea of financial management and performance auditing. In essence, new public management came

as a paradigm shift from the traditional public administration to the use of market systems in an effort to enhance service delivery.

2.5   THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES

Women and social protection form an area of study that has been approached by many scholars from diverse disciplines. It appears, however, that most of the researchers have more often approached social protection as it relates to women from a welfare perspective. This section therefore seeks to provide a theoretical framework on social protection beyond a welfare perspective; by approaching it from developmental and empowerment perspectives. Providing a distinction between a welfare approach and a development approach, Phukon (2008:773) clarifies that *a welfare approach is a model where women are recognised as home makers, bearers, and rearers of children and house wives, who should only be catered for in terms of family planning, population, mother and child care policies, while the development approach would include recognising that the development processes have been strongly male-biased and bypassed women, led to the international aid community to attempt to integrate women into the production (market) system so that the economy could grow more vigorously.*

Further, writing around women and development, Visvanathan *et al* (2011) posits that women first came into focus in development as objects of welfare concern, further indicating that patriarchal and liberal discourses at both national and international levels were being left unchallenged. The subject of gender relations in society tended to focus on gender-based division of labour and on individual negotiation within the family. The South African Constitution of 1996 guarantees equality, thus, Issues of patriarchy and institutionalised discriminatory government systems cannot be left unchallenged where they are clearly shown to exist.

In view of the diversity of theoretical perspectives on the subject of social protection, it is not conceivable in this study to discuss all related theoretical propositions, mainly,

due to space and time, and other research-related limitations. Therefore, for purposes of this research, the three theories which will be discussed are systems theory; complexity theory, which underpins systems theory; and sustainable development. In addition, new public management (NPM) as a management approach will be discussed.

2.5.1 SYSTEMS THEORY

Systems theory evolved from science. Different scholars have, however, interpreted and analysed systems theory from different perspectives, so that it is now an interdisciplinary theory which merges quite well in the public management and administration field. When analysing this theory in the context of public management and administration, one finds that it is relevant to effectiveness and efficiency. As a system is naturally meant to create some order of events, it also brings elements of the ability to track and monitor, and it eventually allows for the measurement of results.

Ile (2007) says that the task of co-ordination is a discouraging one as governmental activities and responsibilities have grown beyond just providing security and peace. She further mentions that public administration activities unfold within coordinated systems and that within those coordinated systems, there are sub-systems that must interact.

Traditional processes of public administration are planning, organising, staffing, directing, leading and controlling. However, with the "paradigm shift from public administration to public management and administration", greater emphasis was placed on strategic planning, outlining of vision, mission, formation of strategic goals, annual performance plans and targets, and operational plans, as well as management and accountability, reporting and overall organisational performance management. These comprise a public management and administration system which is theoretically meant to ensure effectiveness and efficiency in government operations and, ultimately, satisfaction of the needs of the citizens.

In an attempt to get to the core of what systems theory means, Kripper and Laszlo (1998:7) says that

> *…the concept of 'system' serves to identify those manifestations of natural phenomena and process that satisfy certain general conditions. In the broadest conception, the term connotes a complex of interacting components together with the relationship among them that permit the identification of a boundary-maintaining entity or process.*

In terms of the community development and social work viewpoint, Kihlstrom (2011), asserts that systems theories call attention to structures around customers, making examples of family, organisations and institutions that represent a way of understanding the process of creating social order and how to integrate or include individuals in the community. Thus, one takes into cognisance the nature of the state, the three spheres of government, departments within each sphere, hierarchical structures in government departments, components, functional units, among other things. The key tools in these sub-divisions are hierarchical structures and budgets, which are regarded as the main tools of service delivery. In essence, the functional approach within the tiers of government and correlation of multiple functional units creates interdependence and a systemic delivery of services. By its very nature, systems theory implies interdependence.

Peters and Pierre (2009:305) argue, in their discussion on the quality of government, that *"various interdependent (structural) layers of administrative values constitute the quality of government and, in the long run, administrative reform in the public sector has to serve different administrative value systems"*. They further allude to the existence of *"three layers in systems theory: which are administrative responsiveness (functional legitimacy), administrative integrity (procedural legitimacy) as well as administrative reliability which is regime legitimacy"*. They clarify that each of these administrative layers presuppose the next, in the sense that they may, in specific situations and contexts, make different demands on a reform programme, and this particular tension makes administrative reform a highly dynamic process (Peters and

Pierre, 2009).   A critical observation is further made in this regard, that the value systems may reinforce one another, in a detrimental or in a constructive way, and that the way in which reforms are conducted might make the difference, in the form of each layer influencing the other.

The present study takes into account the perceived challenge of strategic programmes, whether these exist; and whether such programmes are properly aligned to the needs on the ground, and whether they are properly constructed and implementable.   Additionally, the study sought to establish whether available programmes are monitored and evaluated for measurement of performance so as to test their impact and relevance. The premises underpinning this study are that if strategic programmes and functional systems are in place, and each administrative level is communicating and functioning to its optimum level, then conditions of poverty, chronic dependency on social grants and all the social ills that are faced by women would be minimal or even non-existent.

2.5.1.1   SYSTEMS THEORY: A FUNCTIONAL APPROACH

Systems theory emphasises interdependence. Each element in a system, therefore, has a role to play if that particular system is to function well and yield results. Kihlstrom (2011) asserts that a nation state is a system that is maintained by laws and roles. To offer clearer understanding of how systems theory functions, Leonard and Beer (1994:5) state that

> *the systems approach regards everything as ultimately connected to everything else. Nevertheless, boundaries of concern are possible to establish and to designate for the most relevant relationships. Specifically, most systems tend to be nested within larger systems and to contain smaller systems within them, like a set of Russian dolls. This hierarchy is not necessarily one authority, but may be one of the logic or completeness.*

The above quotation illustrates the emphasis on the functioning of the whole, the system, sub-systems, functional units, and all components leading to the sum, which is the end result. Leonard and Beer (1994) further state that, this phenomenon is known as a recursion, because many of the functions and relationships recur at each level; thus, the systems approach is characterised by the recognition that the most favourable outcome for the whole system is not achieved by each sub-system selecting its best option, but by co-ordinating their activities.

The argument advanced in this theory is that there might be some complexity and, at times, this might lead to some disorder in governance as the state appears to be like a huge elephant which a blind man might find difficult to know clearly. However, with the development of proper structures, clearly defined programmes, implementation procedures and monitoring and evaluation, some order of events should prevail, and ultimately the functioning of the whole should yield the desired results, as systems are in place for interconnection, correlation and, consequently, desired results.

In systems theory discussion, reference is made to complex issues that may arise in a setting, and that it is essential to critically engage where complexity has arisen. Complexity theory is therefore discussed below, in the context of public administration, as feedback is critical in government so as to be in a position to learn, review and redesign, where necessary.

2.5.2 COMPLEXITY THEORY

In systems theory, the view is that where there are systems and sub-systems properly in place, all elements merge, and results are likely to be favourable. However, in complexity theory, the argument is that systems are subject to feedback. In complementing the systems theory as articulated above, complexity theory is explored from a public management perspective. Legislation, policies and implementation strategies may be in place, but public managers do not, however, operate from a

unique space where positive results can simply be guaranteed. That is, non-linearity will not prevail.

Arguing about the unpredictability of results, Jackson (2000) points out that it is known that even fixed inputs into "deterministic rules can generate non-linear feedback loops", giving rise to the inherently random pattern of behaviour wjich can be referred to as chaos. He further mentions that, because organisations are replete with such loops, any links between cause and effect, action and outcomes, get lost in complexity with radical and unpredictable results.

Complexity theory brings in the human element of unpredictability. While legislation, policies and guidelines may be in existence, non-linearity prevails. It is therefore important to be aware of the fact that even though complexity theory emerges from science, it, nonetheless, applies across many fields of study, including public administration. As Klijn (2008) points out, in most public administration theories, the foremost supposition was that organisations were rational actors, but gradually researchers began paying attention to the fact that both rational behaviour and the assumption that government was a integrated actor were more exceptions than the rule in the practice of public administration. He further points out that complex systems comprise numerous interrelating identities, each of which is behaving within its local context according to some rules, laws or forces, and when the individual parts of complex systems respond to their own local conditions, they cause the entire system to display emergent patterns, even if there is no deliberate co-ordination or communication between the parts. He explains that systems are self-organising and that they display emergent properties which cannot be traced to the behaviour of the individual agents alone.

With the systems and complex theories discussed in the context of public administration, the issue of policy and governance comes into play. As Koliba and Zia (2011) state, there is a need to develop a better understanding of how complexity ties in with policy and governance. These systems are resilient, adaptive and self-

organising and describe complex policy and governance systems within the context of innovation, change and collapse (Koliba and Zia 2011). This study is about women and social protection, and one other indicator of challenges existing in service provision is the pervasive service delivery strikes that seem to be escalating. For instance, Makhafola (2018) writes that, as of 30 June 2018, Johannesburg had experienced 144 service delivery strikes, and all nine provinces in South Africa had experienced strikes at different rates. In his report, KwaZulu-Natal is ranked fourth, at 14%, in service delivery strikes. These are perceived to be triggered by lack of strategic and systems thinking, ultimately leading to dissatisfaction and disillusioned citizenry. In this context, this is a non-linear feedback based on the catastrophic failures of government, which undoubtedly include the stubborn triple challenges felt mostly by women as, in the majority of cases, it is women who bear the major burden in households, in addition to the several other societal and economic conditions that are not in their favour.

Koliba and Zia (2011) are of the view that wicked problems persist because of the failure to understand complexity, and the failure to integrate the role of non-linear feedback loops operating within the complex policy and governance processes into theories and empirical research. Thus, one concedes that predicting responses from designed policies and government programmes cannot be easy. However, empirical research does have considerable potential to provide guidance insofar as needs and innovation are concerned. It is also necessary to review existing programmes and to develop new programmes as and when necessary.

Townsend (2012) is of the view that not all policy issues should be treated as complex. He argues that in most government organisations, the conduct of policy analysis is considered to be the same, irrespective of the nature of the issue. As a consequence, not much discussion occurs on research, an analytical approach, or what would constitute the requisite decision-making support for different classes of policy problems. This neglect is a mistake. Townsend (2012) seeks to highlight the critical nature and place of research within the field of public administration. Perceptive

analysis, when dealing with specific issues, rather than generalisation, has the potential to lead to relevant responses to challenges.

As discussed earlier, systems theory emphasises interdependence, each layer having a role to play in order for a system to yield results. Supporting this view and also demonstrating the merging of systems and complexity theories, Ozer and Seker (2013:95) note that

> *Complexity theory argues that systems evolve with each other in a non-linear fashion and systems are subject to dynamic feedbacks both in positive and negative sense. Moreover, they coevolve with each other with potentials to co-organize (quoting Klinj and Teisman 2008). In such regard, Eppel (2009:16) underlines that "Many complex systems are systems within larger complex systems, within still larger systems and so on".*

Agreeing with Ozer and Seker (2013), Christensen and Laegreid (2011) discuss complexity and hybrid public administration. They are of the view that, public organisations are becoming progressively complex and hybrid as they try to attend to, their mostly conflicting ideas, considerations, unusual demands, structures and cultural elements at the same time. Furthermore, they mention that, one basic reason for this is that the government's effort, in their modern representative democracies, as they are institutionalising administrative policies and implementing different generations of modern public sector reforms at an accelerating pace, which most of the time compromise quality of the good intentions.

What is further noted in the discussion of this complex and hybrid public administration is the public sector reform from traditional public administration to new public management which, according to Christensen and Laegreid (2011), results in a complex sedimentation or layering of structural and cultural features. It also becomes a system within the modernised public sector, a system which is bound to dynamic feedbacks (Christensen and Laegreid 2011) .The above quotations concerning the application of the systems and complexity theories in public administration indicate a major public sector reform, and the fact that public administration and governance take

place within the normal space where the environment poses complex challenges, and where systems, therefore, become very important for feedback and corrective measures and for devising improvements where necessary.

In summary, Scheider and Somers (2006) provide some comparison between general systems theory and complexity theory. They believe that the development of complexity theory is more evolutionary because it is largely based upon previous science. They further argue that general systems theory is known for open systems but does not, however, assume that all systems are open, while complexity theory emphasises complex adaptive systems but does not assume that all systems are complex. What is key in their argument is their concession that different system patterns can never be the same. That is, some may be chaotic, while others may reach a point of equilibrium or fixed point. They conclude that. complexity theory does not negate the findings of general systems theory, but that it does find them to be limited to certain types of systems.

Systems theory suggests that with the emphasis on interdependence and co-ordination, the effective interaction of systems and sub-systems, favourable results can be a reality. In this research, systems theory was used to answer the following research questions:

- What social protection programmes in KwaZulu-Natal, are aligned to the empowerment of women?

- What strategies are in place to ensure that these social protection programmes will sustainably ensure the social protection of women?

2.5.3   NEW PUBLIC MANAGEMENT

It is a given that there will be various theories and approaches within different fields of study, as that is partly the role of academia. NPM came about as an approach rather

than a theory. Some academics argue that it lacks theorists and so is not a theory but, rather, a management approach. For instance, Miller and Dunn (2006) are of the view that NPM is a set of operating principles (more practical), which were not necessarily generated and abstracted from a well-defined theory, but as administrative solutions to the operational problems confronting governments. Consequently, Kalimullar, Ashraf-Alam ad Nour (2012) see NPM as an administrative argument. Thus, NPM comes across as a management approach which, in terms of theory and practice, was intended to introduce change for the enhancement of service delivery. In other words, it is a practical approach rather than a theory.

It may, however, not be feasible to focus on new public management and overlook reform within the public sector, as the word 'new' in new public management should be informed by some change and innovation. Another dimension to be noted in this management approach is the word 'management' in the public-sector, as this is perceived to be a private sector term. Hughes (2012) says that reform is undertaken with the aim of improvement. In other words, there must have been some recognition of the need for change. He further argues that the traditional model in public administration was replaced by public management as the culmination of a reform process that began in the1980s and that the main reason for this change was simply that the old model no longer worked well. On this basis, it is argued that the intention could be seen as a positive move towards enhanced service delivery in the public sector.

In terms of NPM encompassing private sector terminology, Pfiffner (2004) clarifies that, NPM covers a wide range of practices and viewpoints that aim to overcome the inefficiencies of the traditional model of public administration. He adopts an understanding of NPM as the entire collection of tactics and strategies which are intended for the improved performance of the public sector. This clearly depict the borrowing of the idea from the private sector for the enhancement of service delivery in the public sector.

In the same vein, Hughes (2012:3) provides some definitions of administration and management, he says that

> *…administration is an act of administering, which is then to manage the affairs of or to direct or superintend the execution, use or conduct of; while management is: to conduct, to control the course of affairs by one's own action, to take charge of.*

The above is reinforced by Pfiffner (2004) who points out that Max Weber's emphasis was on control from top to bottom in the form of monocratic hierarchy, a system of control in which policy was set at the top and carried out through a series of offices, with each manager and worker reporting to one superior and held to account by that person. He further argues that this bureaucratic system was grounded on a set of rules and regulations flowing from public law, and that the system was, therefore, rational and legal. This depicts a 'one best way' approach in government, without any proper consultation, a system which does not allow for innovation or measurement of performance. The emphasis on control means the no measurement of output against plans, and feedback from recipients is non-existent. Thus, the Hughes' definition demonstrates a model of administration that does, however, have an element of charge and accountability on the part of practitioners.

From a more progressive angle, Vigoda (2003) is of the view that new public management signifies an approach in public administration which employs knowledge and experience assimilated in business management and other disciplines for efficiency purposes, effectiveness, and the enhancement of performance in the public service and its modern bureaucracies. He further mentions that the significant conceptual change which has transformed the old style of public administration into the new approach of public management is the liberalisation of public administration. Similarly, Hope (2001) provides a clearer understanding of the foundation of NPM when he says that the basic foundation of NPM is the use of the market systems, as a model for political and administrative relationships. He further clarifies that it "represents the culmination of the necessary revolution in public management that

emerged in the 1980s," and that this approach placed some emphasis on responding to the desires of ordinary citizens rather than focusing on controlling bureaucracies.

It is, however, crucial to note that the revitalisation of public administration actually emerged long before the 1980s. The evolution of NPM as a public management approach is, therefore, somehow built on the contributions and bases of other public administration theories. Ewalt (2001) comments that "If Weber and Woodrow Wilson were to suddenly appear on the landscape of modern public administration, normative theories in hand, it is likely they would be unable to recognize the field." This statement emphasises how traditional public administration principles were instilled and practised. It also shows that, despite being grounded in Max Weber's and Woodrow Wilson's orientation, the field has been modernised, and continues to be further modernised, in the interests of aligned service delivery output and satisfaction of the needs on the ground.

Greuning (2001) provides an important account of the origins of this public administration revitalisation, or, rather, public sector reform as he points to the fact that administrative thought began in the United States of America at a time when its public administration was in a state of disrepute.

One might argue that the above theoretical discussion connotes a paradigm shift in the field of public administration, from the traditional top-down approach as the one best way of service delivery. Doorgapersad (2011) concurs that "NPM represents a paradigmatic break from the traditional model of public administration." He states that "it is a reformed public sector transformation that breaks away from the repressive, autocratic and conservative paradigm of public administration that followed top-down hierarchies underpinned by Weber's 1946 bureaucracy, Wilson's 1887 policy-administration divide, and Taylor's 1911 scientific management model of work organisation."

The inclusion of private sector terminology and methods within the public sector was an effort to emphasise effectiveness, efficiency and, therefore, value for money spent. Ewalt *et al* (2011) says that while governance is about process, NPM is about outcomes. This emphasises that the revitalisation of the field of public administration through the NPM approach focuses on the outcomes-based method. It remains unclear whether further scientific research around NPM will yield results that will cause it to be regarded as a theory. However, this does not deter its application in the field.

One of the elements of NPM is strategic alignment of activities with objectives for outcomes-based management and policy implementation. Thus, the application of NPM in this study is informed by the very nature of this management approach, that it introduces the use and application of market systems in a public sector setting, in an effort to enhance service delivery. It emphasises public sector reform; that is, a paradigm shift from bureaucratic administrative systems to innovation, management and performance measurement. In the context of this study, NPM is therefore useful in responding to the following research question:

- In relation to an outcomes-based administrative system, are there mechanisms to ensure the monitoring of social protection programmes, with particular respect to women's career counselling and education?

2.5.4 SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

This research concerns women and social protection post-1994. The researcher is of the opinion that strides have indeed been made in terms of uplifting the standard of living for South African citizens. However, despite legislative and policy developments, women remain at a less favourable economic, social and cultural level compared with men. It is therefore argued that there is an urgent need for the economic development and empowerment of women in order to enable them to take full control of their own lives and be able to provide for their own families at all times. In essence, sustainable social protection is crucial.

In a country like South Africa, where unemployment, inequality and poverty are prevalent, economic growth becomes key. The province of KwaZulu-Natal is predominantly rural but is no different from other provinces in terms of the urgency around the general socio-economic needs on the ground. Statistics indicate that women and children are at the very centre of the poverty and the socio-economic hardships in the country. The statistics reveal that the percentage of female-headed households is larger in successive groups. Evidence is also provided by Lekezwa (2011) who relates poverty and gender and states that in 2011 the poverty bias towards females was reflected in the share of poverty by gender of households, where 54.6% of households were headed by females, while 45.3% were headed by males. In addition, he states that the standard of living in male-headed households was on average higher than in female-headed households.

The realities confirm that a multi-disciplinary approach towards more sustainable social protection for women is crucial. Further, it is argued that sustainable development is one of the theories which can provide a basis for discussion around economic development and the empowerment of women for a significant breakthrough if the country, and the province of KwaZulu-Natal in particular, is to achieve progress in terms of sustainable social protection for women.

Visvanathan *et al* (2011) advances the view that ecofeminism reasserts the age-old association between women and nature. They define sustainable development as "development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs". With this view of women and their association with nature, the use of available natural resources, especially land, may be an area to be considered for sustainable social protection for women. However, there would have to be the necessary enhancement of capacity and ongoing support, such as education, training and economic development for sustainability of projects to ensure ultimate economic success. It is argued that the above has the potential to work as an intervention geared towards the economic mainstreaming of women for ultimate social protection.

Elaborating on what sustainable development is and what its objectives are concerning the situation of women, Warth and Koparanova (2012) are of the view that, "sustainable development is the convergence of three trajectories; namely, economic growth, social development and environmental protection". Generally, academics seem to focus more on the environmental aspects of sustainable development. However, the focus in this thesis is on the social development aspect. The greater emphasis is on the relief that women could gain from the utilisation of natural resources for economic mainstreaming, a process which would ensure sustainable social protection, and sustainable development beyond environmental terms, as Pappas (2012:2) suggests below.

A sustainable society possesses the ability to survive and prosper, not just with respect to environmental resources, but also with respect to quality of life as it pertains to social, economic, technical, and individual contexts and especially the values and conditions that promote continued human prosperity and growth (e.g. opportunity, economy, privacy, community, the arts, education, and health). A sustainable society meets these needs simultaneously, and in the context of human respect and the ability to negotiate differences without violence.

A sustainable society is depicted in the above statement beyond environmental terms, which is quite conceivable with legislation, policies and systems in place for implementation, and then learning from feedback for even further improved systems and for a sustainable society. It is contended that the impact of sustainable development should lead to sustainable social protection. The utilisation of natural resources is considered as the means to an end, the economic mainstreaming of women being the end in this particular case.

Sharma, Pathania and Lal (2006) discuss diverse farm income and the extent of commercialisation from the utilisation of land for agricultural farming. They used the case of an area in Himachal Pradesh, which witnessed a high degree of transition as farming had become highly responsive to external stimuli and market forces. They refer to the fact that land productivity was markedly higher in vegetable and fruit-based

systems, and that land productivity also increased in rain-fed areas along with improved livestock in livestock-based systems. They further noted that the commercial production of vegetable crops also picked up under other systems where there was increased awareness plus creation of irrigation facilities. These examples illustrate diverse projects that might be seen as models which have economic benefits when land is utilised as a natural resource by women.

In terms of the link between sustainable development and social protection, one considers the definition of social protection and that of sustainable development as, for instance, defined by Holzmann and Jorgensen (2000). Holzmann and Jorgensen (2000) define social protection *"as public interventions which are meant to assist individuals, households and communities to manage risk better and provide support to the critically poor."*

Having considered the definition of social protection and then that of sustainable development, one is in a position to recognise that a well-managed use of land has the potential to provide considerable economic relief for women. It would require a widespread integration of efforts in, for instance, training and education, health, and economic empowerment, all of these being critical aspects in the development and economic mainstreaming of women. Kemp, Parto and Gibson (2005) state that, sustainability is about transitional and long-term integration: the pursuit of all the requirements for sustainability at once, seeking commonly supportive benefits. The above references seem to relate appropriately to an integrated approach which the South African government needs to see as crucial in the midst of the current socio-economic challenges.

2.5.4.1.   Building the capacity of women for sustainable development

According to Al-Roubaie (2013), knowledge is among the important determinants of the kind of building capacity needed to sustain development. In this research, it is suggested that allowing access to natural resources for women without any relevant

building of capacity might not yield the desired results and that capacity-building is key in order for women to benefit from sustainable development.

Capacity-building is defined in multiple ways, however, the meaning of the term in the context of women and sustainable development goes beyond education and training. According to the Institute for Lifelong Learning in UNESCO (2014), the environmental dimension of sustainable development was discussed in terms of not only single approach however, on both hard and soft skills, capacity which is critical for a green economy, skills which are generally required to develop co-operatives, promote indigenous knowledge, and are critical in ensuring sustained, inclusive and equitable growth. Similarly, Mogaladi (2007) quotes Sessions (1993:1) when defining capacity-building as *"helping governments, communities and individuals to develop the skills and expertise needed to achieve their goals"*. He further states that capacity-building is also defined as, the ability of individuals, organisations or systems to perform appropriate functions effectively, efficiently and in a sustainable way, and that it is clear that capacity-building initiatives should be holistic so as to achieve sustainable development.

The views reflected above encompass economic development, yet for some, the literal meaning of capacity-building may solely be formal education and training. Another dimension highlighted in the above understanding of capacity-building is the ability of women to learn and work as a group for economic benefits. This provides an opportunity for many instead of single individuals, thus uplifting a level of society in a short space of time, since knowledge and effort are being shared.

Another critical dimension in capacity-building in the context of sustainable development is the management of natural resources for the economic benefit of future generations. This is critical because further degradation of already over-utilised land would be counter-productive and disastrous for the environment. The apartheid government systems congested black citizens in small areas of land that were consequently over-utilised, while many hectares were reserved for recreational

activities for the minorities. The apartheid era with its environmental reservations created more poverty and resulted in further degradation of natural resources like land. With a necessary emphasis on capacity-building, the true meaning of sustainable development will emerge in terms of adequate knowledge and shared understanding by the beneficiaries.

With reference to the degradation of natural resources and widespread lack of understanding, Aliber (2002) states that the interface between poverty and the environment is complex and multi-layered, often appearing as self-perpetuating cycles or escalating downward spirals, with many poor South Africans occupying inferior land on which they attempt to eke out a living and consequently contributing to the downgrading of their environment. The impoverished environment exacerbates the prevailing poverty, which in turn puts more pressure on the environment.

Of importance, Aliber (2002), is of the view that sustainable development should be understood *"as a pattern of relations among people, and between people and the environment, that will ensure future development and not undermine it."* It is argued that this requires relevant acquisition of skills so that the environment will be preserved for the advantage of both the current users and for generations to come.

An argument is advanced that capacitating women for sustainable development can almost be equated with capacitating the society. This is because the nation as a whole will benefit in that there will be huge benefits for the masses, many of whom have enormous domestic and economic responsibilities, but lack the means to cope with them. The United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO) (2012) says that "when women become self-sufficient, they are able to provide for their families with better opportunities and are able to contribute to development at the community level."

2.5.4.2   Women and economic empowerment

In this research project, it is argued that empowering women for independence by ensuring effective social protection cannot be separated from economic development. This entails taking advantage of natural resources through strategically organised and effectively implemented and monitored programmes, which is a possible means for reasonable economic elevation of women who are currently on the periphery of society. In other words, an economic mainstreaming of these women is essential.

One of the messages issued by the (UNIDO) (2010:3) is that

> *Economic empowerment cannot be divorced from the care economy. There are several dimensions of empowerment. Economic empowerment can be used to enable other kinds of empowerment (social, political, cultural), as well as the other way around. Education, both formal and non-formal, is key to women's economic empowerment. In addition, social protection can be economically empowering and socially transformative.*

In the same vein, Kabeer (2012:9) quotes from a paper by SIDA which sees *women's economic empowerment as a process which increases women's real power over economic decisions that influence their lives and priorities in society.* He suggests that *women's economic empowerment can be achieved through equal access to and control over critical economic resources and opportunities, and the elimination of structural gender inequalities in the labour market, including a better sharing of unpaid care work.* While the above definition of women's economic empowerment is from the labour angle, the emphasis in this regard is on the issue around equal access to and control over critical resources, as women normally face difficulties when it comes to issues of access and control over resources, such as access land, access to loans through banks, and training and development for capacitation and project management.

With reference to access and adequate control over critical resources, empowering women for sustainable development cannot be over-emphasised. Warth and Koparanova (2012), in their discussion paper, Empowering Women for Sustainable Development, mention that, "empowerment can be defined as a multi-dimensional social process that helps people gain control over their own lives. They see it as a process that fosters power (that is, the capacity to implement) in people, for use in their own homes, their communities and their society by acting on issues that they define as important (quoting *Czuba, 1999)."* The foregoing envisions an ideal society in which people are self-reliant, seeking their own solutions to problems they encounter. It, therefore, seems that for sustainable development to emerge as a solution, women require a reasonable level of economic empowerment in order to be effective and able to bring about an intervention.

Gorostiaga et al. (2011:1) state that

> *We know that women are critical to economic growth and community stability. Research has also shown that women earning an income are more likely than men to invest in the education, nutrition, and health of their children.*

The above quotation seems to suggest that the economic empowerment of women remains critical as one economically empowered woman provides for many, thus potentially easing the load on the shoulders of government.

As already stated, the current government initiatives, such as government social grants, including Child Support Grant, Old Age Pension and Expanded Public Works Programmes (EPWP)(a temporary employment for unskilled citizens), National Youth Development Agency, Internship Programmes for unemployed graduates, and so on, are appreciated. However, these are perceived as not sustainable and, therefore, not permanent solutions to the current economic challenges.

Lekezwa (2010), states that, the relative effect of social grants on the complexity of poverty in 2011 was 23%, and on severity of poverty was 27%." He notes that, social grants made a significant contribution compared with the impact on headcount, which means that social grants make a remarkable impact in reducing the severity of poverty and the depth of poverty by pushing individuals closer to the poverty line relative to their share of income.

Based on the above means test, it remains a widely held view that dependency on government through social security initiatives should be reduced where possible at some point and gradually replaced by economic development programmes which will eventually lead to an economically viable society able to provide for its families and contribute to the country's Growth Domestic Product (GDP). One acknowledges that government cannot alone take responsibility for the empowerment of women so as to ensure social protection. Therefore, there should be a multi-layered approach, a joining of hands, so to speak, in order to reach towards the vital goal of bridging the widening gap between males and females in terms of ownership of resources for economic gains in this democratic state.

2.5.4.3   Women and access to land

Writing on the value that land holds in relation to the economic empowerment of women, Moeng (2011) states that evidence from across the world's main regions confirms that there is link between land policy and economic growth, also between poverty reduction and empowerment. Access to land is considered to be of major importance to both males and females as land can be utilised for many beneficial purposes, from housing to agriculture. In terms of this research, access to land is critical for the economic empowerment of women and for their sustainable social protection.

Consequently, Mutangadura (2004) asserts that land is considered the most fundamental resource relating to women's living conditions, economic empowerment

and, to some extent, their struggle for equity and equality. She further mentions that, more than 60% of women in Southern Africa are dependent on land for their livelihoods, and that, despite the importance of land to women in the sub-region, their land rights are still largely discriminated against.

Similarly, Odeny (2013:3) says:

> *Land is an important source of security against poverty across the continent and developing world, unequal rights to land put women at a disadvantage, perpetuate poverty, and entrench gender inequality in Africa. Gender has become a critical issue in women's land rights due to the fact that there is a direct relationship between accessing land resources, having secured land rights, achieving food security and overcoming poverty. Women produce more than 80% of the food in Africa, yet they own only 1% of the land (SOFA, 2011). Therefore improving women's access to land and control over land is crucial to socio-economic development of Africa.*

The significance of access to land for economic empowerment is, thus, of paramount importance. However, one notes the challenges that are faced by women in terms of access to land. Their chronic vulnerability to poverty has partly to do with *"lack of access to land."* Among the contributory reasons for this are cultural barriers, patriarchy, access to capital, and imposed inferiority. Laws on land reform and policies are in place, but statistics reveal that women do not enjoy the same access to land as do males in South Africa. Mutangadura (2004) observes that despite the role played by women in agricultural production in Southern Africa, they continue to face discrimination in accessing and owning land. He further reports that most women in the sub-region have access to farmland only through their husbands or fathers as they are granted only usufructuary rights because land title passes through the male line.

South Africa is no exception in terms of women and access to land, particularly in the KwaZulu-Natal province, as it is mainly rural and infested with cultural beliefs and male supremacy over women. These further lead to inferiority being imposed on women, which literally means further oppression even when their rights are enshrined in the

Constitution. O'Connell (2015) states that the inequality women and girls experience in family and kinship relationships is based on social norms, beliefs and customs and is mirrored in the discrimination inherent in the market and other economic institutions.

Similarly, Moeng (2011) is of the view that women's access to land is feared from an empowerment and economic perspective because men are regarded as the economic providers and, owing to patriarchal beliefs, women are regarded as dependent on their husbands for sustenance. This is significant when one considers the current male domination in terms of ownership of resources, which leads to the notion that some sectors are 'no go' areas for women. This is central to the high rate of dependency even for basic needs for daily survival. Women are of fundamental importance in the agricultural sector but primarily as labourers. In this context, sustainable development is one theory that seems appropriate for the necessary steps to be taken towards the goal of the economic mainstreaming of women.

O'Connell (2015) provides crucial statistics when she points out that *"on average, women reinvest 90% of their income in their families and communities, compared with 30% to 40% reinvested by men. She further states that when 10% more girls attend school, a country's GDP increases on average by 3%."* Without suggesting that efforts should be redirected only at women at this point, it would be logical to view sustainable development, in conjunction with other interventions, as one of the means for a breakthrough. Statistics reinforce the urgency of increased social protection for women in this country. Women have the potential to make valuable contributions to society and to the country's GDP. In the same vein, Warth and Kopanova (2012) are of the view that sustainable development cannot be achieved without a more equitable distribution of resources, and without dealing with inequalities that are presently gendered. This research seeks to help unravel the perception that there are areas that are the domain of men, and in which women would not cope were they to be exposed to them for their own economic gain.

An economist, Stevens (2010), who writes on sustainable development and women, is of the opinion that much more in the way of statistics, facts and analysis is needed to investigate whether gender equity is the missing link in sustainable development, and an argument is made that it is economic and patriarchal structures that create that myth.

2.5.4.4. Sustainable development: a systems approach

In a systems approach, interconnectedness is emphasised. Sustainable development is mainly about the utilisation of natural resources and the economic benefits accruing to the current population and to future generations.   What has been presented above, therefore, dictates the need for the appreciation and preservation of natural resources, which supports the need for a systems approach to sustainable development. Clearly, the environment and the society are, therefore, regarded as critical elements in sustainable development, as well as the impact on the economy and the benefits of good management.

Pappas (2012) states that it is important to note that, most often, sustainability is considered to be synonymous with environmentalism (or environmental sustainability). He is of the opinion that this limited scope neglects the fact that sustainability must be considered as a system of interdependent factors, and that a change in any one factor is likely to result in unpredictable changes in other factors.

It is, therefore, argued that the essence of a systems approach in sustainable development is to be found in the development of sound policies around sustainable development, the building of capacity within society, particularly relating to women, and in clearly understood and effective implementation processes. All of these are of critical importance. It is argued that a systems approach, with the emphasis on the interconnection of all the sustainable development elements, would have the potential to ensure sustainable social protection for women, while not compromising the benefits required to be protected for future generations.

Against this backdrop, sustainable development theory supports the need to build the capacity of women by ensuring their economic empowerment and supporting their access to land (natural resources). This theory is helpful in responding to the following research questions:

- What could assist in ensuring that social protection for women is sustainably realised in the democratic South Africa?

Soderquist and Overakker (2010), writing in the context of sustainable development, provide an important link between sustainable development and systems thinking in seeing systems thinking as a foundation for effectiveness in implementing policies. They further state that in order to increase the likelihood that policies will achieve a lasting impact on adaptive sustainable development challenges, public policy institutions, the private sector and global citizens need to develop their systems thinking capacity. It will otherwise be extremely difficult to generate higher leverage solutions supportive of sustainability.

2.6   Conclusion

The researcher has considered the core of public administration as a discipline which is mainly about the management of government resources for the satisfaction of the needs of the citizens, taking into account that women form the larger percentage of the citizenry. Further, with government being massive and complex to manage, it is argued that systems thinking remains critical for public sector managers, political office bearers, and all relevant stakeholders, if government is to achieve effective social protection for women. The objectives of this study were to determine whether or not the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government has sustainable women empowerment programmes in place that are both strategic and sustainable. Equally significant, if these programmes do exist, the extent to which they are strategically implemented needs to be established, as well as whether they have the potential to ensure social protection (socio-economic independence) for women.

The study is further aimed at understanding the extent of review by public policy-makers, as well as monitoring and evaluation by government as the implementing agent. This will help in to measuring progress in an effort to meet the needs of women for sustainability and reasonable self-support in the long term.

Against the backdrop of this chapter and taking into account the theories discussed, the next chapter provides the research methodology that was employed in this study, and the design and samples that were used in the process.

CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

3.1   INTRODUCTION

This chapter presents the research methodology and the procedure applied in the course of this study. It further elaborates on the rationale for the selected research method and how the collected data was analysed. Additionally, the chapter outlines the study limitations and the significance of the study.

3.1.1 RESEARCH PROCEDURE AND ETHICAL CLEARANCE

The issue of ethics in research cannot be over-emphasised. At inception, the researcher wrote letters to the Ward Councillors requesting permission to conduct the study. The responses were positive. (*See appendix A.*) Creswell (2009) alludes to the importance of respecting the participants and the sites relating to the study, maintaining that researchers need not put participants at risk. Brief meetings were also held with local leaders in the respective wards. this was useful in developing relevant relationships. As Moeng (2011) also observes while writing on research ethics, the *"enquirer-enquired relationship is important in terms of the trust and confidentiality required for future research endeavours."*

Another meeting was held with the senior manager responsible for youth and women in the Social Development Department for access to records in the form of annual performance plans, annual reports and policies. Ethical clearance was confirmed through a permission letter for this research project issued by the Ethics Committee of the University of KwaZulu-Natal (*See appendix B.*)

Secondary data forms a critical part of the data used in this study. Accordingly, literature review was carried out mainly utilising books, regulations, policies, journals, research articles and documents on social protection, and government strategies concerning economic development and women empowerment. Of importance was the researcher's background as a government employee, and the fact that the researcher happens to be a resident in the eThekwini Metro where the study was conducted. This gave the researcher an advantage in terms of insight into critical issues and areas that required investigation.

Subsequently, questions were formulated for semi-structured interviews as a form of primary data collection (*See Appendix C.).* These guided the interview process, although further probing ensued during the interview process. Appointment dates were secured with all sampled participants. Ethical issues were taken seriously during the data collection process, and the approval letter was presented at all engagements.

3.2   THE AIM OF THE STUDY AND RESEARCH OBJECTIVES

3.2.1 THE AIM OF THE STUDY

This research was on women and social protection in South Africa post-1994. The study focused on the eThekwini Municipality in KwaZulu-Natal, which is one of the nine provinces in the country. The study aimed to establish whether the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government has strategic women empowerment programmes and, if so, whether these programmes are sustainable and properly implemented to ensure effective social protection for women.

The study aimed to understand if the available social protection programmes are linked with the economic empowerment of women, also if the current government strategies are geared towards the betterment of the lives of South Africans, particularly through these social protection programmes. As mentioned in chapter one of this write up, the study found its basis on the statistical information which indicated that, social

proception needs continue to exist post 1994, despite the existing legislation and policies which are meant to ensure improvement in this democratic era.

3.2.2. STUDY OBJECTIVES

The study objectives were:

- To determine whether or not, the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government has in place, social protection programmes that are strategically aligned with women empowerment;

- To establish whether these programmes are strategically implemented, with a view to ensure sustainable social protection;

- To understand and explain the extent of engagement by public policy-makers, as well as public administrators in monitoring and evaluation of social protection programmes for women.

3.3   RESEARCH DESIGN

The study was of a qualitative nature and the researcher opted for a case study technique as this allows for the gathering of holistic and in-depth information in relation to the research area. Leedy and Omrod (1985) cited in Mogaladi (2007), state that a qualitative investigation method focuses on developing social phenomena, and that the qualitative method offers specific advantages to the researcher because it requires one-on-one engagement with the study subjects. It is also stated by Mogaladi (2007) that, *"in a focus group setting, qualitative investigation allows one to understand the research topic at length as well as the kind of richness of information one can gather from the participants."*

In a similar vein, Creswell (2009) notes that *"qualitative research is exploratory and is vital when the researcher does not know significant variables that will need to be examined."* He further states that this approach might be required because a topic has never been explored with certain samples or groups of people, and existing theories do not apply to the particular sample or group under investigation. Issues of social protection and women have been studied before, but not directly from an economic development perspective. This research project, therefore, becomes unique in the sense that the above view by Creswell concerning the case study method and its advantages is applicable to the purposes of this study.

Gaurti *et al*, (1995:87 - 88):

> *… An intensive study of selected examples is a very useful method of gaining insight and suggesting hypotheses for further research. Thus, case studies are often of an exploratory or descriptive nature.*

Equally significant, Yin (2009) elaborates on the logic of a case study. He states that a case study is an experiential inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon in depth and within its real-life context, especially when the boundaries between the phenomenon and context are not clearly evident. He further observes that the central propensity among all types of case study is that this method tries to illuminate a decision or set of decisions, why they were taken, how they were implemented, and with what results. These arguments justified the researcher's choice of case study methodology. Also important is the argument by Remler and van Ryzin (2011) that qualitative method is grounded in the in-depth study of cases, such as people, groups or organisations, so that, in one sense, it would appear that most qualitative research is defined as case study research.

Similarly, Ghauri et al (1995:85), cited in Duma (2012), argue that *"qualitative research is therefore common in social and behavioural sciences, and among practitioners who*

want to understand human behaviour and functions." It is further mentioned in Duma (2012) that this method is fundamental for studying organisations. It is, thus, argued that the qualitative research method was suitable for this research project for effective engagement with participants, as well as the use of primary and secondary sources for data collection, analysis and drawing of conclusions.

In an attempt to emphasise the value of the employment of qualitative research as a method in social sciences, Remler and van Ryzin (2011) argue that it can help to think about qualitative and quantitative approaches as contributing to a cycle of research. However, when confronted with a new social problem or management challenge, such as a breakdown of morale in a work organisation, often the first step is to explore the situation and discover key variables and relationships. They are of the opinion that qualitative research is especially well-suited to such tasks. This supports the employment of a case study method as, in this case study, the key purpose was to study the life experiences and challenges that many women encounter. The qualitative research method was, therefore, found to be more applicable, as much of the information required was possibly not going to be accurately found in written in written documents.

3.3.1   DATA COLLECTION TECHNIQUES

3.3.1.1   COLLECTION OF PRIMARY DATA

Primary data was collected through research questionnaires which were circulated to the identified sample as well as through focus group discussions, using pre-arranged questions to guide the discussions. Remler and van Ryzin (2011) are of the view that "qualitative data can be produced from interviews, focus groups, or other methods of original data collection; however, a great deal of qualitative data already exist in the form of published and unpublished documents, transcripts, testimonies, tape recordings, official records, correspondence, news articles and reports." Thus, individual interviews were conducted with ward councillors, community leaders, managers and officials in the Department of Social Development. The interviews were

over and above the circulated research questions and the purpose was for the researcher to close the identified gaps as some respondents tended to be brief in terms of their responses on the questionnaires.

Furthermore, focus group discussions with women in the two identified wards were also facilitated, and these proved to be a rich source of primary data. Sharp, Peters and Howard (2006) points out that data gathering normally requires some kind of sampling. In this context, as it is not always possible to interview all eligible subjects in research, a sample had to be drawn from the population. Accordingly, three groups from each of the two identified wards (Wards 47 and 54 in eThekwini Municipality) were drawn, each sample comprising women of ages between 20 and 65; that is, women who are categorised as economically active in terms of age. The focus groups were large, that is over 12. This was necessary for the following reasons:-

- The vast age difference of the numbers targeted by the research sample which was 20 – 65;
- The vastness of the entire time of beneficiaries, which is 1994 to 2016;
- The density of the wards.

The questions were manageable in terms of the researcher using focus. Further, a voice recorder was utilised for the researcher to have eye contact throughout the focus group discussions.

3.3.1.2   SECONDARY DATA

Secondary data, in the form of legislation, books, theses, documents, newspapers, journal articles, policies, annual performance plans, annual reports, theses and academic papers formed part of data collection. Diverse written material on women and social protection was utilised to support the primary sources of data. Yin (2009) is of the view that, *"documents are helpful in verifying the correct spellings and titles or names of organisations that might have been mentioned in an interview."* He sees documents as likely to provide other specific details to corroborate information from

other sources. Similarly, Ghauri *et al,* (1995) argues that, *"secondary data provide a comparison instrument with which one can simply interpret and appreciate our primary data."*

Consequently, Yin (2009) is of the view that documents play an explicit role in any data collection involving case studies. Thus, as part of the data collection process, the researcher further employed the documentary study method as this was perceived to have great significance in terms of actual practical experience in programmes and all other related activities within the Department of Social Development, a department that is charged with the social protection responsibility. The records of this department that have been accumulated over the years proved to be quite beneficial in this research area. Moeng (2011) states that, *"there is always a need to refer back before one goes forward, because lessons can be learned from past experience."*

Consequently, departmental strategic documents which included strategic planning documents, annual performance plans, operational plans, annual reports and policies were, therefore, part of this analysis. A comparison was made utilising annual reports against the set targets in annual performance plans. Further, related legislation which informs the mandate of the department and policies which are meant to provide guidance in terms of programmes and implementation were analysed in the context of the research area. These became critical in the sense that such documents should be translated into actual programmes. The documents were able to provide insight in terms of operating procedures, progress and challenges encountered, as well as revealing areas that require attention moving forward.

In addition, eThekwini Municipality's strategic documents, which included the spatial development plans, integrated development as and the Durban Informal Economy Policy were also sourced and analysed in the context of this study. These provided relevant insights in terms of planning, budgeting and progress that has been made over the years, and further provided relevant information around the socio-economic status of the citizens of this metro.

In qualitative research, data can be collected using multiple sources and methods. It is, therefore, important to note that documentary study forms a critical part of collecting secondary data. For instance, Remler and van Ryzin (2011) state that *"documents also represent an important and widely valuable form of existing qualitative data for more contemporary issues and problems."* In a similar vein, Sharp *et al* (2006) argue that, *"in many fields technical reports can be a major source of information. It may well be, therefore, that the more complete account given in a technical report will be of greater use to the researcher than journal articles on the subject."* Furthermore, the reports of certain research bodies, such as the World Bank, are from sufficiently prestigious sources for researchers to favour them as a method. On this basis, a contention is made that the strategic planning documents, annual performance plans, operational plans and annual reports have immense value in complementing data gathered through interviews and academic literature in research.

It is worth noting that some authors do warn of shortcomings around the utilisation of documents when conducting academic research. Remler and van Ryzin (2011) go to the extent of cautioning that some documents which are accessible and utilised for research purposes might not have undergone peer review and should be treated as preliminary, even though they may provide a very up-to-date picture of what is happening in a field. A precise caution is further offered by Yin (2009:105):

> *At the same time, many people have been critical of the potential overreliance on documents in case study research. This is probably because the casual investigator may mistakenly assume that all kinds of documents including proposals for projects or programs contain the unmitigated truth.*

It should be noted that official and other documents are not meant for academic purposes and that, in most cases, they are meant for practical implementation of responsibilities. Hlathi (2000:30) cited in Duma (2012) mentions that "documentary study falls short in that it does not provide a broader view of the issues in their holistic context in the sense that what is recorded is a part reflection of what is discussed,

either in meetings or at certain gatherings, and therefore represents the views of those involved in such deliberations" (Duma: 2012).

3.3.1.2   POPULATION AND SAMPLING PROCEDURES

Considering that the research project was based on social development-in terms of government administration, a sample of officials from the Social Development Department in KwaZulu-Natal was also identified and interviewed. According to the Social Development Department's 2014/15 Annual Performance Plan, the department has five structural programmes which are Administration, Social Welfare Services, Children and Families, Restorative Services, and Development and Research. According to the document, women's issues fall under the fifth programme, which is Development and Research, under the Women Development directorate. Thus, the selected sample included one official from the office of the Executing Authority for a political leadership perspective in the department and five core function managers: a chief director, two programme managers and two senior officials from the operational level.

In addition, ten administrators who are directly in charge of operations and execution of programmes in the local area, and who report to Head Office on local operations, were interviewed for their experiences and views concerning the actual rolling out of programmes in local areas. This was intended to test the link between planning and implementation in terms of strategic direction and implementation of programmes at an operational level. Based on the organisational structure and the current staff establishment under the chief directorate, the identified sample constituted 20% of the population of the chief directorate. To be specific, the Inanda Regional office has a total of forty-six social workers and community development officers, including the manager and supervisors, and a total of twelve participated in this study, in addition to the senior managers of the head office.

In terms of the selection of the sample from the community, a stratified random sampling technique was employed in an effort to ensure a fair representation of all categories in terms of age and exposure to social protection issues in the wards. In addition, the local leadership was instrumental in the identification of the sample as all. Sharp *et al* (2006) state that *"a frequently adopted procedure for assessing the randomness of a sample is to check how representative it is by comparison with information known about the population."* Accordingly, existing information on the population assisted in verifying the effectiveness of representation. This sample comprised three groups of women in Ward 47, with a fair representation of age categories, that is, not below twenty and not above sixty-five. Three groups of women of the same age categories were sampled in Ward 54.

3.3.1.2.1   ONE ON ONE QUESTIONNAIRES AND GROUP INTERVIEWS

In case study research, multiple sources are utilised for data collection as triangulation is critical for validation purposes. Ghauri *et al* (1995) mention that *"through triangulation we can improve the accuracy of judgements and results by collecting data through different methods or collecting different kinds of data on the subject matter of our study."* Further, Yin (2009:115-116), writing on case study research and triangulation, states that,

> *The use of multiple sources of evidence in case studies allows an investigator to address a broader range of historical and behavioural issues. However, the most important advantage presented by using multiple sources of evidence is the development of converging lines of inquiry, a process of triangulation and corroboration.*

Similarly, Cresswell (2009) emphasises building a coherent justification for research themes through triangulation, mentioning that *"if themes are established on the basis of converging several sources of data or perspectives from participants, then the process can be claimed as adding to the validity of the study."* On the basis of this view, research questionnaires were circulated to the identified sample of employees in the department where the study was conducted. Interviews were conducted as a

method to close all the identified gaps as some of the respondents were brief and unclear in their responses. Interviews are critical in a case study research project as they provide first-hand information in terms of life experiences in the area under investigation.

Sharp *et al* (2006) are of the view that*, "most social scientists would see the interview as providing higher quality information that is likely to be more free from bias than many other methods available to them.* They indicate that indeed*, in a new field, a programme of interviews might be the only way of obtaining a realistic picture of the way people perceive it."* The above view points to the richness of information that is obtained through the interview process.

For focus group discussions, research questions were prepared in advance. However, these worked as a guide to the researcher and the process as discussions went beyond the structured interview questions. In essence, semi-structured interviews were the method, as Remler and van Ryzin (2011) confirm that "a good qualitative interviewer does not read from a script". They see "a semi-structured interview guide as a set of open-ended questions, sometimes accompanied by probes that help guide or structure the discussion. Furthermore, they mention that this process helps to ensure that each interview covers substantially the same topics, although the guide is meant to be a flexible tool and not a standardised script."

Clearly, semi-structured interviews allow the researcher to gather even more information as the interviewee is free to express opinions beyond the predetermined questions. As this is a case study project, it is useful to note that Yin (2009) mentions that in case study research, "interviews are guided conversations rather than structured queries. In other words, although one pursues a consistent line of inquiry, one's actual stream of questions is likely to be fluid rather than rigid."

Accordingly, the pre-compiled open-ended questions were posed to the research participants as per *Appendix A* (attached). The reason for the utilisation of pre-determined questions was to ensure uniformity and consistency throughout the interview process. However, to unravel the complexities around the study area, participants were allowed an opportunity to go beyond the set of questions and to express their views according to their own personal experiences. As the research process continued, the researcher would probe further, based on the responses provided, as some responses required further clarifications. This proved useful in providing even more relevant information, which could have been omitted if it were not for the semi-structured nature of the interview process.

For sampling, a stratified random sampling method was employed for the selection of the sample of research participants. Remler and van Ryzin (2011) provide insight as to how stratified random sampling works and state that it assists to ensure even coverage across the groups, including even coverage across geographic regions. In the context of this study, a sample of interviews was selected in the Department of Social Development from the office of the executing authority, senior management, and from operational staff from the regional office. In addition, the community leadership, that is, councillors were interviewed and, most importantly, three groups of women from the two identified wards were engaged through focus group discussions. The composition of focus groups took account of women aged between 20 and 60 for a fair representation, since they were perceived to be in an age group that could be economically active in the sense of being able to take part in economic activities and care-giving in households and community.

Table 3.1 below presents the numbers and groupings of the research participants, and the venues where the interviews took place.

	TABLE	
ONE ON ONE INTERVIEWS	NUMBER	AREA/VENUE

Managers	3	Managers office
Supervisors	2	Supervisors offices
Social Workers and Community Development Officers	10	Respective offices
Community leaders	2	Respective offices
TOTAL	**17**	**Respective offices**
	FOCUS GROUPS	
GROUP	**NO. OF PARTICIPANTS**	**AREA/VENUE**
Group One	23	Ikusasalentsha High School
Group Two	21	Ikusasalentsha High School
Group three	19	Group member's house
Group four	20	Local church hall
Group five	22	Under a tree in the area
Group six	21	Local church hall
TOTAL	**126**	

Table 3.1. grouping of research participants

3.3.2 DATA ANALYSIS

3.3.2.1 THEMATIC ANALYSIS

The credibility of data remains critical in qualitative research. With that background, thematic analysis was key in this research. Braun and Clarke (2006:6) defines thematic analysis as "*a method for identifying, analyzing, and reporting patterns (themes) within data, which minimally organises and describes data in detail*". With the above background, the six thematic steps were applied in the analysis of data.

Figure 1. **THEMATIC ANALYSIS PHASES**

Phase One Becoming familiar with the data	In this phase, the researcher transcribed the audio-recorded data, read and re-read. Further, the researcher read and re-read the notes which were taken during the interaction. During this process, the researcher was able to familiarize herself with all the aspects of the collected data.
Phase Two Generating initial codes	As the researcher was already familiar with the collected and read data, preliminary codes were generated. Relevant extracts were identified and combined according to related themes.
Phase Three Searching for themes	The researcher in this phase started examining the collated codes. Data was thus grouped into broad themes.
Phase Four Reviewing themes	This stage allowed the researcher to identify, refine, combine or discard themes as this process assisted in terms of the confirmation of coherence.
Phase Five Defining and naming themes	This phase allowed the researcher to refine and define themes within the data. This assisted the process in terms of the clear focus of the analysis, naming the themes succinctly.
Phase Six Producing a report	At this stage, the researcher was able to write and present the research report. In this process, the researcher was using extracts, guided by the research questions, linked with themes and literature. This process assisted the researcher in terms of putting across an undoubted research report.

3.4   LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

3.4.1   DIRECT ENGAGEMENTS PROVIDING IN-DEPTH UNDERSTANDING

Case study research has a potential for in-depth understanding of issues around the area of study. The richness of information through interviews and direct engagements with participants guarantees effective primary data collection. A contention is made that findings drawn from a case study are for a specific phenomenon, thus cannot be generalised to other cases. Similarly, participants have a tendency to relate to personal experiences which are relevant to the case that is being investigated. These personal experiences can, however, not be generalised as applicable in all cases.

Case study research has a potential to generate rich information despite this limitation. With particular reference to this study, direct engagements with staff from the Department of Social Development and community members, provided invaluable understanding of the practical experiences on the ground in relation to women and social protection.   The above provided insight in terms of theory versus practical experiences.

3.4.2   TIME

Another limitation in case study research relates to the time involved, as direct engagement with participants requires sufficient time to allow for different views and for further probing during the interview process, despite the pre-determined questions. This is due to the richness of information which can lead to extended interview time and therefore affects the time allocated for the data collection process. It became critical for the researcher to manage time well and keep to the schedule so as to ensure that the writing and reporting time was not affected.

3.4.3 POLTICAL INFLUENCES

Of significance is the fact that political influences within communities are a major concern as local leaders are watchful in their political constituencies. A researcher might appear to be questioning the current administration and its policy direction, while the research is actually independent and academic. In the case of the present study, producing evidence that the study was purely academic through a letter of approval from the academic institution was of paramount importance. However, once trust was gained, the data collection process continued without any setbacks.

3.5   SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY

The study began from the premise that post-1994, with the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996) promising human dignity, the achievement of equality, human rights and freedom, and all the relevant legislation and policies, the gaps between men and women in terms of economic development should, by now, have been eradicated. Consequently, the study drew its significance from the literature relating to social protection and women post-1994. The background literature further covered the significance and sustainability of government programmes on women's economic empowerment needed for economic independence.

The study presents its objective as being to determine whether or not the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government has aligned, strategic, sustainable women empowerment programmes in place. Equally significant, if such programmes do exist, the intention was to establish the extent to which they are strategically implemented and whether or not they have the potential to ensure the social protection (socio-economic independence) of women. Accordingly, the objective of the study is to examine the real phenomenon, with the aim of coming up with an academically-grounded breakthrough which has a likelihood of supporting informed decision-making moving forward.   It is contended that, with strategically-aligned programmes, systemic roll-outs of the designed programmes and effective monitoring and evaluation, there is a

real likelihood that the economic mainstreaming of women could eventually be realised.

3.6 CONCLUSION

This chapter outlined the research methodology employed in this study. It further outlined the research procedure and limitations of the study, as well as the significance of the study. The chapter that follows focuses mainly on the mandate of the Social Development Department in KwaZulu-Natal, its strategies, programmes and targets, as well as an analysis of annual reports of the sample of financial years.

CHAPTER FOUR

DOCUMENTARY STUDY

4. INTRODUCTION

This chapter focuses on the mandate of the Department of Social Development as the custodian of social security in the KwaZulu-Natal Provincial Government. It is in this department that the social protection responsibility directly resides. The analysis of documents in relation to the services rendered by the KwaZulu-Natal Social Development Department in KwaZulu-Natal, focused on the plans and delivered outcomes for 2012/13, 2013/14 and 2014/15 financial years respectively. It also provides a brief analysis in terms of the deduction whether the department, through the design and delivery of its programmes, has in place coordination mechanisms to ensure that the available programmes are systematically responsive to the social protection needs of women. The chapter further provides background information on the eThekwini Municipality, analysing the socio-economic needs of its population, economic development, infrastructure, goals and targets, and providing some general information concerning the population, households and their standards of living as the municipality level in the three tiers of government, happens to be the level where the actual service delivery occurs.

The focus was on Inanda, Ntuzuma and KwaMashu (INK), particularly Wards 47 and 54, where the study was sampled. As part of the study, documents that articulate the strategic direction of the provincial Social Development Department in the form of Annual Performance Plans, Annual Reports, the eThekwini Municipality Integrated Development Plan, and the Spatial Development Framework are analysed. In addition to the above, eThekwini Municipality's strategic and economic development planning documents, reports and other related documents form part of this documentary study. These are analysed in an effort to bring to the fore the overall economic stand of the municipality, and plans going forward. Information was also sourced from documents

which include, but are not limited to, the National Development Plan, Provincial Growth and Development Strategy as well as reports from Statistics South Africa in terms of census and Citizen Satisfaction Survey.

4.1 MANDATE OF THE DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT IN KWAZULU-NATAL

The provincial Department of Social Development exists as part of the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government, as provided for in Chapter 6 of the South African Constitution, of 1996. According to the Department of Social Development Annual Performance Plan of 2014-2015, this department draws its legislative mandate from various pieces of legislation which are linked to the Constitution, the supreme law of the country, particularly S 27, which *"provides for the right of access to social assistance to those who are unable to provide for themselves."* These source documents also include the following:

- Public Service Act, No. 103 of 1994;
- National Welfare Act, No. 100 of 1978;
- Social Assistance Act, No. 59 of 1992;
- Social Work Act, No. 102 of 1998;
- Social Services Professions Act, No. 110 of 1978
- Children's Act, No. 13 of 2000;
- Older Person's Act, No. 13 of 2006;
- White Paper on Social Welfare, 1997

The South African government has three spheres, based on the Constitution. De Villiers (2008) puts it clearly when he quotes S 40 (1) of the Constitution which states that the national, provincial and local spheres of government are distinctive, interdependent and interrelated. The above is clarified in an effort to demonstrate that the national Social Development Department exists to provide guidelines in terms of norms and standards, policy frameworks and directives. The provincial departments

take full charge of programmes and implementation thereof. Furthermore, local government, in the form of municipalities, then becomes the face of government, as this is the lowest sphere where the interaction between government and the citizens takes place. The analysis of documents in this chapter, therefore, goes beyond the provincial level in terms of plans, budget and expenditure with respect to social protection in the province of KwaZulu-Natal (KZN).

As indicated in Chapter Two, social protection refers to safety nets, which the National Development Plan (2013) conceptualises as a multipronged strategy to provide a social floor, by way of which government should ensure that no household lives below this level. Emphasising the evolution and conceptualisation of social protection, Scott's (2012) quotation provides a precise definition of social protection as a concept which *"originates from the idea of the state as a provider and protector of citizens, which enjoyed a rich history in Western Europe in the post-World War II period. Scott states that social protection was originally limited to supporting people in managing and mitigating shocks and during periods of heightened vulnerabilities, but in the last two decades social protection discussions have expanded to encompass four types of interventions: protective (recovery from shocks); preventative (mitigating risks in order to avoid shocks); promotive (promoting opportunities); and transformative (focusing on underlying structural inequalities which give rise to vulnerability)."*

The Department of Social Development is the lead department in terms of social protection. Thus, the concept of social protection as articulated above, as well as the expectations on the part of the citizens, leads to a consideration of the statement made by this lead department in its 2014/15 annual report that, "based on its mandate, the Social Development Department develops and implements programmes for the eradication of poverty, and for social protection and social development among the poorest of the poor and the most vulnerable and marginalised." In the above statement, the department spells out the crucial focus of its existence and the response that is required in terms of programmes that should be designed in response to the social protection needs.

4.1.1 Vision and Mission of the Department of Social Development in KwaZulu-Natal

According to the KZN Department of Social Development Annual Performance Plan for 2012-2013, the vision of the department is to enhance the quality of life through an integrated system of Social Development Services, while its mission states that the department is committed to the promotion of developmental social welfare services and community development to people in KwaZulu-Natal, in partnership with stakeholders.

In an effort to test whether the design of service delivery programmes and implementation is in line with the vision and mission of the department, to determine what the department aspires to in its strategic documents, annual reports for three consecutive years (2012/13, 2013/14 and 2014/15) were analysed against the set objectives. Primarily, the purpose of the analysis was to ascertain the alignment of the strategy of the department: designed programmes as well as its deliverables. Further, analysis intended to ascertain whether the types of support provided by the department were sustainable and able to meet the needs of the people, and whether the provided support was empowering to the recipients or inadvertently perpetuated dependency.

4.1.2 Women Empowerment-related Programmes rolled out in 2012/13, 2013/14 and 2014/15 Financial Years.

It is crucial to note that the budgetary system in government establishes financial reporting according to programmes and then directorates built under the structured budgetary programmes, under which services are delivered. Those are referred to as sub and sub-sub programmes or directorates and sub-directorates. In terms of the 2012/13 Annual Report, the department had three financial reporting programmes. Programme One was Administration, which was responsible for the overall administration in the department; that is, the office of the head of department,

corporate services and finance and supply chain management services. Programme Two was responsible for Social Welfare Services. This was where all core-related sub and sub-sub programmes resided. Programme Three was responsible for Development and Research, and was where youth-related programmes resided.

The analysis revealed that, in both 2012/13 and 2013/14 financial years, these two programmes encompassed sub-programmes (directorates) which had a direct responsibility in terms of the actual roll-out of services to the citizens in the province. These services are presumed to have been responding more to women-related issues, as reflected in Chapter One of this paper. Further, within Social Welfare Services, the analysis showed that, of all the sub-programmes that were designed to respond to the socio-economic needs of the KZN citizenry, there were two critical directorates that had some relevance to women's needs, and these were Social Relief and Families, sub-programmes which would have directly and indirectly benefited women. The Development and Research programme focused more on youth support and then monitoring and research.

Consequently, in the 2014/15 financial year, the department had five budgetary programmes, and these were captured in the KZN Department of Social Development Annual Performance Plan (APP) (2014/15), as follows:

- *Programme One*: Administration, which is responsible for the overall governance and provision of the strategic direction in the department
- *Programme Two*, Social Welfare Services
- *Programme Three*: Children and Families
- *Programme Four*: Restorative Services
- *Programme Five*: Development and Research. Built into this programme, was a sub-programme responsible for women development. As highlighted in the 2014/15 APP, the broad "objective of this sub-programme was to create an environment to help women develop constructive, affirmative and sustainable relationships while concurrently providing opportunities for them to build their

competencies and needed skills to engage as partners in their own development and that of their communities."

The 2013/14:17 Annual Report clearly indicates that

> *in the 2014/15 financial year, the department increased the number of programmes from 3 to 5. The changes in programmes will be applicable to all Provincial Departments of Social Development.*

The above seeks to provide the basis upon which the change in terms of the budgetary structure of programmes was made. The above further seems to indicate that this was a national change which would have been applicable across provinces, which would therefore lead to an assumption that the needs on the ground would have informed the increase in the interest of improved social services.

In addition to the change concerning the budgetary structure, the 2013/14 Annual Report further indicated the design of a new sub-programme called Women Development under Programme 5. The Women Development programme would be implemented in the forthcoming financial year; that is, 2014/15. The 2013/14 report states that

> *…in the coming financial year, the social development sector has established a sub-programme for women development. This sub-programme will ensure that the department implements the principles universally accepted for women development.*

As per this above statement, the report goes further to capture the principles as follows:

- *Establishment of high level corporate leadership for gender equality*

- *Treatment of all women and men fairly at work: respect and support human rights and non-discrimination*

- *Ensuring of the health, safety and well-being of all women and men workers*

- *Promotion of education, training and professional development for women*

- *Implementation of enterprise development, supply chain and marketing practices that empower women*

- *Promoting of equality through community initiatives and advocacy*

- *Measuring and publicly reporting of progress to achieve gender equality.*

It is to be noted that, in terms of the 2012/13 and 2013/14 financial year reports, there was no specific programme designed for women development. However, women would have benefited as part of families or groups of distressed individuals who participated in other programmes. The above deduction is further based on the non-specific statistics on gender, age categories for beneficiaries, and the kinds of relief provided.

On the basis of the annual reports of consecutive financial years in terms of programmes, sub-programmes and sub-sub-programmes, it was evident that there were three sub-programmes (directorates) that were designed to respond to the needs on the ground in both 2012/13 and 2013/14 financial years. These are Social Relief, Families and Sustainable Livelihoods. The fourth sub-programme which seemed to have been designed to respond directly to the needs of women was designed in 2013/14 and implemented in the 2014/15 financial year. The four mentioned sub-programmes are analysed below.

4.1.2.1.   Social Relief

The 2012/13 Annual Performance Plan indicated that the strategic objective for the social relief sub-programme was "to provide temporal relief to distressed individuals, and the key performance indicator was the number of individuals who benefited from the social relief of distress programme." The target for the year was 32677 individual

beneficiaries. However, the actual validated output was 35756, a figure which confirmed a positive variation.

In the 2013/14 financial year report, the strategic objective had remained the same, as well as the key performance indicator. However, the target had increased to 33267. The validated output confirmed a negative variation as the output was 33134, which was a low percentage difference. Again, it was noted in the 2013/14 financial year report that there had been a review on the key performance indicators, as a new one had been added, and it was captured as the "number of vulnerable households accessing nutritious food through Department of Social Development (DSD) programmes." The target for the above-mentioned added key performance indicator was 18717, and the validated output was 11556, which was a negative variation.

The 2014/15 APP provided further clarity regarding the social relief sub-programme that was designed "to respond to emergency needs identified in communities affected by disasters not declared, and/or any other social condition resulting in undue hardship." The APP went further to indicate that part of the programme was to "provide counselling and support to affected individuals and families; develop care plans for short, medium and long-term interventions; and provide financial and material assistance to individuals or households directly or via suitable and approved service delivery partners."

Significantly, in the 2014/15 APP, the strategic objective had been slightly reviewed. The word 'temporal' had been removed and replaced by the word 'emergency' in the strategic objective. However, the key performance indicator had not been reviewed. The target for the "number of beneficiaries who benefited from Social Relief of Distress programmes was 35 630, and the actual validated output was 37206." This indicated a positive variation, which clearly meant an even increased benefit by those who were distressed in that particular financial year. It was noted that the key performance indicator which had been added in the 2013/14 APP had again been removed.

However, it is to be noted that there had been a drastic change in terms of the service delivery structure.

4.1.2.2   Care and Support Services to Families

On a broader scale, the 2014/15 APP clearly indicated that the above-mentioned sub-programme fell under Programme Three which was Children and Families, and its purpose was "to provide comprehensive child and family care and support services to communities, in partnership with stakeholders and civil society organisations." The analysis appreciated the relevance of care and support to families on the basis of the widely-held view that women are mostly the heads of families. Broken and dysfunctional family structures, therefore, have an impact in terms of poverty and exposure of women to chronic dependency on government for daily survival. However, statistics in this part of the analysis were not critical, as they were mainly on children as beneficiaries, while the study is on women and their economic empowerment for sustainable development and economic independence. For purposes of this research, the main focus was on the strategic objective of this sub-programme.   In terms of the 2014/15 Annual Report, this sub-programme was designed for the promotion and maintenance of functional families, also for the prevention of vulnerability.   The programme further entailed evidence- based management and information support in terms of research on the extent of vulnerability in families, as well as monitoring and evaluation of service delivery partners.

4.1.2.3   Women Development

It is crucial to mention that in the 2012/13 and 2013/14 financial years, there was no reporting specifically for women development. As it has been stated above, the women development sub-programme came into existence in 2013/14; therefore, activities in relation to women development were implemented and reported in the 2014/15 financial year. Most importantly, it should be noted that women had been beneficiaries

as part of the communities in terms of social welfare services and the rest of the departmental service delivery programmes.

The 2014/15 APP clearly indicated that the objective for the women development sub-programme was to create an environment to help women to develop constructive, affirmative and sustainable relationships while concurrently providing opportunities for them to build their competencies and needed skills to engage as partners in their own development and that of their communities. The performance indicator was the number of women participating in socio-economic empowerment programmes. The target for the 2014/15 financial year was 2 749. This begged the question, what informed this target, considering that the province is wide, with many women in need development for sustainable economic empowerment. As noted above, the outcome in terms of the 2014/15 financial year Report indicated a high number of women beneficiaries, the figure being 11 971 women who participated in socio-economic empowerment programmes. The report indicated the 9 222 variance.

The researcher noted that the Annual Report did not provide any clear impact or sustainability of the designed programme which would have given some indication of whether the programme had yielded the desired outcome. The observed lack of clear reporting left the reader in the dark owing to the absence of a narrative to the report.

4.1.2.4 Sustainable Livelihoods

The 2014/15 Annual Performance Plan notes that the objective of this sub-programme is to manage social facilitation and poverty for sustainable livelihood programmes, including Expanded Public Works Programme, and entailed the following:

- Intervention programmes and services
- Food for all; for instance, food parcels, soup kitchens, drop-in centres, etc., also including social cooperatives and income-generating projects

- Community food security, which included community education and awareness, providing support to vulnerable groups, and also promoting local food production and consumption of healthy foods
- Lastly, the programme included women empowerment programmes.

The 2012/13 Annual Report revealed that this programme in the year under review had four key performance indicators, the first one being the number of households profiled. The target for this key performance indicator was 24 649, and the validated outcome was 82 278. The second key performance indicator was the number of communities profiled, and the target for the year was 645, while the validated output was way above this at 1572. It was noted that the two key performance indicators were almost similar, the difference being the profiling of individual households in one and the profiling of communities in the other.

The third key performance indicator appeared to have been the number of poor households participating in food production programmes, the target for the year being 5155. The actual validated output was 3913, which confirmed a negative variation. The narrative provided was that it was owing to inaccurate targeting. The fourth key performance indicator was the number of households accessing food through community development initiatives. The report revealed that this was a newly-designed indicator, and the target was 9356, while the validated output was 8089, which was below target. The researcher noted the almost similar key performance indicators and unclear targeting in the 2012/13 Annual Report.

The 2013/14 Annual Report revealed that first two key performance indicators had remained unchanged; however, the targets were reduced. The third key performance indicator in the year under review was the number of NPOs (Non Profit-making Organisations) that were assisted with registration, the target being 1948. The validated outcome was 2513. The fourth key performance indicator was the number of NPOs capacitated according to the capacity-building guideline, the target being 2404, while the validated outcome was 3460. The third key performance indicator seemed quite relevant in the sense that NPOs are a critical support to government

initiatives in many respects, including social development programmes, owing to capacity and outreach on the part of government.

The 2014/15 Annual Report depicted a major shift from the previous years in terms of key performance indicators. It was noted that the profiling of poor individual households and communities was still in existence. However, some had been moved to the Research sub-programme, while others were further reviewed. The first key performance indicator was then the number of poverty reduction projects supported through capacity-building and/or funding initiatives, the target being 775, and the validated output was 732. The second key performance indicator was the number of people participating in income-generating programmes, and the target for this indicator was 3019. The validated output was 651, which was 21%. The provided narrative was that the focus changed during the year from the establishment of income-generating programmes as a result of the statistics of people requiring access to food. Hence the establishment of Community Nutrition and Development Centres.

The 2014/15 Annual Report did show the number of households accessing food through food security programmes, and the number of people accessing food through feeding programmes (centre-based). This confirmed the claim of deviation from the key performance indicator of income-generating programmes to community nutrition and development centres.

4.1.3 BRIEF ANALYSIS

This study adopts SIDA's description of women economic empowerment which is mentioned in chapter two of this write up, that is "*women's economic empowerment as a process which increases women's real power over economic decisions that influence their lives and priorities in the society*"

The findings in the document analysis is against the backdrop of systems theory, that it can be deduced that, while the documents reveal that there are social protection related programmes in the Department of Social Development in KwaZulu-Natal, it does not appear that the department has the necessary coordination mechanisms in place to ensure a systematic response to women's empowerment ideals. The available programmes appear to be stand-alone and not interlinked. The analysed annual reports suggest that the department is only interested in the number of women targeted, rather than the livelihoods changed.

It has been mentioned that most of the programmes analysed above seemed not to have been specifically designed to respond directly to the needs of women. However, women are considered the main beneficiaries as they are the main caregivers and heads of households in the country, as well as in the province of KwaZulu-Natal. Thus, they were the primary beneficiaries of the analaysed programmes which include,

- the social relief,
- support for families,
- sustainable development,
- women development sub-programmes,

These programmes were analysed in the context of social protection. Thus, the main beneficiaries happen to be women by default and not by design. In other words, while women benefited from these programmes, the programmes were not specifically designed to address the social protection of women. Women only benefited because they are already at the neediest levels of society.

A brief synopsis of the strategy of the department, annual performance plans, programmes, sub-programmes, key performance indicators, and annual reporting, reveals an obsession with statistical reporting, lack of narratives, constant review of key performance indicators, and unrealistic targets, which in some cases were not achieved owing to inaccurate targeting. This was an observation which did not assist

the analysis in terms of testing whether the designed programmes, key performance indicators and targets were assisting the department in terms of striving to achieve its strategic objectives, which is to enhance the lives of the people of KwaZulu-Natal. On the basis of the above analysis, the available programmes were not preventive nor transformative.

It has been mentioned that, in terms of the system of governance in South Africa, there are three spheres of government. However, the governance system emphasises intergovernmental relations. In that regard, Layman (2003:8) writes as follows:

> *Although provinces are "distinctive", they exercise their powers and perform their functions within the regulatory framework set by the national government which is also responsible for monitoring compliance with that framework and, if need be ,intervening when constitutional or statutory obligations are not fulfilled. Municipalities are likewise subject to both the national and provincial regulatory and supervisory powers. It is this relationship of regulation and supervision that defines how the three spheres are "interrelated"; provinces and municipalities exercise their distinctive powers within imposed frameworks and under supervision.*

It was found critical to go beyond provincial administration, because the municipalities, the third sphere of government, have a direct relationship with the citizens, most importantly in terms socio-economic development. Thus, while many social development programmes are planned and delivered by the provincial government, the local government carries specific mandates in the social development of its citizenry. It is to this level of government that the discussion now turns by specifically focusing on eThekwini Municipality.

4.2. BACKGROUND INFORMATION ON eTHEKWINI MUNICIPALITY, PARTICULARLY WARDS 47 AND 54

eThekwini municipality is one of the country's eight metropolitan municipalities, and it is located along the east coast of South Africa within the province of KwaZulu-Natal. Chapter 1 of the Annual Review of the eThekwini Municipality Integrated Development

Plan 2012/13 to 2016/17 indicates that that this municipality covers an area of approximately 2297km square and is home to around 3 442 361 people, a population comprising a diverse society which faces various social, economic, environmental and governance challenges.

In terms of square meterage and population in the wards where the study was sampled, profiles captured in 2011 indicate that Ward 47 of eThekwini Municipality spans an area of 3.1 square kilometres. This ward is home to some 30 923 people, which indicates 9832.1 people per square kilometre. Ward 54 spans an area of 4.2 square kilometres and is home to a population of 31178, which is 7414.0 people per square kilometre. Without providing an in-depth analysis on the square kilometres and the population per ward, the provided statistics, particularly in Wards 47 and 54, suggest a highly populated area beyond capacity compared with other areas within the same municipality. For instance, Ward 20 has a population of 23 537 on 4.2 square kilometres, constituting a total of 5596.5 people per square kilometre. Ward 28 has a population of 23 169 people in 3.3 square kilometres, giving a total of 6942 people per square kilometre.

Attesting to the above observation is the Inanda, Ntuzuma and KwaMashu (INK) Nodal Economic Development Profile (2006), which concluded that the INK area is highly residential, characterised by a shortage of land, and a hilly terrain covered by dense housing. This study further concluded that, "housing in the area is largely formal (52%), while informal housing accounts for 43%, and then traditional housing 5%." It is, however, crucial to note that even the formal housing within INK, particularly in Wards 47 and 54, can be regarded as inadequately formal, as there are formal structures but with very limited square meterage per household, which does not allow for free movement within each residence.

The INK report further indicates that while there is scarcity in terms of availability of the land in the INK area, some tracts of undeveloped land is still existing within KwaMashu and on the outskirts of Inanda. The researcher finds it crucial to add that

some economic development initiatives have taken place since the above INK study was conducted, and some square kilometres of the land which was available at that time have been utilised. For instance, for the construction of a 300m^2 end of a railway station connecting INK with the Durban central area, the construction of a 40 000m^2 shopping centre, Bridge City, which has recently been opened within the INK area and which is said to have created employment opportunities for local people, especially youth, and also a 450-bed provincial hospital which is currently under construction. All these projects have taken up tracts that were available in recent years for the economic development of the INK area. Some of the above economic development projects are still in progress in terms of the finalisation of construction work.

The two mentioned wards form part of Inanda and KwaMashu, a large part of the INK area under eThekwini Municipality. In terms of planned developments, the two wards get included as part of the INK area and not as stand-alone wards in terms of economic development. This INK area is about 25km north of Durban city centre, an area which, according to Township Renewal INK Case Study (undated), covers 9 340ha of land and is home to about 580 000 (18 per cent of Durban's population) in 115 136 households. This case study report further states that INK has one of the largest concentrations of low-income households in South Africa, as almost 77% of households earn less than R1600.00 per month, and only 27% of residents are employed, leaving 73% of the population unemployed. About 43% of the people do not have formal houses, and 70% are under the age of 35, which is the (youth) age of people who are considered as able to be economically active. However, this report gives an indication of a society where unde-development is endemic from all angles, as it mentions that 12% of the INK population have no schooling, 7% have completed primary school education, while 26% have matric, and only 4% have tertiary qualifications.

Alluding to Durban's economy, which generally forms a major part of eThekwini Municipality, Robbins (2005) is of the view that it is essential to examine the economic state of households and individuals as it is at this level that the manner in which citizens experience the economy is most clearly revealed. He says that, in the Durban

context the challenges that are faced in improving regional growth and employment relate to household conditions.

This study is on women and social protection post-1994. It seeks to establish whether the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government, through its programmes, is able to understand and, therefore, provide relevant interventions to the needy, particularly to women who bear the brunt of household responsibilities. With the above factual statistics relating to eThekwini Municipality, where the study was conducted, one turns to the infrastructure development in the area, as economic development can only be realised where there is conducive infrastructure for developmental projects, connections with the outside world, and relevant logistics such as technology and an appropriate level of communication facilities. Raniga and Ngcobo (2014) are of the view that women living in poor communities often initiate sources of revenue collection as a means of supporting themselves and their families. They state that, even though these small-scale livelihood activities supplement the household income, they can never be sufficient. This suggests that there is an urgent need for support for women towards economic independence as heavy responsibilities on the part of women will otherwise continue to exist.

4.2.1 eTHEKWINI MUNICIPALITY INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENT FOR EFFECTIVE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

Infrastructure development is the essential prerequisite for economic development. Consequently, in the context of women and social protection in Wards 47 and 54, which are part of the INK area under eThekwini Municipality, the high poverty and unemployment rates are attributed to the lack of infrastructure development, which ultimately affects economic development in the INK communities. Attesting to the above is Benin Issue Paper on Infrastructure Development and Rural Transformation (2013) which states that, infrastructure is one of the pillars of economic transformation. This paper further indicates that sustainable economic growth often occurs in an environment where there is a meaningful infrastructure, and there is evidence that it reduces inequality in a society. It is thus argued that infrastructure development is key

in the sense that the positive results of economic development benefit every citizen in the area, including women.

Yoshino and Nakahigashi (2000:10) note that

> *Since infrastructure is the capital stock that provides public goods and services, it contributes to production services. At the same time, it improves the living conditions of the general public. Every citizen can consume the same amount of public goods and services. This means that the poor as well as the rich can enjoy the benefits it provides. Thus, the development of infrastructure may be considered a prescription we need for reducing poverty".*

More broadly, Fedderke and Garlick (2008) mention that, "by convention infrastructure is divided into two categories, and these are economic and social." They state that, "the former conventionally includes transport, communications, power generation, water supply and sanitation facilities, while the latter includes educational and health-care facilities, in some cases, cultural and recreational facilities are included." The above categories of infrastructure may be regarded as economic and social. All are, however, critical in the sense that they complement one another. For instance, there is a widely held view that the education system in this country is failing the economy. Fedderke and Garlick (2008) are of the view that educational facilities are defined as social infrastructure. However, they play an important role in generating human capital investment, which is certainly also an economic function and carries important growth implications. Similarly, under the same social infrastructure category, the issue of heath-care facilities is critical, because a healthy society means a healthy and productive workforce, which has huge implications in terms of economic development.

The eThekwini Municipality Economic Development and Job Creation Strategy (2013) indicates that infrastructure challenges relating to roads, freight rail, public transport, sanitation and water are among the most critical factors impacting negatively on the growth of the city. It further alludes to many other challenges which impact negatively on economic growth and includes even the education system that has consistently performed poorly in its ability to meet the requirements of a modern economy. Wards

47 and 54, which are part of the INK area, are not spared in all the listed challenges as they form a substantial part of the broad eThekwini Municipality.

For purposes of this report, the infrastructure analysis focused on roads and transport, water and sanitation, health care and education, as well as public/private partnerships. That is, business infrastructure development, which ultimately plays an important role in economic development in terms of job creation and, thus, in poverty alleviation. This was based on the notion held in this study that, responding to socio-economic needs for women in an area such as eThekwini Municipality, more specifically Wards 47 and 54, requires sufficiently developed infrastructure so as to allow easy access in the delivery of goods and services to help create a healthy and productive society, as well as an educationally aware society, pulling together to support all economic development activities in the area.

4.2.1.1   Roads and transport infrastructure

Peters (2013), writing on the critical importance of roads in economic development, says that *"with traffic congestion challenges, economic growth, and the importance of mobility and accessibility in our country, the developments we have today have exposed the need to unblock bottlenecks that have arisen owing to neglect in the infrastructure development of our transport system."* He further highlights that the transport system is "vital to our way of life, being what connects people with work, schools, family and friends."

Broadly, in terms of roads and transport in the eThekwini Municipality, the focus was more on the transfer of goods and services, as well as with assisting communities to get to their places of employment and to education facilities. In essence, transport contributes to the effective economic development activities.   According to the eThekwini Municipality Spatial Development Framework (2015-16), the "municipality has a comprehensive road network comprising municipal, provincial and national roads. This framework ensures that road and rail networks are well developed, despite

the significant topographical challenges, and the municipality strives to ensure maximum accessibility of goods, services and destination points for residents largely by linking land use and transport."

The main modes of transport in the two wards are taxis, buses and trains. A very small percentage of the community uses private transport in the form of owned vehicles. It is critical to note that Wards 47 and 54 seemed fairly accessible as roads are tarred, notwithstanding the visible status, compared with other areas within the same municipality. This is further informed by the fact that internal roads appeared to be predominantly narrow, and that the quality of road surfacing was marred by evident potholes, which led to a conclusion that roads are not to be up to the required standard. The municipality in its Spatial Development Framework (2015-2016) concedes that the current public transport system is economically inefficient with many services in direct competition with one another, often resulting in unprofitable rail and bus trips and in taxis competing fiercely for passengers on some routes.

Bridge City Rail Link added to the improvement of connection of INK communities with the city centre, which is the main employment destination for INK communities. Train services in the above-mentioned rail link started officially in 2014. The removal of bottlenecks to improve access to the INK area would mean a free flow of goods and services and would assist schooling activities and provide access to basic health care services for the INK community. Fedderke and Garlick (2008) are of the view that inadequate transport infrastructure incurs hypothetically massive costs for firms who must then seek alternative means of transporting both inputs and finished goods.

4.2.1.2   Water and Sanitation

It is an accepted fact that water is a fundamental resource for human well-being, a natural resource which requires sound infrastructure development for preservation. The management of water links the issues of climate, human beings and the environment, while sanitation does a great deal to ensure a healthy and productive

workforce. It is, therefore, inarguable that water and sanitation are critical in ensuring sustainable economic development. Hesselbarth (2005) asserts that the provision of safe drinking water and basic sanitation contributes to sustainable improvements in people's lives in terms of their health and education, which are the prerequisites for productive employment, as well as for the eradication of extreme hunger and the empowerment of women.

The Commission on Sustainable Development Report (CSD) (2004-2005) articulates the benefits of water and sanitation in that the gains from improved water supply, sanitation and water resources management benefit poor people most. The report indicates that, "water resources are critical for increased productivity, and that targeting those who make the greatest economic gains will also achieve the highest marginal benefit on interventions to reduce poverty and bolster economic growth."

With regards to water and sanitation, and infrastructure development, the Benin Issue Paper on Infrastructure Development and Rural Transformation (2013) indicates that, "it would appear that the inadequate access to basic water supply and sanitation services is not rooted in the inadequacy of available water resources, but that the root cause appears to be financial and technological." One could, therefore, argue in the South African context, particularly in rural and semi-rural areas, that financial and technological issues arise mainly from lack of proper budgeting and planning for effective infrastructure development, which affects effective   collection   and preservation of water, and consequently an uninterrupted water supply and proper sanitation services for communities.

A similar view is expressed by an Indian Finance Minister in a quotation by CSD (2004-2005:21) report:

> *Every one of my budgets was largely a gamble on rain. The development of a sound, well-planned stock of water infrastructure is a critical component of economic growth, water resources management and improved access to water*

and sanitation services. Dams and reservoirs, both large and small, provide services such as power generation, flood control and water supply to agricultural and domestic users. These facilities provide opportunities to improve livelihoods, increase incomes and reduce vulnerability.

eThekwini Municipality in its Spatial Development Framework (2015-2016) attributes the current lack of adequate infrastructure, in relation to water supply and sanitation services, to the recent property boom which is said to have placed significant pressure on road and sewer infrastructure, particularly in the northern and western regions, and the inability to expand these systems ahead of growth has to some extent affected this growth. There is an imbalance caused by the un-anticipated property boom. This framework further indicates that over the years, the trend has been mainly based on the availability and cost of land rather than infrastructure cost. This has led to infrastructure backlogs which are associated with high infrastructure cost as these developments are built in inaccessible peripheral locations outside the urban/services edge. Thus, one would argue that only poor planning and budgeting would lead to such results, as housing should, in terms of basic planning and societal fairness, be closely associated with all related amenities at the planning stage, including water supply and sanitation services. The actual situation stated above suggests a reactive approach to service delivery, an approach which has an inbuilt potential for ineffectiveness and results in being more expensive than it could have been at the time of the construction of houses.

In terms of water supply to the highly populated peripheral areas with dense housing, including Wards 47 and 54 within the municipality, Spatial Development Framework (2015-2016) lists the three potable water supply dams located within the municipality: These are Hazelmere, Inanda and Nungwane dams. However, the primary water supply for eThekwini Municipality is obtained through the Mearns Weir and Spring Grove dams located on the Mooi River and Midmar Dam, Albert Falls Dam, Nagle Dam and Inanda Dam located on the Umngeni River.

In terms of sanitation, the lack of infrastructure development may also be attributed to the housing boom as suggested above, as water supply and sanitation cannot

reasonably be detached from each other. A deduction is again made that this is a result of poor planning on the part of the authorities. The municipality services the suburban regions with a water-borne sewerage system that transports sewerage to a number of treatment plants for treatment prior to final discharge into the Indian Ocean. The municipality further indicates that the outer peri-urban and rural areas, as well as informal settlements, are provided with on-site sewerage disposal, and for poor households (dense settlements), with basic sanitation, which is ventilated improved pit latrines and urine diversion toilets, for less dense settlements.

One remains cognisant of the fact that where there is lack of water supply in households, women bear the responsibility and, in addition to that, issues of contagious diseases. The amount of exposure to ill health on the part of women remains a real concern under these circumstances. Hesselbarth (2005) is of the view that, *"water supply and sanitation are essential for human health and survival, as well as for food security and the empowerment of women, the education of girls, and a reduction in productivity losses owing to morbidity and malnutrition for the management and protection of natural resources".* She further asserts that effecting water supply for the households has imperative consequences both in terms of time and fiscal costs, and that insufficient and inadequate water supply and sanitation results in increased health risks for the population. Concerning the issue of women's taking the responsibility for the collection of water, she is of the view that ensuring effective water supply would be beneficial in terms of reducing the time and energy burden, allowing communities to engage in other activities, including productive and income-generating activities.

In concluding the issue of water and sanitation, the CSD (2004-2005) report highlights the benefits of "investing in improved water and sanitation; namely, that assured water supply and resources management are good business for both national economies and poor people." This report continues to indicate that poor people are disproportionately dependent on natural resources for their livelihood and are hardest hit by low access to water and sanitation services, and that positive actions that target poor people have the highest marginal benefit. Thus, an argument is advanced that

investment in infrastructure development for effective water supply and sanitation for the poor in eThekwini Municipality, particularly in the INK area, has the potential to ensure a healthy and productive society, with less burden on the state. It also empowers women who happen to be at the core of water and sanitation challenges, as they bear the brunt of water collection in catering for the needs of the children, the aged, the unwell, and the society.

4.2.1.3   Health care facilities

There is a correlation between poverty and ill health, particularly in overpopulated areas like the wards under investigation. This is mainly attributed to many factors which include, but are not limited to, the lack of water supply, lack of proper sanitation, food security related issues, unemployment and congestion. The South African Constitution, specifically the Bill of Rights, holds that access to health care services is a right. Health care facilities are a 'must' for a healthy and productive society, whatever the area.

Weir-Smith and Labadarios (2012) are of the view that, although the Constitution states that everyone has the right to essential health care services, many South Africans still do not have adequate access to quality health care services. They point out that South Africa's per capita health burden is the highest of any middle-income country in the world, also mentioning that the country's population per clinic is 13 718, which is inconsistent with the World Health Organization (WHO) norm of 10 000 people per clinic. This indicates a clear over-utilisation of the available resources and staff owing to overcrowding, which clearly has the potential to compromise quality as well.

Lutge and Friedman (2010) provide a precise account linking socio-economic conditions to health and illness. They are of the view that health and illness follow a social gradient, that the lower the socio-economic position, the worse the quality of health. They further state that the social gradient in South Africa is steep, quoting

Leibbrandt, that the gap between the rich and the poor within each race group is widening in the country. The Gini Coefficient – a measure of inequality - has risen in all population groups in South Africa, and that the burden of disease reflects the social gradient in the country. Obviously, the above views were expressed in 2010, after sixteen years of democracy, when the Bill of Rights was already in existence, which begs the question, is our government on the right track in terms of meeting the basic needs of the poor?

In his 2014 budget speech, Dr Dlomo, the KwaZulu-Natal Executing Authority for Health, mentioned that the eThekwini Municipality and the Provincial Department of Health were to start the construction of a brand new 500 bed regional hospital which was to be constructed over a period of four years. He further mentioned that this hospital would serve the densely populated areas of Inanda, Ntuzuma and KwaMashu (INK), and that this facility would serve as a referral centre for all surrounding public health care facilities. The facility will be beneficial to the community of Wards 47 and 54, as they are currently serviced by two available health care centres: Bester Clinic in Ward 47, and the clinic in Newtown C. Currently, the closest referral hospital is Mahatma Gandhi Hospital, which is located in Phoenix.

4.2.1.4   Education facilities

It is a widely held view that education remains the key to unlocking any economic opportunity in any given society, whether it be basic or tertiary education, or general skilling for business or trade work. In this context, the availability of basic education facilities in the area and the proximity of institutions of higher learning were investigated on the basis that an educationally aware society is better off in terms of socio-economic activities than an educationally unaware community. It is to be noted that education is a national and provincial responsibility, which absolves the municipality from the responsibility of infrastructure development and maintenance when it comes to schools and their related facilities. However, this does not take away the responsibility for the local leadership to analyse its local needs and make

recommendations to the higher authorities where necessary, for the benefit of the communities.

In terms of the levels of education in the area where the study was conducted, Mngadi (2013) found that 12% of the INK population has had no schooling, while 38% of the population has had access to limited primary education. As a result of low levels of education, there is a need for interventions in terms of skills development and even basic adult education to improve literacy in the area. Mngadi points out that only 3% of the population have had access to tertiary level education.

On a much broader scale, the eThekwini Municipality Review of Spatial Development Framework (2015-2016) indicates that *"29% of the municipal population has some secondary education, while 19% of the population has some primary education, 4% having no schooling at all, with 4% unspecified, meaning they are functionally illiterate in that they either do not have school-based education or have not received sufficient school-based education to acquire marketable skills and engage in serious business ventures."*

Considering the effect of low levels of education on general living conditions, Mngadi (2013) further notes that the majority of people employed within the INK area fall into the elementary occupation category, a category which includes street traders, domestic workers, security guards, office cleaners and waiters. She further found that 14% of the population were employed as shop assistants or sales workers, and a similar number work within a crafting and related trade category. She also found that only 2% of the population fall within the professional category.

In terms of education facilities in the wards under investigation, it was found that each ward had more than one primary school, one high school, and day care centres. Each of these appeared to be at an acceptable standard in terms the structure, safety for learners, sanitation and maintenance. In terms of access to higher education, the

study revealed that there are Colleges for Further Education within the INK area, but that their locations are some distance from many interested learners residing in both wards. In terms of access to universities, the distance was found reasonable in the sense that the Durban universities are accessible to all eThekwini Municipality residents, including the INK residents who are within the 25km distance.

4.2.1.5 Business infrastructure development

The eThekwini Municipality Spatial Development Framework (2015-16) indicates that, "an extremely high percentage of the population is not economically active. It also states that this means high dependency ratios on household heads with low income levels and that, despite the diversified nature of the local economy, unemployment in the municipal area is of considerable concern." With the above background in terms of dependency ratios and low levels of education, the research took a turn to examine possible business strategies and infrastructure to support the INK population, particularly the wards under investigation.

The area under investigation is largely residential. There is, therefore, minimal economic activity taking place, except for the shopping centres that create employment opportunities, and the civil servants like teachers, nurses and clerks working in the local schools, local government offices and clinics, who form a very small percentage of the population. However, there is what would be regarded as informal economic activities, such as tuck shops, street vendors, domestic workers and shebeens which are economic activities where mostly women are making supplementary income. In terms of the business infrastructure development, the focus was on Small Medium Enterprises (SMME) and the support that would be required by those who engage in the informal economy. The analysis found that the foregoing is largely influenced by the low levels of education as articulated above, which would generally have some impact on this community in terms of lack of marketable skills, making people less employable.

The municipality has a policy in place, namely, the Durban's Informal Economy Policy (2001). Section 9 of this policy is primarily concerned assistance in building the capacity of organisations of informal workers, which is SMMEs like street vendors. This policy encourages informal traders to register their businesses, form organisations, participate in municipal capacity-building programmes, establish and publicise their services, and benefit from the ongoing support and development. Having pointed out the above, Bandyambona (2013), writing on the formation of organisations such as cooperatives, concurs with Mqingwana (2010:59), who states that, *"it is unfortunate but understandable in poor societies that the driving force for cooperatives is to access government funding, but that the true spirit of cooperation should rather focus on the objectives of those who prefer to work together to produce and market goods communally."*

The above seems to suggest that there should be some degree of grouping of like-minded people for particular projects for cooperatives to survive. Furthermore, the municipality could explore the possibility of capacitating individuals by allowing them access to funding as individuals instead of grouping people who do not have a common vision and who will eventually not cooperate.

4.3   CONCLUSION

Writing on development administration, Kumar and Singh (2013) mention that, by the last years of the 20th century, it had become clear that development without people's power, self-development and sustained development is incomplete. They write that people empowerment is associated with the understanding that power increases with the development of society and that people are the real abode of power. South Africa has a diverse and complex society which requires clear systems and strategic thinking on the part of government administrators if sustainable economic empowerment is to be realised. This statement is informed by the information provided in the analysed plans and reports, and the efforts that have been made by the department and municipality in question towards improving the lives of the people of KwaZulu-Natal

province. Such efforts have, in most cases, tended to be disguised by the constant service delivery strikes and the evident and persistent socio-economic needs.

The documentary study focused on the programmes that were designed and rolled out by the provincial government through the Department of Social Development in 2012/13, 2013/14 and 2014/15 financial years. It also examined the economic development programmes designed and rolled out by the municipality in question, and the integration of government services with the ultimate goal of improving the lives of the people, especially women, with sustainable economic empowerment. Through the analysis of documents, the researcher noted the following:

- An obsession with numbers in terms of targets, validated output and reporting in general as all plans and reports are mainly statistical. There is a lack narratives which would provide more information and clarity in terms of what informed the design of each programme and whether it yielded the desired results.
- Lack of consistency, as key performance indicators are constantly reviewed with little or no rationale provided on what informed the review, and whether any clear assessments were conducted before the review was effected.
- The analysis of the annual performance plans and annual reports turned out to be on transitory key performance indicators with unclear targets and lack of narratives and impact. This raised a concern in relation to the issue of sustainability.
- The analysis further revealed that there was no clear focus on women's economic development in the designed programmes at both the provincial and municipal levels. This was true despite the one programme, designed in the 2014/15 financial year, which seemed to focus on women development. This programme was found to be lacking in narrative and impact on the ground in terms of sustainable economic empowerment of women for ultimate independence.
- Regarding the integration of government services, and seamless administration that does not undermine the distinctions between the three

spheres of government – that is, national, provincial and municipal levels planning together – the researcher noted efforts that were made in terms of planning, budgeting and the segregation of duties during implementation. However, it was noted that the municipality's focus was mainly on the local economy; that is, infrastructure development, structured economic development, and the provision of domestic services.

Based on the analysed documentation, it seems that the issue of scanning the environment, analysing the complexities, and responding through clear economic development programmes and administrative systems remains a concern, and requires attention if the provincial government is to make progress in the economic empowerment of women. Infrastructure development is key in economic development. Therefore, while the municipality focuses on developing the local economy through infrastructure development and provision of domestic services, each element at the provincial level is critical in ensuring an educated, healthy and productive society, with access to funding, with effective support programmes from the Department of Social Development, so as to enhance the municipality's efforts and ensure an economically active KwaZulu-Natal society. The overall deduction in this documentary analysis chapter indicated that the implemented programmes by the KwaZulu-Natal province, supported by the municipality and its local economic development plans and activities, do not show a convergence of economic and social protection of women.

CHAPTER FIVE

FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

5.1　INTRODUCTION

This chapter presents the results of the research. It presents and analyses the data that was collected through the distributed questionnaires, focus group discussions and one-on-one interviews with the selected sample of community members, community leaders and employees of the Department of Social Development in the province of KwaZulu-Natal.

It is crucial to mention that the responses from participants were not entirely reproduced verbatim. Instead, they were summarized in line with the research topic, and guided by the objectives and theoretical framing of the research. Notably, where responses were reproduced direct quotes are used.

5.2　RESEARCH OBJECTIVES:

The objectives of the study were:

- To determine whether or not the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government has social protection programmes in place that are strategically aligned with women empowerment;

- To establish whether these programmes are strategically implemented with a view to ensure sustainable social protection;

- To understand and explain the extent of engagement by public policy-makers, and public administrators in monitoring and evaluation of social protection programmes for women.

As part of the research methodology, two sets of research questions were prepared in advance. These were, the one-on-one research questionnaire which had fourteen questions and another set of 17 questions for focus group discussions. These were prepared primarily to guide the interview and group discussion processes. Further probing could not be avoided; thus, the interview and group discussion processes were not strictly confined to the prepared questions. The process was sufficiently structured but open for further probing beyond the provided sets of questions. The questions are consequently presented in *Apprendix A*.

As mentioned earlier, data collection was done through interviews and focus group discussions. Data was recorded in the form of notes during the one-on-one interview process, over and above the pre-circulated research questionnaires which were also completed and collected, a process which was meant to cover any possible gaps during the interview process. For focus group discussions, a voice recorder was utilized to capture all discussions. However, notes were also taken by the researcher and the research assistant, thus the researcher relied more on written notes during the analysis process.

A stratified random sampling method was applied for a fair representation of research participants. An example is that, from the Department of Social Development, a sample was drawn from different levels structurally and in terms of units within the department. For example, participants were social workers, community development practitioners and managers, while, different age categories were selected as per the specified sampling method in chapter three on the part of community members who participated in the study.

5.3   FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

5.3.1 ONE-ON-ONE INTERVIEWS

The analysis presented below focuses on the responses to the prearranged one-on-one research questions. In this analysis, the researcher made efforts to capture all critical aspects of the interview process, the intention being to provide a true reflection of the engagement process.

5.3.1.1   GOVERNMENT STRATEGIES ON THE ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT OF WOMEN

The objective was to determine whether or not, the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government, has in place, social protection programmes that are strategically aligned with women empowerment.

5.3.1.1.1   Current programmes and their strategic alignment

The research participants were asked to outline of programmes in respective business units, as well as their target groups and they responded as follows:

This question required participants to provide an outline of the existing programmes in their business units and the groups that these programmes targeted. Responses to this question showed commonality in terms of the listing of programmes at head office and regional office levels. This finding is based on the fact that the same question was posed to managers at head office level (who are perceived to be programme designers), also to regional managers and officers who are responsible for the implementation of those programmes. This was, however, the conceptual understanding which may be different from how the programmes are rolled out and how those services are received by the target groups. The noted difference in the programmes was between social workers and community development officers.

For social work respondents, all (8 social workers plus 2 supervisors = 10), 100%, listed implemented programmes as: -

- Providing support for youth and women empowerment programmes;
- Support for non-profit making organizations;
- Protection of orphan and vulnerable children;
- Victim empowerment and families;
- Providing services to older persons and vulnerable;
- Domestic violence; and
- Counselling
- Substance abuse; and
- Provision of (Humane Immuno Deficiency Virus/ Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome (HIV/AIDS) support

Further, during discussions, social workers mentioned unanimously that operating at a social services centre requires social workers to go beyond specialization in terms of programmes implementation as most clients come with multiple challenges. This, therefore, requires each social worker to be well versed in all programmes and be able to provide assistance for different social development needs at a go. The respondents reiterated that each social worker specialises as a social worker, implying that programme design is critical in terms of understanding the area of focus for implementation. However, each social worker is expected to be flexible enough for any paradigm shift and context at any particular point, as long as a programme is still within the premise of social development.

2 respondents who were community development practitioners, provided similar responses and listed the following:

- Sustainable development;
- Institutional support for non-profit organizations;
- Youth development programmes;
- Women empowerment programmes;
- Poverty reduction; and

- Research

On the issue of overlap between social workers and community development practitioners, it was clarified during discussion that there is no overlap between community development practitioners and social workers as these are separate areas of specialization, which are however linked in their nature. Community development practitioners gave an indication that community development is mainly around community profiling, research and mapping, which informs the approach that should be taken by social workers in responding to the needs of the communities in a particular area.

It was also noted during discussions that in as much as there were similarities in the listing of programmes at both head office and regional levels, responses of managers who were at the head office were more around the provision of strategic leadership and direction in terms of coordination, collection of statistics and monthly reports. Their responses further focused on the provision of supervision of the implementation of already designed programmes, performance measurement and monitoring and evaluation.

5.3.1.1.2 What informs the design of programmes in the organization where the study was conducted?

Overwhelmingly, responses to this question indicated that programme design is informed by needs analysis conducted by community development practitioners on the ground. 9 out of 10 field workers (community development practitioners and social workers) clearly stated as follows in their responses:

> *"programmes are informed by needs analysis, awareness campaigns, research and mapping which are conducted by community development practitioners"*

However, 1 out of 10 respondents was of the view that programmes are designed based on the broad government strategy towards social protection. In the responses, examples of women and children issues were cited, which are partly considered when programmes are designed as government understands women and children as an area which requires more focus in relation to social protection, particularly post-1994. Further, this respondent quoted the National Development Plan (2013) which broadens the urgent need for government to align its programmes to the needs on the ground.

During discussion, it further transpired that the social workers and social development practitioners in the two service centres do participate in the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government programme referred to as Operation Sukuma Sakhe (OSS). This is a ward based approach where all government departments sit around the table with community leaders and members of the community to discuss pressing community issues, which are then redirected to respective government departments for urgent attention, swift responses and relevant interventions. In this discussion, it was indicated that, the community development practitioners document all relevant information and make those part of the reports, information which becomes critical for further discussion at the strategic level departmentally, ultimately influencing the alignment of programmes during design.

This approach is ward-based, and is perceived as a government approach which affords communities an opportunity to interact directly with government through officials and local leaders such as councillors. On such occasions, the needs of the people are clearly spelled out and understood. Thus, the desired responses are expected to be more appropriate and, ultimately, aligned social protection programmes, as opposed to a theoretical or a bird's eye view approach towards understanding the needs of the communities.

During discussion, the researcher deduced that an area of concern was the turnaround time as the OSS ward-based approach was described as a swift one-stop-shop, where

research, mapping and campaigns are conducted. However, there was an indication that there are delays in terms of responses in relation to reviewed programmes as government works based on annual performance plans and medium-term expenditure frameworks. Therefore the envisaged change or improvement does not take place as swiftly as communities would expect.

5.3.1.1.3 The strategies utilized to sensitize communities about services provided.

An overwhelming 100% of interviewees, basically all 15 officials (3 managers, 2 supervisors, social workers and community development practitioners) responded that there is an outreach programme where the department organises gatherings, in some cases, in local sport fields, with an intention to sensitize the public on services that are accessible such as social grant application processes, HIV/AIDS counselling which is provided by social workers, and awareness on women abuse and children. The latter also takes place during the 16 days of activism campaign against the abuse of women and children. Further, the respondents indicated that social workers have a responsibility to visit non-profit organizations to sensitize them on all relevant reviews in terms policies and legislation. At the same time, they conduct assessments of the delivery of services to the people as per the signed service level agreements with the department.

In response to the second part of the question, a number of examples were cited. For example, the 2014/15 workshops which were conducted during the 16 days of activism against women and children abuse, and visits to South African Social Security Agency (SASSA) to address community members about social grants. Dates were also provided when different workshops were conducted for non-profit making organizations. For contextual purposes, the South African Social Security Agency (SASSA) is a parastatal responsible for the distribution of social grants in the country. The Department of Social Development is a government department responsible for social development, protection and welfare services in the country, while SASSA is responsible for the social grants function on behalf of the department. SASSA takes

responsibility from the application stage, through screening, verification to payment. It further takes responsibility for fraud prevention in the disbursement process. The Department plays an oversight role. However, it has no direct bearing in terms of operations within SASSA.

As part of this outreach programme, respondents also mentioned that schools are visited with the intention to sensitize school children about child abuse, and how and where to report cases of abuse. Izimbizo and OSS Cabinet Days were also cited as some of the platforms which are also utilised by government to sensitize citizens about the services which are offered by government. The researcher noted the positive responses by the respondents in this regard, as well as the collaboration of government services through the above-mentioned platforms, specifically the OSS programme which allows the clustering of government services, where all urgent needs are addressed on the spot or redirected for swifter action, as opposed to citizens having to knock on different doors for multiple services.

5.3.1.1.4   Statistical information for 2011/12, 2012/13 and 2013/14, i.e. consecutive financial years to measure the output in terms of the empowerment of women.

An overwhelming 100% (all 15) of the respondents referred the researcher to the annual reports of the three consecutive years. These reports were analysed in chapter four of this work. The responses did not assist the researcher much in the sense that the question was basically focussing on the statistical information on the ground work as programmes are rolled out. However, during the discussions, responses held that reporting is guided by templates, thus, the statistical information which can be provided can only be the information that appears in the annual reports.

The said annual reports indicated positive results in terms of meeting set annual, and, at times, annual target exceeded. However, the researcher noted the lack of narrative

reporting as all annual reports had statistical information with minimal background and narrative reporting to back up the figures. Again, the presented reports did not depict any measurement of the impact of the programmes provided.

5.3.1.1.5   Strategies to sustain the programmes which have already been rolled out, in an effort to ensure onward mobility.

The views of the respondents on this question were unexpectedly diverse in the sense that 20% (3 out of 15) of the respondents were of the view that once a programme has been rolled out, community members must mobilise resources on their own so as to ensure sustainability of the rolled-out programme. They further mentioned that communication is key in this regard as they should be able to market themselves, engage stakeholders, fundraise, build relationships with business people in local areas and be part of local forums so as to sustain all government-provided social development programmes.

Consequently, 40% (6 out 15) of the respondents were of the view that support must be provided by community development officers and social workers so as to monitor if any progress is being made.   They further mentioned that this is one strategy to ensure sustainability of the programmes, which have been rolled-out to communities. On the other hand, 20% (3 out of 15) of the respondents were of the opinion that:-

> *…there must be good planning which must involve people on the ground, there must be good communication between stakeholders. (individual engagement respondent)*

In the same vein, another response which was not too far from the above, stated as follows:-

> *People, communities on the ground level should be involved, a bottom up approach should be implemented, batho pele principles should be enforced,*

more dialogue with the people on the ground is important. (individual engagement respondent)

The above responses showed the fragmented manner in which the social development programmes are monitored so as to ensure sustainability of what has been rolled out. The suggested "good planning which must involve people on the ground", as well as the bottom up approach seemed to emphasise the criticality of consultation for the ultimate alignment of the programmes for sustainability purposes. The assertions around the support which must be provided after the rolling out of service seemed plausible in the sense that, the "after-care" can also work as a strategy to enforce and sustain what has been rolled out. In the same vein, the suggested bottom-up approach appeared to be the best approach in terms of ownership of the programmes and alignment of services to the needs on the ground (consultation which will inform programme design).

On the contrary, management, which constituted 20% (3 out of 15) of respondents, responded from a different angle. They said that sustainability is something that cannot be realized considering the approach of government post-1994. One respondent is quoted verbatim saying that: -

"We have a providing government and not an empowering government. As far as I am concerned, what government is doing is just not sustainable. In fact, what government is doing is encouraging dependency. You can go around the world, no country provides everything for free. Free housing, free health-care, free domestic services, social grants….this is just not sustainable. Women must be economically empowered and be out of the system after a specific period of time." (individual engagement respondent)

Considering the manner in which the majority of the participants responded, using commanding language such as. "must", "should", it seemed that, currently, there is no strategy in place to ensure onward mobility to sustain what has been rolled out. Again, the responses of management indicated that programmes are rolled out. However, sustainability is not envisaged, based on their own assertions that the current

government is a "providing" government and not an "empowering", although they themselves are at the steering wheel (occupying strategic positions) in the same government.

5.3.1.2 MONITORING AND EVALUATION

The study set out to assess the extent to which the current programmes are strategically implemented to ensure social protection sustainability

5.3.1.2.1 The strategies which are in place to track the impact of programmes on the ground.

When the research participants were asked to outline how the effectiveness of the programmes is tracked, they responded in a diverse manner in this manner:

In the main, monitoring and evaluation was cited as the most effective tool used by the department. Respondents particularly in the two service centres indicated that monitoring and evaluation is the strategy that is in place to track the impact of their programmes on the ground. The above deduction is informed by the fact that, indeed, each respondent responded differently however, monitoring and evaluation being the opening in each response however continuing and ending in multiple ways. Examples cited by respondents are as follows:-

- Monitoring and evaluation
- Monthly reports as well as completion of monitoring and evaluation templates
- Continuous evaluation as programmes are rolled out
- The impact is measured through targets in each financial year, information which is required for monitoring and evaluation purposes
- Evaluation forms/questionnaires are used by the service centres to measure the impact of our services

- Latest report has revealed that most women are now able to take initiatives against their partners in cases of abuse

- Most women now know their rights and they do exercise them by reporting cases, compared to reports of previous years.

On the contrary, the responses of managers in terms of tracking the impact on the ground were that, indeed, targets are set every beginning of the financial year and the best measure, departmentally, is the figure at the end of the financial year. However, monitoring and evaluation reports seem not to be giving a true reflection of what is happening in the real world as statistics are still indicating that poverty levels are still high, as if government is not doing enough to meet the needs of the people, especially the poor. A view was later advanced that, a real measure of the impact would be the declining numbers of women accessing social grants, rather than the evidenced upward trend. The argument was that, a decline would mean that women are empowered and independent to survive on their own without the support of government.

5.3.1.2.2 Monitoring and evaluation strategies that are utilised to measure effectiveness and efficiency of the delivered programmes.

Responses to this question were rather ambiguous, as most respondents spoke out of the context of economic empowerment of women. 60% (9 out of 15) of the respondents' focussed on the annual targets, mentioning that meeting set targets in a financial year works as an evaluation strategy to measure the effectiveness of service delivered. Only 40% (6 out of 15) of the respondents mentioned that questionnaires and evaluation forms are used to measure the effectiveness of the services that are delivered on the ground. The 40% further mentioned that question and answer sessions are allowed during community gatherings (izimbizo), where community members are afforded an opportunity to raise their concerns, make suggestions and advise their government about social ills that require the attention of government.

Management's responses were indicative of facts that, reporting in government is guided by templates which require the setting of targets and reporting through figures, a strategy which does not assist much in terms of measuring the effectiveness of services delivered. One manager responded as follows:-

"I served as a social worker pre-1994, also post 1994. We used to conduct screenings before 1994, and we would still say that screening is conducted post 1994, however, there is no effectiveness in what is done because even local leaders who are supposed to assist in terms of the screening of recipients of social services are corrupt, which makes it difficult for the social workers and community development practitioners to measure the effectiveness of what they are doing on the ground. If a local counsellor is requested to prove if an applicant qualifies for a social grant, s/he will confirm the need even where there is none, mainly because of cliques or political connections". (individual engagement respondent)

Similarly, another response around screening and conditions was as follows:-

I am fortunate to have served as a social in the previous regime, as well as post 1994, therefore I am able to make some distinction. There were set conditions previously, and social grant recipients used to report regularly and indicate if they have managed to secure employment, but now…we see free everything, easy confirmations through corrupt local leaders, political connections, abuse of state resources, even people who have managed to open businesses are still collecting social grants…a serious confirmation that it is rather difficult for the department to measure any effectiveness. (individual engagement respondent)

The above responses were from respondents who clearly indicated that they had witnessed a lot as they have been in the field for many years, mentioning that "they have seen it all" serving as social workers, during their transition, and serving at management levels. This depicts a systemic problem, where innovation by public managers would be vital. Peters and Pierre (2012), alluding to New Public Management, argue that administration is about processes while New Public Management is about outcomes. On the basis of the responses provided to this question, the researcher noted the systemic challenge in the measurement of effectiveness of services rolled out on the ground due to the manner in which

implementation and reporting is conducted. Further, it appeared that the department's managers focus more on processes and reporting while there are challenges which require strategic and systems thinking if the department is to curb the noted systemic issues which seem to bewilder the well-intended government services to the citizens. An example is that completing templates which require statistical information without additional analysis seems not to be contributing to the deduced required strategic intervention by managers.

5.3.1.2.3   Views around what the respondents would like to see government doing differently to empower vulnerable women, with the backdrop of the evident overreliance on social grants.

Overwhelmingly, 80% (12 of 15) of the respondents wanted to see government focussing more on skills development, job creation, empowering women through the creation of more projects in the communities, especially in the rural and per-urban areas, for the empowerment of women.   Specifically, one respondent stated as follows:-

> *I will be happy if the young women are empowered to participate in businesses so that they can fight against poverty rather than depending on social grants. (individual engagement respondent)*

The above assertion was specifically around the economic empowerment of female youth. Consequently, the other 20% (3 out of 15) of the respondents were of the view that government is too reactive when prevention is better than cure. They continued to state that the birth rate is high especially in areas where poverty is rife and government is not sufficiently visible with its women empowerment programmes in such areas. Some of the respondents mentioned that young women who have given birth at early ages qualify for the support of government in the form of social grants and this appears to be recurring, which somehow exacerbates the burden on the very same government. "when is this going to stop?" a respondent added. Further, another respondent referred to a "wheel-barrow syndrome", government carrying physically fit women in a wheel-barrow, instead of capacitating them for independence.

The researcher noted the expressed emphasis on skills development as key in the responses and the necessary visibility of government, particularly in the poverty-stricken areas, where women are lacking exposure in terms of economic activities and education.

5.3.1.3   OUTCOME-BASED ADMINISTRATIVE SYSTEM AND INTEGRATION OF GOVERNMENT SERVICES

The research objective was to understand the extent of engagement by public policy-makers, as well as public administrators in terms of monitoring and evaluation of social protection programmes. As part of this research objective, the study intended to establish whether there is any relationship between government programmes and women in respect of career counselling and access to education.

5.3.1.3.1   Establishment of whether there is a provision for basic education and career counselling for women within the available government programmes.

When the above question was posed, an overwhelming 100% (15 out of 15) of the respondents were of the view that there are career counselling provisions within government programmes, mainly citing Adult Basic Education and Training (ABET) as the fundamental programme which government has in place for the empowerment of all who are beyond school going age. However, the researcher noted that the above-mentioned programme cuts across the gender lines, covering citizens of all ages beyond general basic education age (school going age). Further, in terms of elaboration around career counselling provisions specifically for women 80% (12 out of 15) of the respondents indicated that the Department of Social Development provides guidance in terms of business opportunities during trainings and workshops, which are normally organized for women by the skills development unit. The remaining 20% cited "guidance", a programme, which is designed for basic school level, and communities, which covers career options, general human rights and counselling.

Consequently, during discussions, it transpired that the department in which the study was conducted does not operate in isolation. An indication was made that government programmes in different departments do complement each other as there is correlation in terms of the needs on the ground. Examples with regard to economic development programmes were made, that economic development programmes reside within the Department of Economic Development, Tourism and Environmental Affairs. However, recipients are generally identified by social workers and are redirected to the relevant department e.g. the establishment of cooperatives are a competence of the above cited department where all economic development related programmes reside. Another department which respondents referred to was the Department of Agriculture and its farming programmes. They were of the view that agricultural related programmes reside within the above-mentioned department and such programmes have the potential to benefit women through farming projects, particularly for women in peri-urban areas, where there is space available for gardening projects.

Furthermore, responses to the above question depicted a critical aspect in the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government, namely, the need to understand the correlation in terms of government services, basically the integration of government services, that, indeed, the different government departments have separate legislative mandates however, there is great degree of practical synergy in terms of the needs and recipients on the ground. This requires systemic thinking on the part of programme designers, for effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability in terms of delivered services.

5.3.1.4 INADEQUATE SOCIO-ECONOMIC COVERAGE FOR WOMEN AND THE GEOGRAPHICAL IDENTIFICATION OF POVERTY.

The study further aimed to understand what could assist in terms of reducing the dependency rate on social grants, and ensure the ensure the mainstreaming of women in the periphery, for them to participate in the economy. The research participants responded as in this manner:

5.3.1.4.1 The alignment of the socio-economic needs vs the provided programmes, and the link thereof.

In respect of the alignment of needs *vs* programmes provided, 80% (12 out of 15) of the respondents were of the view that, the provided programmes are properly aligned and linked to the socio-economic development of women. However, 20% (3 out of 15) of the respondents chose not to respond to this question, which led the researcher to a presumption that there are reasons which may be blurring the perception of this 20%. The verification and analysis of the assumption is dealt with below as space for elaboration was provided in the next question.

5.3.1.4.2 Examples in relation to the link of programmes to the socio-economic development of women.

Generally, the majority of the respondents believed that South Africa has made remarkable progress in pulling women out of extreme poverty through the existing social development programmes. Thus, the positive response to question 5 above was followed by different but similar elaboration from 60% of the respondents, who were of the view that women are better off now than before. This category of respondents also noted that the current government prioritises women in most areas, citing small businesses where women owned companies are afforded preferential points in terms of the Preferential Procurement Regulation (2011). However only those who are able to participate in businesses benefit from this. They further mentioned that women empowerment is one of the national priorities. Therefore, they are of the view that, in terms of the alignment of the needs on the ground with programmes provided, indeed, there is an alignment.

Consequently, 20% (3) of the respondents were of the view that some women now own businesses and are able to support their families. They cited the collaboration of government initiatives in terms of women empowerment, that the Department of Social Development takes the responsibility as far as their social development programmes are concerned. However, the department of Economic Development, Tourism and Environmental Affairs takes over in terms of the economic empowerment of the

provincial citizens and women are prioritised in that regard. They further mentioned that policies around the economic development of youth and women are in place, thus, women who have business interest are provided with the necessary skills and means to open businesses and, ultimately, be able to survive and support their families without any direct support from government. It is also critical to note that no specific examples of the supported women or groups of women was provided.

As articulated under question 5 above, some respondents had chosen not to respond to question 5 above. Clearly, the earlier mentioned 20% (3) of the respondents expressed their view, which was neither in the positive or negative. However, there is a perception which seeks to differentiate between urbanized women and women from other areas, for example, rural areas, peri-urban areas and informal settlements. The perception is that programmes are in place and may appear as aligned to the needs on the ground but women in other geographical areas (non-urban), still do not know and understand their rights as they are not exposed to developmental initiatives of government, partly because of their locations and their low level of education, which makes it difficult to share information and understand issues better.

Issues of patriarchy were also cited as one of the real challenge for women in some parts of Inanda where the study was conducted. The respondents were of the view that some women in such areas still think it is only men who can be employed, engage in business activities and be educated beyond primary and secondary education levels. They further mentioned that the two service centres where the study was conducted are located in areas which are partly peri-urban. Therefore, in the population that they serve, there is a vast difference between women from the township, and the women from the surrounding informal settlements and the peri-urban area of Inanda.

Despite the noted difference, the majority of the respondents were of the view that programmes are in place and they are aligned and responding to the needs on the ground. The researcher noted and accepted the lack of statistical information on the

issue. On that note, no specific statistics were provided to verify the claim that, indeed, programmes are in place and responsive to the needs on the ground.

5.3.1.4.3   Views of the respondents around the positive strides made by government in respect of social protection for women post-1994.

The majority of the respondents who answered this question were of the view that government has made positive strides towards ensuring social protection for women post-1994. 60% (9 out of 15) of the respondents went as far as citing their understanding that post-1994, women are capacitated in terms of their rights. They also add that government also takes awareness programmes directly to communities where women are informed of who to approach for social assistance and that they are further capacitated in terms of the rights of women and children.

Further, 20% (3 out of 15) of the respondents noted the positive strides that have been made by government with respect to rights for women and children, access to basic services and the capacitation of women. However, they mentioned that more still needs to be done. They based their opinion more on the statistics, which show that women are still lagging behind men in terms of economic development, and access to basic needs such as access to land and patriarchal issues. This 20% further mentioned that the levels of education for women, particularly in the rural areas, peri-urban areas, informal settlements and some parts of the townships, have not improved, although that is where capacitation should begin, and this remains an area of concern.

Most importantly, a counter argument was advanced by 20% (3 out of 15) of the respondents, which included management, who argued that access to basic services, access to land, skills development and economic development remains an area of concern for women in rural areas, peri-urban areas and informal settlements. They further mentioned that government is visible in the townships and urban areas, but women in secluded, deep rural areas cannot be compared with women in urban areas

in terms of social protection post1994. They were adamant that, strides have been made but more still needs to be done.

5.3.1.4.4   Respondents' suggestions in relation to what can be done by government to ensure that social protection for women is realized in this country.

Generally, the respondents expressed similar views. 80% (12 out of 15) of the respondents were of the view that educational talks and community dialogues are critical. They also mentioned sensitizing women of their legal rights and all possible avenues for social protection. The respondents also added that that education is key, as knowledge is power, more specifically, in areas where poverty is rife and experienced primarily by women. One respondent said:-

> *"through community dialogues for women and through workshops that can give them the opportunity to express their feelings and views for appropriate assistance" (individual engagement respondent)*

The above responses seem to be putting more emphasis on the criticality of the capacitation of women if government is to realize social protection for women post-1994.

On the other hand, 30% (3 out of 15) of the respondents were of the view that it all starts at the level of the constitution and the bill of rights. They were of the view that the constitution should be unpacked to all citizens, especially women. They further mentioned that knowing your rights without economic freedom will also not assist. Therefore, women require sustainable economic development as opposed to unsustainable social grants, making examples of block-making projects, gardening, sewing and access to adult basic education for women, more especially those who are in rural areas.

5.3.1.4.5   Additional information that was shared in the context of the study

In terms of additional information to support the study, the respondents made statements in multiple ways emphasizing skills development as a critical aspect which government needs to focus on. More specifically in rural, peri-urban areas and informal settlements, where the majority of households are headed by women. Further, one respondent, a social worker stated that:-

> *Women should understand that they have got power (personal power) within themselves to make a difference in their lives. They can take initiatives to empower themselves and other women. (individual engagement respondent)*

On a further probe, the researcher deduced the assertion to be referring to mental strength, that once a person's mind is decolonised, a lot is possible, including economic empowerment, and possibly pulling other women out of extreme poverty.

Another respondent was of the view that, there must be a programme which focusses on women who are trying to do right, such as young women who have not given birth, instead of focussing on how much a young woman with three children, for example, should collect from the state. The respondent further mentioned that women need encouragement so that they will remain positive in life.

The additional contribution focussed mainly on skills development as and an urgent need for government to focus on rural areas, peri-urban areas and informal settlements. These areas are purportedly not regularly visited through events like izimbizo and others. due to poor access and the lack of amenities to cater for big events. On the contrary, the researcher took cognisance of the youth development directorate, which appeared in the annual reports analysed in chapter four, that the department has programmes in place which cater for youth, encouraging them to do right. However, there is a possibility that more still needs to be done about encouraging young women to do right as per the suggestion of respondents.

5.3.2　　　　FOCUS GROUP QUESTIONS

As mentioned earlier, questions for focus group discussions were pre-arranged in an effort to guide the engagement process. *See Appendix B* for the set of focus group questions.

5.2.2.1　　　　CONFIRMATION OF CATEGORIES

This part of the analysis focusses on the focus group discussions. The analysis includes the responses of the community members and those of the local leaders as per the prearranged questions. The confirmation of categories preceded the research questions in the research tool, hence the below order of the analysis.

Section A of the research tool, which was utilised for data collection, dealt with general questions, partly, in an effort to confirm the intended sample. This includes the confirmation of age categories, the average level of education for participants, sources of income, estimation of total income per household, as well as confirmation of whether participants had children who qualified for child support grant. The selected sample comprised of female participants who were between the ages of 20 and 65. The majority of the participants in all the groups (90%; 113 out of 126) did not have husbands, life partners, or children who are employed. This confirmed that the majority of participants in the wards did not have secondary income in their households. Of this 90%, only 20% (22) were widowed. The rest had never been married. However, all participants had children that they supported. These were either biological or children of deceased family members that they took care of. The other 10% (13) had husbands, life partners, or children who were at an employable age but unable to find employment.

Also, all participants were semi-literate as they could all read and write. On average, 40% (51) of the participants had reached the secondary education level but had not completed their high school education. It was also noted that of the six groups; three

groups were led by reasonably educated women. For instance, one group was led by a retired community care giver (CCG), another group was led by a retired machinist (dress-maker), and one other group was led by an unemployed University of South Africa student who has passion for sports, and thus, coordinated recreational activities twice a week in a church hall for local women. The rest were led by women who had never been employed and without any specific skills, except for the willingness to do good and contribute to the well-being of the community.

On the issue of household income per month, the greatest concern was that, R3000.00 appeared to be the ceiling. Not even a single household had a total income of above R3000.00 per month. In terms of the means of income, 60% (76) of the participants indicated that they received child support grant and were seeking employment. 30% (38) had already qualified for old age pension and 10% (13) were not getting any support from the state due to inadequate documentation, which is required for social grant applications for their qualifying children. These had also not reached pension age.

A reasonable percentage of participants indicated their efforts to supplement the limited household income through other means which included selling fruits on the streets, doing piece jobs in the neighbourhood like domestic work, while some are collecting and selling second-hand clothes. However, the researcher noted that, in the main, only research participants who were around the age of fifty and above indicated that they do supplement their household income, while the younger ones relied solely on social grants.

Most importantly, for women in ward 47, 80% (49 out of 63) of the participants lived with parents, and some were sharing with siblings in inherited homes. Others confirmed that they lived with relatives. Notably, in terms of the demarcation, a major part of ward 54 had informal settlements and a peri-urban area, and a small portion of the ward had formal housing. On the above basis, the issue of property ownership was not as accurate in comparison with ward 47.

5.3.2.2   ANALYSIS OF THE FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS

As indicated earlier, the focus group discussions followed the pre-arranged questions. However; during the actual engagements, critical issues surfaced, which directed the discussion process to four key findings, which appeared to be the core in relation to social protection and women, particularly women who are heading households. The key findings were about (i) how women become aware of the government programmes which are designed to support them for sustainable economic empowerment, (ii) access to these government programmes, (iii) the impact of the government designed programmes post-1994 and, (iv) the submissions of women in terms of how government could possibly respond more adequately to their economic needs. This part of analysis included the views of local leaders. Information was gathered through voice recording as well as written notes by the researcher and the assistant.   The researcher submits that the below analysis followed the above sequence. Furthermore, direct quotes with respect to views and comparisons in terms of the different groups are made where necessary.

a.   Awareness

The discussion started off with participants' understanding of the concepts of social protection, government legislation on social security and women, and general awareness of services that are offered by the Department of Social Development. From the responses, the researcher deduced that the question was somehow beyond the understanding of the identified sample of participants. Thus, from both groups, the participants could not demonstrate their understanding of the concept of social protection and any legislation on their socio-economic rights.   However, almost all participants were of the view that as much as the actual legislation may not be understood, women in the area are generally aware that government exists and that there are programmes which are designed to meet their socio-economic needs, even though these programmes are not well communicated to them. They further confirmed that they are indeed benefiting from the generally known government grants, which they listed as:-

- *child support grants,*
- *old age pension,*
- *foster care grant,*
- *HIV/AIDS counselling and the support programme for the infected and affected,*
- *support for abused women.*

On a scale of 1-10, 1 being the lowest, and 10 being the highest, the majority (90%) of the participants indicated that in one way or another, they were benefiting from the services provided by the Department of Social Development. Only 10% of the participants indicated that they were not benefiting from any of the above listed services, as much as they do qualify. They further mentioned that there are requirements, which must be met, which unfortunately relate to the Department of Home Affairs, that is, provision of. birth registrations documentation which hinder the processes for some would-be beneficiaries.

With specific reference to how the participants would become aware that government, through the Department of Social Development, have programmes which are designed to support and empower women, participants provided different responses and one specifically stated that: -

"We get pieces of information one by one, and there is no opportunity to give feedback, we are also not able to voice out our complaints". (focus group engagement respondent)

This view was shared by many in the different groups as the majority of participants were of the view that they received broken information, without anything in writing, or clear messages from the service delivery points.

Generally, in the focus groups, the indication was that communities are sensitized of the government programmes but not in a uniform and structured manner that ensures

effectiveness in terms of the dissemination of information. This deduction is based on the confirmation by participants that

- Local councillors regularly convene Ward meetings, but attendance is always poor. It is only those with major problems to report to the councillor who attend. Community members overlook the fact that ward meetings are not always about reporting household and community challenges, but are also about information sharing and sensitizing communities about all recent developments and critical messages from government.

- Izimbizo – community engagements. During discussions, confirmation was made that, in an effort to sensitize their clientele, government departments also hold izimbizo (community engagements) to provide information about the different services offered by government. It further transpired that, in the majority of cases, youth do not participate in such community engagements. This sentiment was also confirmed by local councillors in both wards.

- War-rooms – Operation Sukuma Sakhe meetings. The participants also mentioned that war-rooms are platforms which are beneficial in terms of receiving and sending information through local leadership and government officials who participate in war room meetings and activities. They were further of the view that, in some cases, feedback on reported cases is swifter and precise, which benefits a group at one go, than an individual who should go to the counter at the service delivery centre for information. Again, both councillors welcomed the understanding which was displayed by community members that, at least, war room interventions are appreciated by some, while some do not even bother to participate in war room meetings and immediate intervention programmes.

As most participants were at an economically active age however unemployed, they acknowledged and appreciated the information that they received about social grants and other support programmes. However, one participant added that:

"there is life beyond social grants" (focus group engagement respondent)

The above statement was followed by a robust discussion on the idea that information on how women can be empowered for them to become self-sufficient is minimal, unless shared during community engagements and ward meetings. The majority of the participants were of the view that major government events cannot work as a proper platform to address the issue of the lack of, or fragmented information to communities about government services.

Both local councillors were of the view that in most cases, community members wait for information to follow them instead of going to get information in community engagement meetings and in community service centres. They further mentioned that the culture of entitlement has proven to be the real challenge in terms of social protection, basing their argument on their own assessment that most women lack the willingness to self-develop. They cite issues of high birth rates, which seems to exacerbate poverty in places like Inanda and its surrounding areas.

Generally, what was deduced during the discussions in all the groups was that there were similarities in the issues raised across all the groups in both the wards. Further, women were more inclined to vent their emotions on socio-economic needs such as lack of information as they would also like to lead normal lives, in terms of. being economically independent and able to provide for their families without any support from government through social grants.

An argument is advanced that the willingness to participate in community structures as provided by the municipality in question is key in the social protection for women. Thus, women should be part of the economic development debate through serving and participating in ward committees and all available structures. Nzimakwe and Reddy (2008) state that, *"local government has been constitutionalised as a sphere of*

government and this has signified a conceptual shift from serving as administrative service delivery agents to the promotion of developmental goals and principles, namely, local democracy, sustainable development, a safe and healthy environment and co-operative government."

b.   Access

Previous studies have proven that issues of patriarchy and government's unaccommodating policies have always been the major hindrance for women in accessing and enjoying full benefits in relation to government services, particularly in rural and peri-urban areas. This observation is made by scholars such as Cebekhulu (2003) in her study of gender inequality titled, a Sociological Overview of Women's Lives in Maphumulo, and Buthelezi (2001) in her work, Women, Gender and Development in a KwaZulu-Natal Rural Neigbourhood. However, this study brought to the surface a new angle on the challenges that are faced by women in terms of accessing government programmes which are meant to make their lives better. Amongst the issues raised, those in the following list appear to be the main focus during all focus group discussions:.

- Lack of access to education and training
- Lack of access to business opportunities
- Lak of access to land for economic projects
- Lack of access to bursaries for the children of women who cannot afford to pay university or college fees
- Travelling long distances to access government services
- Corruption in government departments and local counsellors, which affects the image of government to recipients and the society, e.g. asking for and expecting bribes from the poor.
- Lack of commitment on the part of government employees in relation to service delivery, *"it is as if somebody forced them to accept their jobs"*
- Lack of commitment on the part of local political leaders. *"some counsellors are only visible towards elections because they want our votes".*

c. **Education**

Clearly, the mere mention of the above by women in wards 47 and ward 54 in Inanda area confirmed a mind-shift on the part of women. Women are now aware that, despite the existing challenges around social protection and the known issue of patriarchy, women empowerment issues, such as personal development, access to education and training, as well as education for their children is key.

Discussion around education and training appeared to be the main point as, overwhelmingly, the majority of the participants were of the opinion that education is key. However, for women in peri-urban areas and informal settlements, access to basic education and access to business education and training should be prioritised if government intends to ensure economic independence for women in all areas in the province of KwaZulu-Natal. They were further of the view that participating in the labour market for them is not possible as they do not have requisite skills, yet the needs are there and escalating daily.

As the discussion continued, the issue of exploring business opportunities such as forming cooperatives, came up. Some participants indicated that they had never heard of cooperatives, and others had been trained and had had unsuccessfully made attempts to form cooperatives. One participant said that:-

> *"At some point, the ward counsellor called us into a meeting where we were informed of opportunities to form cooperatives and we were going to be assisted with sewing machines and material. A number of primary schools were identified in the area, which we were going to supply with school uniform. I was one of the women who pledged to steer that project based on my skill and experience as a machinist. The project started quite well, however, in our group, there were women who could not sew, could not hold a needle, and we were prepared to support them but, they were not prepared to learn nor do any hand work to support the work of the team. They could only be seen when profit is shared. Also, raising the issue with the counsellor did not work as those ladies were connected with local political leaders, therefore we just had to work hard, and they could just come and demand their share without any contribution. That is how we ended up pulling out of the cooperatives and the*

sewing machines are lying in the counsellor's office collecting dust". (focus group engagement respondent)

The above statement triggered a robust discussion around political cliques and connections, which affect government's good intentions. Another example around local political leaders and manipulation was on the food parcels that are distributed by the Social Development Department, which are generally meant for the needy and aged. It was pointed out that the distribution does not generally go as intended by the department due to political cliques and connections. One participant explains as follows:

You find that food parcels will be displayed in the presence of the departmental officials and the local counsellor entrusted with the distribution. However, once the function gets over, you see the politically connected ladies collecting food parcels, and qualifying families will not get anything. (focus group engagement respondent)

Furthermore, regarding the issue of access to business opportunities and forming cooperatives, a small percentage of women had no knowledge of cooperatives and indicated that they would appreciate such opportunities. They went to the extent of explaining that besides projects like sewing, which require a special skill, or baking and gardening which should be easy to do, opportunities had never been presented to them.

Since the study was conducted in a partly peri-urban, partly semi-formal and partly informal settlement, the issue of land for gardening projects was raised by women as a serious concern. Their argument was that food from the garden would support the minimal household income. However, access to land and seeds had never been considered by the municipality. They were of the opinion that this would be a breakthrough, considering the high rate of poverty, for instance, in areas such as where the study was conducted studied.

In a nutshell, women were of the view that it is unfortunate that government has to work through local political leadership. This is because, at times, it becomes a disadvantage to the intended beneficiaries. They also felt that they should be listened to directly, instead of the top-down approach, which at times does not assist them at all. They believed that undoing the top-down model will possibly make some difference in terms of access, effectiveness and efficiency.

On the contrary, the local leadership denied the discontents and accusations of the people and argued that the needs are always above the means. They further mentioned that local councillors are the face of government, therefore, they always do their best in providing necessary support for communities. They believed that the problem is bigger than meets the eye. The ward 54 local councillor added that,

> *"When we were liberated, a culture of dependency was created and it is now embedded in the system. This free everything is just not working and it is killing our women and the society at large. Councillors houses are burnt down everyday because of the belief that we steal from our communities, something which is myth and all this is based on the lack of understanding on the part of community members, that councillors do not have access to cash, incentives etc. we earn only salaries". (focus group engagement respondent)*

Consequently, the ward 47 councillor cautioned that government would be lying to itself if it claims that the current strategy around social protection is working. He further stated that the strategy needs to be reviewed and the eThekwini citizenry must be allowed to take responsibility for their own development as there is clear lack of willingness by community members, including women, to participate even in business opportunities because government is going to provide. He further mentioned the issue of social grants, stating that that it has exacerbated laziness and the culture of dependency.

Majority of participants also mentioned that they had children who had matriculated but were unable to further their studies due to lack of access to bursaries. Yet they believed that education is key to the economic upliftment of poor families and the

society in general. They were of the view that access to bursaries for children who come from women and child headed households should be one of the primary issues to be discussed by government. They were further of the view that the high crime rates in highly congested areas like Inanda are partly due to the high unemployment rates, low education levels and lack of skills development for young adults.

Lastly, on the issue of access to basic government services, the majority of women in all the focus group discussions expressed a concern that some government officials and political leaders are corrupt and this hinders swift access to services. The issue of bribes and political connections resurfaced. Participants noted that only the politically active and visible women seem to be better positioned to easily access services more easily than those who are not politically connected. Women were generally of the view that if government could root out corruption and political connections, access to basic services will be enjoyed by many, in a just and fair manner.

In both wards, counsellors responded to the issue of corruption by indicating that government has internal procedures in terms of dealing with issues of corruption. They added that aggrieved members of the community have a right to report corruption and provide evidence for government to take appropriate action against the perpetrators. They further added that communities need to be mindful of the fact that the government purse is not able to take care of all their needs. Thus, women need to avail themselves when opportunities are presented to them, minimal as they can be, because personal development and education appears to be the only solution for sustainable social protection.

d. Impact

Generally, the responses from participants were similar across the focus groups as they primarily appreciated the impact of political liberation since 1994, which was followed by socio-economic upliftment in terms of access to different government programmes. All participants alluded to the apartheid history, the segregation which

ensured that some services were only enjoyed by other races except black Africans prior-1994. They made mention of free and low cost housing programmes, free primary education in some rural and township schools, equal access to business opportunities, open recruitment processes in terms of employment opportunities and, most importantly, access to government social grants.

The researcher noted the fact that almost all participants had similar concerns. Almost all the groups appreciated the remarkable socio-economic upliftment of South Africans since 1994. However, they also note that there is still a lot to be done if government is to realize social protection, particularly for women post-1994. A clear mention was made of the issue of crime, which is as a result of the high unemployment rate. Also, lack of access to higher education and training as women are unable to finance their children's education beyond the basic level, was highlighted as contributing to the pool of unemployable youth in the townships, informal settlements and rural areas. Unequivocally, over-reliance on social grants for daily survival mainly in women headed households was debated at length.

The respondents also highlighted the fact that government has programmes in place. However, social grants appeared to be the main programme which the communities felt had and continued to make a huge impact in their lives. One respondent expressed this as follows:-

> *I may go hungry with my family now, but at least I know for sure that, there will be mealie-meal in the house and some soup on the first day of the month, because I will receive my social grant payment. (focus group engagement respondent)*

Another respondent responded as follows:-

…"despite all the concerns we are raising, our government gives us some dignity through social grants however, we remain on the shoulders of government forever yet, we would also like to fend for ourselves and lead better lives" (focus group engagement respondent)

The above statements were followed by robust discussions around social grants as an unsustainable but highly appreciated government programme, which benefit many households. Participants were of the view that the social grants programme is unsustainable in the sense that, it is basically a child or children who qualifies and not parents. This indicates that a woman who does not have a child or children within the qualifying age will not qualify, even if the needs and responsibilities are weighing on her shoulders as the head of the household.

Furthermore, a concern was raised that many women are at an economically active age but less educated, thus, unable to participate in the labour market due to the lack of skills, which exposes them to the lack of social protection post-1994. On a scale of 1-10, 1 being the lowest and 10 the highest, the majority of the participants (80%) were of the view that government, post-1994, has made a positive impact in terms of social protection for women. However, this is basically as a result of the provided safety net, which indicates that much more still needs to be done in terms of empowering women for economic independence.

e.   Suggestions

All sectors to work together

In terms of the suggestions, the majority of participants suggested that government cannot work alone in economic empowerment of women and that all sectors should contribute as empowering a woman means empowering the society. The local leadership in both the wards concurred with the focus groups on the view that the main impact of the government of national unity (post 1994) was political freedom, including the right to vote, equality in terms of access to socio-economic rights and the economic upliftment for all citizens across racial and gender lines.

Creation of economic/business opportunities for women and youth

Both councillors made mention of the eThekwini Municipality Business Support Unit which has supported many in the metro. They were of the view that this particular unit has empowered women in a remarkable way. They were further of the view that, the impact may not be realised by all women at this stage, but the good work of the unit continues. Further emphasis on impact concerned different government programmes which play a pivotal role in uplifting the standard of living in the Metro.

More focus should be on skills development and education

Some of these included the municipality and provincial government housing programme, free basic education, indigent policy for those who qualify and the National Student Financial Aid Scheme (NSFAS).

Also, regarding economic impact, another mention was made of the construction and opening of the Bridge City Shopping Centre within Inanda area, which created job opportunities for many in both wards. Both councillors also alluded to the issue of cooperatives. Stating that initiatives are always made by the municipality but the lack of skills for projects such as sewing has always posed challenges. Lack of access to land has also always posed challenges for agricultural projects.

5.4   Monitoring and Evaluation

The study further aimed to understand the extent of review by policy makers as well as monitoring and evaluation by government as the implementing agent, and as a way to measure progress.

Defining monitoring, Nelson (2016:37-38), states that

> …*"monitoring is the continuing function that aims primarily to provide the management and main stakeholders of an ongoing intervention with early indications of progress, or lack thereof, in the achievement of results. An ongoing intervention might be a project, programme or other kind of support to an outcome."*

She continues to define evaluation as:-

> ….*a selective exercise that attempts to systematically and objectively assess progress towards and the achievement of an outcome. Evaluation is not a one-time event, but an exercise involving assessments of differing scope and depth carried out at several points in time in response to evolving needs for evaluative knowledge and learning during the effort to achieve an outcome."*

The above quotation seeks to outline the concept of monitoring and evaluation and the need thereof in the context of projects or programmes. When specific questions were posed to the one-on-one research participants about monitoring and evaluation, responses were not focussing on women and social protection, the responses were general, suggesting that women are part of the broader clientele which benefits from the designed and implemented programmes. The majority of participants (60%) from the government department where the study was conducted, were of the view that meeting the set targets at the end of the financial year serve as a monitoring and evaluation indicator. The indicators at the end of the three consecutive years were used as sample and all those showed positive statistics to support their position.

On the other hand, 30% of the respondents were of the view that questionnaires and evaluation forms are better tools used to evaluate the effectiveness of the designed and delivered programmes. Thus, the issue was about the value of feedback and research in programme design and implementation. The noted challenge with regards to this mechanism was the admission that once these questionnaires are completed and submitted, implementing the desired changes or reviews is, in most instances, beyond the control of the service centre officials.

A contrary view was advanced that there are challenges with the current monitoring and evaluation strategy as the statistics which are provided at the end of the financial year are for reporting on set targets. Thus, the impact on the ground should be measured by the reduction of the number of social services recipients per year. The argument was that there must be entrants into the system. Those entrants should benefit from the designed and implemented programmes, that is, receive social grants while being economically empowered for self-support in the long run. The same group of entrants should, after a specific period of time, be assisted out through an exit point and empowered to fend for themselves. The highlighted problem was that beneficiaries become permanent recipients throughout a full cycle and the graph is growing each year.

During the discussions, it transpired that there are no specific targets generally set for community leadership. This suggests that there is no specific tool to monitor and evaluate the work of local leadership on the ground. Despite this, questions about monitoring and evaluation in the context of social protection and women were posed to community leaders and community members. Local leaders were of the view that government is trying its best to provide the means to empower women, however, monitoring progress is not easy due to many different factors. One cited challenge was the mentality of women and the society in general. This has to do with the view that people expect government to do everything for them, when they should also be willing to take some reasonable responsibility to lead better lives. Further, the overwhelming view was that the challenge is systemic, both politically and administratively. One local councillor notes that,

"a vote buys everything…we voted, so we should get everything for free"

Another local councillor stated that

> *…government is lying to itself…the current strategy should be reviewed because it is not sustainable. Women are permanently on the shoulders of government through social grants and this is not sustainable.*

The above was further supported by other statements which ranged from the fact that community members are more politically minded than economically minded, which leads to the witnessed political killings because people believe in the myth that holding a political position gives them access to easy cash. Councillors in both wards alluded to issues of corruption such as community members who submit fake documents so as to qualify for child support grants, thereby, abusing the weak government screening and monitoring systems.

Taking from the views of local leadership and the arguments of the individual research participants during one-on-one interview sessions, the annual statistics and evaluation forms appear to be the available and effective strategy for conducting monitoring and evaluation. The researcher, however, examined the assessment of the South African Public Sector monitoring and evaluation to ascertain whether it yields the desired results in practice. In her analysis, Nelson (2016:44) highlights the following:-

- *A culture of compliance but not the full implementation of monitoring and evaluation to reflect on and improve performance,*
- *Duplication of reporting,*
- *Poor planning system which is fragmented with different institutions playing different roles,*
- *A lack of effective theories of change,*
- *Weak integration of planning systems,*
- *Limited use of budget analysis in the implementation of plans, and*
- *No incorporation of monitoring as part of the managerial function.*

The above analysis reflects a government which understands the concept of monitoring and evaluation but practically fails to benefit from its implementation. The implementation at both the municipality and provincial levels of government seems to be more about compliance than effective implementation of monitoring and evaluation

in an effort to constantly review and align programmes for economic development of women and the society in general.

5.5   CONCLUSION

On the basis of the presented findings, it is reasonable to deduce that government has programmes in place which are meant to provide for women post-1994 but not to empower women for self-reliance. A lot still needs to be done in terms of sustainable programmes, which will ultimately ensure economic empowerment for women, with the intention of curbing the evident over-reliance on government through social grants, especially for women who are economically active in terms of age. The presented findings also highlighted the culture of compliance with regards to monitoring and evaluation as opposed to the monitoring and evaluation working as a strategy to measure progress of designed and implemented programmes.

Most importantly, the study revealed some amount of sloppiness on the part of women in participating in the local structures and presented economic development opportunities. This appeared to be a set-back which seems to exacerbate the lack of economic development of women in the Inanda area. This argument is supported by Nzimakwe and Reddy (2008) who note that participation takes a variety of forms. According to them, people may participate in development activities by providing information about the community, taking part in identifying needs, problems and priorities, taking part in deciding about development goals, policies and strategies, or assuming responsibility and accountability for development actions.

CHAPTER SIX

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

6. INTRODUCTION

This study was on women and social protection in South Africa post1994. The preceding chapters provided the contextual background, theoretical framework, research methodology, documentary analysis and the analysis of the collected information. The previous chapter presented the findings which, in response to the research objectives, indicated that government has designed programmes for social protection and empowerment of women, however these programmes are not effectively aligned or instrumental in dealing with the identified challenge of the growing number of economically disempowered women post-1994. Furthermore, the findings revealed that the socio-economic status of women has improved post-1994 but the cited improvement is attributed to the provision of safety nets by government and not from the women's ability to provide for themselves.

This chapter presents the overall conclusion, which broadly covers what was revealed by the study and has been analysed by the researcher in the previous chapter. This chapter also provides an analysis of the conclusions in the context of the theoretical framework that informed this study. Consequently, the chapter presents recommendations, which are essentially suggestions made by the research participants in relation to the issues they found critical during the interviews conducted for the study. The recommendations also reflect the researcher's suggestions based on what was found to be relevant in the context of the goals and objectives of this research. The chapter ends with concluding remarks, responding to the objectives of the study.

6.1. OVERALL CONCLUSION

Primarily, the researcher drew the overall conclusion in line with the main research questions. This conclusion is presented as follows:

6.1.1. What social protection programmes in KwaZulu-Natal are aligned to the empowerment of women?

The study analysis pointed out that the province of KwaZulu-Natal, under the Social Development Department, has programmes in place designed for the economic development of women. These programmes include, Women Development and the Sustainable Livelihoods sub-directorates. However, the study revealed that the impact of the available programmes is not effectively measured to test their alignment and responsiveness to the needs on the ground in terms of the economic development of women. The study, thus, concluded that there are programmes in place, which are meant to strategically respond to the economic needs for women. Moreover, underdevelopment, unemployment and poverty in the areas where the study was conducted appeared to be persistent post-1994. Consequently, responses from the research participants on the socio-economic status of women post-994, informed a further conclusion that despite the highlighted limitations of government programmes, women are better off post-1994 in terms of their socio-economic status and access to services. Of critical importance is the conclusion that this positive change is only attributable to the safety nets provided by government, namely, social grants, free housing and all other accessible social benefits. It was not a result of the positive impacts of designed and implemented economic development programmes.

Thus, women remain economically disempowered and are still unable to fend for themselves post 1994. Majority of the households that participated in the study (90%) confirmed their reliance on government social grants for daily survival. This percentage is informed by the analysis in chapter 5 which indicated that 60% (76 participants) confirmed that they received child support grant, 30% (38 participants) received old age pension and 10% were at an economically active age but unemployed. The participants came across as strongly holding onto the

understanding that there is life beyond social grants. but they are not in a position to help themselves out of the social grant trap.   These safety nets (social grants, free housing, free healthcare) appear to only provide for, rather than empower, citizens. It is also worth noting that these programmes are not gender specific and do not necessarily target women.

The study revealed that there is an element of the geographical identification of poverty and underdevelopment around the province of KwaZulu-Natal, particularly in eThekwini Municipality.   This is evident in the differing extremes that were inadvertently found within the municipality, particularly in the two wards where the study was conducted. One of the two wards had a large part which is informal, highly congested and the population differed from the other ward which was mostly urban (township). Women in one end differed from women in the other end, meaning that women in peri-urban areas would not be equated to women in the urban areas within the same municipality in terms of the levels of education, access to education and general understanding of issues of economic development and social protection. It was concluded that there are programmes in place, and women are, by default, the main beneficiaries. However, the available programmes do not respond in a similar manner to the needs of women in different geographical areas, and women in peri-urban areas are least likely to benefit from some of the available programmes compared to their urban counterparts.

6.1.2   What strategies are in place to ensure these social protection programmes will sustainably ensure the social protection of women?

As noted in the previous chapter, the strategic objective of the Department of Social Development in the province of KwaZulu-Natal is to enhance the lives of the people of KwaZulu-Natal. The study revealed that the department in question, in an effort to live up to strategic objective, has Social Relief and the Care and Support Services to Families programmes, which arguably benefit mainly women as they are the caregivers in the majority of cases. In an effort to respond specifically to the economic development of women, the department reviewed its sub-programmes and designed

166

Women Development and Sustainable Livelihoods sub-programmes in the 2013/14 financial year.

According to the 2014/15 Annual Performance Plan, the Sustainable Livelihoods sub-programme included cooperatives and income generating projects, promotion of local food production and general women empowerment within the sub programme. The study, thus, concluded that, on the basis of the incorporation of these sub-sub-programmes within the Sustainable Livelihoods sub-programme, government in the province of KwaZulu-Natal, has designed and reviewed its strategies for the mainstreaming of women in the periphery. However, measuring the impact of the above strategic interventions was impossible as the 2014/15 annual report indicated that the key performance indicators were merely the number of profiled households, the number of profiled communities, and the last key performance indicator was the number of poor households participating in the food production programmes. It is worth noting again that the criteria did not mention the "number of poor women" participating in the said programmes. This further suggests that there is no specific commitment to target women in poverty alleviation or social protection programmes.

The available strategies have not yielded any positive results as, among the participants in both wards, only one group indicated the reception of support for the establishment of a cooperative. However, the cooperative did not receive much after care, such that the projects allocated to the group of women did not yield the desired results, and the cooperative became dysfunctional. Further, the key performance indicators, which are "profiling" without an indication as to what happens beyond the profiling, did not assist much in terms of the assessment. One would argue that the impact may be realized progressively over time as the two sub-programmes, which were arguably strategically designed for the mainstreaming of women in the periphery came into being only in the 2013/14 financial year, and could only be reviewed over time.

On the contrary, the study found that the culture of dependency has been created and is already embedded in the system. Thus, the mainstreaming of women who are in the periphery appears to be a huge task that will require a political discussion which will subsequently crate a mind shift in relation to women and economic development. There was strong view among participants that the communities must also be allowed to take responsibility for their own economic development, rather than waiting for government to provide. The researcher noted the views advanced by officials from the department where the study was conducted and the local leadership. This is reflected in the contention that "this free everything policy direction is just not working, it is clearly creating and exacerbating the dependency culture among women and the society".

This led to a conclusion that one of the fundamental contributory factors to the economic challenges faced by women is the emphasis on provision in the whole social protection agenda, instead of development. The majority of the respondents were of the view that the current emphasis on provision has created a culture of expectation on the part of women instead of an encouragement to believe in their mental strength and their physical ability, which then appears to be a systemic consequence. Zuma (2011) mentioned that South African taxpayers should focus on developing the country rather than on feeding the poor. Most importantly, a concern was also raised by the majority of the participants that South Africa has a providing government and not an empowering government. The participants stated that every woman would like to lead an economically stable life, where each would be able to provide for her family without any support from the state. However, a deduction was made that this can only be realized if each woman is economically empowered.

Thus, it is reasonable to conclude that the above statements were indicative of the fact that there is willingness on the part of women to be developed and participate in the economy. This, therefore, suggests that there is a fundamental lack in terms of the enclosure of economic empowerment element in the designed and implemented social protection programmes. Writing about social justice and education, Gebremendhin and Joshi (2016) stated that Mandela supported formal and informal education both

as a means to economic development, and as a means to cultivate human rights, democracy, and social justice more broadly. They further state that the social justice that "they"" associate with Mandela during the struggle for freedom and democracy has, at this moment, gone into decline. From this citation, one deduces an empowering social justice system, which envisaged the prominence of education (formal and informal), and skills development for economic development rather than a provision (feeding the poor), which does not encompass human capital development for economic independence in the long run.

Further, to galvanize the view of the created culture of dependency, and the possible mind-shift, some participants alluded to the issue of mental strength, that once a person's mind is decolonised, a lot is possible in terms of personal development. Thus, a conclusion was reached that the current strategies on social protection post-1994 have created the dependency culture and seems to be exacerbating the expectation of women.

6.1.3   In relation to a outcomes-based administrative system, are there mechanisms to ensure the monitoring of social protection programmes with particular respect to women's career counselling and education?

The study concluded that, currently, there is lack of monitoring and tracking of access to education and training on the part of women. There is also a lack of monitoring and tracking in terms of access to business opportunities, lack of access to land for economic projects, and a lack of access to bursaries for the children of women who cannot afford to finance the education of their children post matric. The study found that, on average, 40% (51 out of 126 participants in the focus groups) of women reached the secondary level of basic education but did not complete their high school education. Only 2% (i.e. the Machinist, Community Care Giver, and the University of South Africa student) had skills but were unemployed. Based on these study outcomes, as well as the analysis of documents, it was concluded that government has programmes in place which are designed to respond to the educational and career counselling needs of women. However, there is no effective relationship between

these systems and the desired outcome in terms of education and training, as well as career counselling with specific reference to women. Some of the fundamental programmes which were found to be relevant in catering for women were listed as ABET, guidance on business opportunities provided by the Department of Social Development, and NSFAS for university education of students from poor families.

It is an appreciated fact that the different government departments have different legislative mandates. However, the distinct lines of demarcation seem to be the impediment in terms of finding more collaborative ways of delivering services. Examples were made that education is the competence of the Department of Education, economic development is the competence of the Department of Economic Development, Tourism and Environmental Affairs, agriculture being a competence of the Department of Agriculture, while all social issues are a competence of the Department of Social Development. The researcher concluded that, it is critical to note that there is one government, therefore, some degree of collaboration would provide both strategic and practical solutions to the current unfavourable lack of exposure to education and career counselling, which has an adverse effect on social protection for women post-1994.

It is further concluded that the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government has a fragmented approach to the education and career counselling needs of women. There is no effort to mainstream education or counselling to poverty reduction or social development programmes. A deduction is thus made that the unfavourable administrative outcomes, in terms of women and social protection, are partly a result of fragmentation. The participants were also explicit on the view that education is key if government is to realize social protection post-1994.

Similarly, on education and economic empowerment, Jacquet and Krech (2009:73) are of the view that there is a positive relationship between years of education and returns to income from education. Emphasizing the issue of mental capacitation of women as per the views of some respondents, the study also conclude that there is a

need for a paradigm shift from the current emphasis on provision to unlocking the economic potential of women through formal and informal education, as well as career guidance for young women. It is concluded that skills development remains more critical for the women in peri-urban areas, informal settlements and townships, and women who can no longer be exposed to any educational programme but have the physical ability and mental capacity to fend for themselves.

6.1.4 What could assist in ensuring that social protection for women is realized in democratic South Africa

On the strength of the responses provided by the majority of the study respondents, the study concluded that there should be more focus on skills development, job creation and, most importantly, government should move more towards rural, peri-urban areas, informal settlements and the townships with such initiatives. The study further concludes that there is an urgent requirement for a shift from the current strategic direction, which is more about providing, to put more emphasis on capacity building and empowerment.

Among other suggestions concerning education and skills development, more focus on basic education and ABET was emphasized to deal with the current illiteracy rates and low levels of education among women. It was argued that this will have a positive impact in ensuring that future generations of women do not fall into the same socio-economic trap and over reliance on social grants rather than being self-sufficient. In other words, it will more "be proactive than reactive". The researcher noted a view, which came across strongly during the interviews, that the current government approach to women and social protection can be referred to as "a wheel-barrow syndrome", where government seems to be carrying physically fit women from all angles instead of capacitating them for economic independence.

Importantly, the study also concludes that monitoring and evaluation should be strengthened. The discussions indicated that monitoring and evaluation does not work

as an effective strategy in support of true performance measurement and feedback, which should inform the redesign and re-alignment of programmes. It was argued that emphasis currently is on compliance and accountability reporting than diagnostic reporting.

The study further revealed that monitoring and evaluation in the department where the study was conducted is not effectively utilised as a tool for performance measurement. Annual reports of three consecutive financial years were analysed and it was clear that only quantitative information is required for reporting and measurement of performance. The conducted analysis indicated that the statistical information is submitted for compliance and accountability purposes. It also appeared that reporting is mainly on prepopulated templates with no provision for contextual and narrative reporting (a complete lack of diagnostic reporting).

It was highlighted earlier that provincially, performance reporting is the competence of the Provincial Treasury. Therefore, all reporting templates are designed and circulated to all provincial departments for completion and submission quarterly, half-yearly and annually. This is basically for financial expenditure and performance assessment against the strategic goals of the department and annual targets which are generally set before the beginning of each financial year. Over and above the Provincial Treasury competence in terms of performance assessment, there is internal audit which is coordinated internally within departments but driven by Provincial Treasury. Over and above internal audit, there is external auditing which is conducted by the Auditor General, one of the chapter 9 institutions which plays an oversight role.

As stated earlier, the researcher analysed the reports of the Department of Social Development for three consecutive financial years in chapter four, as well as the responses of the participants from the department in question. The results showed that the department is making progress in terms of the designed programmes and meeting the set targets in each financial year. However, an admission was also made that the numbers of social grants recipients are growing each year, which, for some respondents, should be the real measure of the impact of the designed and

implemented programmes on the ground. It should determine whether the designed programmes are strategically aligned and implemented effectively. The view was that the numbers of social grant recipients should be dropping instead, if the impact was positive. Thus, the concept of monitoring and evaluation and its practical implementation, confirms that monitoring and evaluation is not utilized as an effective tool to assist government in terms of the design and alignment of social protection programmes. It is lacking massively in the intended purpose; thus, its implementation requires an urgent review.

Naidoo (2011:164) states that administrative compliance should not be equated to good governance. The intention here is not to suggest that monitoring and evaluation is the only tool to be utilized in the programme design processes. However, the missing contextual feedback and narrative in government reports remain a critical omission in terms of the assessment of the programmes, alignment to the needs on the ground, the impact and the required reviews. The current state of affairs is tantamount to a routine exercise which translates to a continuous provision in the form of social grants and all the other available social protection programmes instead of human capital development for economic independence.

Naidoo (2011:197) also notes that *"decision-making does not take place in a vacuum, he states that it happens in a specific context which can change and which is biased towards particular issues and priorities."* He further states that whilst monitoring and evaluation information is used for "*decision-making, it is not the sole objective, rational, information driven process, but the implication is that evaluative information is but one, and not the sole, stream of information that is used before decisions are arrived at*." Thus, monitoring and evaluation is a critical element in the strategic decisions taken by organizations. It is argued that the effective application of the concept as opposed to mere compliance, would inform an improved strategic direction towards ensuring social protection for women post1994.

6.2   Theoretical analysis of the conclusion

The study focussed on women and social protection beyond a welfare perspective, and from a developmental perspective.   Further, the study was constructed upon systems theory, complexity theory which underpinned systems theory, sustainable development and New Public Management, which is a management approach.

The South African government made a strategic decision to move from a welfare system to a development approach, that is, from social welfare to social development. The aim is to capacitate its citizens in the process of providing safety nets, as opposed to solely taking a charity approach. Lombard (2008:161) argues that, *"bridging the gap between rich and poor does not bring the marginalised into the mainstream economy."* She further notes that it is the right to development that will do this. Almost 20 years down the line, the NDP (2013) notes that government *"adopted a developmental approach to social welfare provision, in line with the Constitution and the 1997 White Paper on Social Welfare.* It further states that *this includes a focus on the social and economic development of individuals, families and communities."*

Consequently, Midgley (1999:23) clarifies that *"social development's most distinctive feature is its attempt to link social and economic development efforts, and that social development explicitly seeks to integrate social and economic processes, viewing both elements as integral facets of a dynamic process of development."*

The findings of this study revealed a profound fragmentation in terms of the social protection agenda as the economic development element was found lacking. Thus, the move from social welfare to social development appeared to have more theoretical than practical meaning. The findings of this study showed that the Department of Social Development cannot work alone because the social protection agenda requires an integration of services approach, which will incorporate education, economic development and agricultural insights for the sustainability of all provided social support. To this end, a conclusion is made that the theoretical basis upon which

government social development adoption was made does not match the results of implementation in practice.

More broadly, writing ten years after the implementation of the White Paper for Social Welfare Lombard (2008) said that *"the developmental approach to social welfare embraces socio-economic rights, including the right to cash transfer and anti-poverty strategies.* She further states that *progress in this respect during the next decade of the implementation of the White Paper for Social Welfare is promising, given the government's acknowledgement of the neglect of social services and the lack of planning for exit levels in social security."* However, the findings of this study led to a conclusion that the above cited promising progress has not been realised. This is because the finding of this study that there is still no exit strategy in the social security system and that a culture of dependency has been created in the process, instead of bringing the economically marginalised women into the economic mainstream.

On the basis of the above theoretical understanding around social development, which clearly outlines the premise of the social protection agenda post1994, as well as the findings of this study, the researcher could only deduce and logically conclude that the challenge is now systemic in the implementation of the White Paper for Social Welfare. As alluded earlier, Ozer and Seker (2013) are of the view that, "complexity theory argues that systems evolve with each other in a non-linear fashion and systems are subject to dynamic feedbacks both in positive and negative sense." Thus, in the context of this study, the researcher considers the assertion by Jackson (2011:66-67) which states that, "according to the theory of systems dynamics, the multitude of variables existing in complex systems become causally related in feedback loops that themselves interact. He further states that, the systemic interrelationships between feedback loops constitute the structure of the system, and it is this structure that is the prime determinant of the systems behaviour. Again, he mentions that the aim of the system dynamic is to provide managers with an understanding of the structure of complex systems so that they can intervene to ensure behaviour that fits their goals."

The above assertions would arguably assist public managers in in terms of analysis and finding relevant interventions to aid the achievement of social protection beyond the goals of a welfare perspective. Further, the theoretical understanding of a system for organizational improvement is clarified by Potocki and Brocato (1995) who recommend that the quality of "improvement approach is not a program or an organization intervention with specific beginning, middle, and end, however, it is a system of management, strategic in nature, open to the environment, cyclical in operation, striving for equilibrium and seeking optimization." They are further of the view that this improvement can *"come from sensing the environment, the processing being done by people using technology and methods to do analysis and make decisions, and the output constitutes the response of the system to the input."* The above approach seeks to emphasise the element of interconnectedness of the different components in a system which is alluded to in chapter two, where it is mentioned that each layer in a system has a role to play for effectiveness and efficiency, and the order of events is tracked through monitoring and evaluation.

Having alluded to the significance of systems theory in this theoretical conclusion, the researcher further considers the assertion by Hintea, Profiroiu and Ticlau (2015) that public organizations are faced with an increasing array of problems, including increased pressure to respond in an efficient manner to complex social, economic and political challenges, while at the same time, they are seen as part or actual sources of these problems. The department where the study was conducted, including the entire KwaZulu-Natal provincial administration, are not immune to the above condition. There are systemic consequences, lack of direction in terms of narrative reporting, which would consequently have an adverse effect on feedback and realignment of programmes ultimately delivered on the ground, as well as lack of monitoring and evaluation in the administration processes. The end result is the constant burden that government has in terms of women who are not economically empowered post-1994. There is also the general increase, instead of decline, in the numbers of social grants recipients, a consequence of ineffectiveness and inefficiencies in the public administration processes.

In response to such quagmire, Pfiffner (2005) highlights the advantage of the application of New Public Management. He states that, *"the term new public management encompasses a wide range of techniques and perspectives which are intended to overcome the inefficiencies inherent in the traditional model of public administration."* He also observed that the primary aim in the application of NPM is to achieve accountability through the measurement of outcomes rather than accounting for inputs.

In the same vein, Loncar (2015) is of the view that *"the overall goal of NPM is to create a system as small and efficient as possible."* He adds that *"such a system should follow strategic goals, streamlined by corresponding action ad project plans that would be subjected to performance control on a regular basis, further mentioning that key performance indicators used with this regard should be effectively introduced to public managers/civil servants and aligned with the state budget."*

Similarly, Alford and Greve (2017) are of the view that, *"at the core NPM, was the notion of installing a strategic intent in public sector organizations, requiring and to some extent pushing them to articulate their purposes and drive, enable, empower and even inspire their departmental staff to pursue them. They are further of the view that the above also encouraged a variety of corporate planning features as well as a systematic management-by-results, or performance-based management regime in the public sector, the emphasis being on "mission-driven government".*

Thus, the depicted systemic challenges in the social protection agenda, in the implementation of the White Paper for Social Welfare, is partly informed by the fundamental lack of the application of business management principle, which are embedded in the new public management approach. The introduction and application of the market related model in the public service seems to have the potential to ensure a positive impact in terms of responding efficiently to the complex social and economic challenges of the country. It is, thus, concluded that this theoretical sequence of

events would ensure effectiveness and efficiency in the design of strategically aligned social protection programmes and their implementation thereof.

A further conclusion is that a multi-disciplinary approach towards social protection for women beyond the welfare perspective is crucial, hence the inclusion and discussion of sustainable development amongst the theories. As mentioned earlier, the NDP (2013) alludes to the "focus on the social and economic development of individuals, families and communities." In the same vein, Kates, Parris and Leisrowitz (2016) write about the meaning of sustainable development, its goals, indicators, values and practice. In their analysis, they identify "what is to be sustained" in the sustainable development concept and they mention three categories, which are nature, life support systems and the community. On the other hand, in their analysis of "what is to be developed", they identify three distinct categories which are people, economy and society. They clearly agree that sustainable development implies linking what is to be sustained with what is to be developed.

The above reasoning about sustainable development and its goals and values is not detached from the objectives of the NDP (2013) and the rationale behind the government move from social welfare to social development. Thus, a view is held in this conclusion that the economic capacitation of women through relevant skills and access to natural resources for economic gain will ensure that the constitutionally envisaged social development is realised. The argument is that women's economic empowerment and sustainable development cannot be separated. This is corroborated by Pathania (2017) who reiterates that sustainable development cannot be achieved without gender equality. He states that it depends on an equitable distribution of resources. He further mentions that "women's empowerment is a key factor for achieving sustainable economic growth, social development and environmental sustainability."

6.3 RECOMMENDATIONS

The following recommendations are advanced in line with the research findings of this study and its conclusions thereto.

6.3.1 Programme design and roll-out should be according to the economic needs of the different geographical areas

It is evident that a number of women in peri-urban areas, informal settlements and some in the townships, still do not understand their basic rights as they are not exposed to the developmental activities of government. The explanation that emerged for this situation was that the geographical location of these women is the cause of the disparity in their awareness and knowledge of their basic rights.

This is supported by Popenoe (2004) who notes that indeed poverty, inequality and underdevelopment are geographically identified and gendered. A positive aspect was however noted by the researcher on the part of women who are in the peri-urban areas that, despite the issues of patriarchy, they do have that limited access to inherited land for agricultural projects, building block-making projects, livestock and other economic projects, as opposed to women in informal settlements and townships. However, access to funding and equipment and business support remains out of reach for most of these women.

A suggestion was made that appropriate capacity building for women in different geographical areas be made progressively, starting with sensitizing them on their basic rights, on how to deal with issues of patriarchy, followed by the provision of necessary support by the programmes available in the different government departments and all parastatals. After care is also recommended for effectiveness and sustainability purposes. This is basically to make them better understand their basic rights and further unlock their economic potential, which will ultimately result in the economic advancement of their households and the society in general.

The above recommendation was further advanced based on the understanding that the needs may be generally similar, but the differing levels of understanding may have an indirect impact on the intended recipients. Thus, a recommendation was made that women in peri-urban areas, informal settlements and townships be afforded special attention, which will suit their level of understanding and then relevant capacitation initiatives be rolled out for the intended impact and sustainability purposes.

6.3.2 Effective needs analysis should be conducted

Consequently, it is recommended that the custodian department (the Department of Social Development) should strengthen its research component to conduct needs analysis on the ground, which will ultimately inform improved strategies and design of more responsive programmes and sub-programmes Also, a better aligned key performance indicators in to support constant reviews is recommended.

6.3.3 Some terms and conditions should be considered for the social grants recipients as the current strategy seems unsustainable

As noted earlier, the current "free everything" strategy should be reviewed and some conditions must be introduced for social support recipients. The research respondents were of the view that the current strategy is not sustainable, making an example of free housing, free health-care, free education and social grants. The strong view was that some conditions must be introduced. An example which was made was that there must be an entry point into the system, as well as an exit point after the social grant recipient has been economically empowered and is able to self-support, instead of having permanent recipients throughout the cycle.

A recommendation is thus made that entrants should be introduced to different kinds of compulsory empowerment programmes in an effort to ensure the mainstreaming of women who are in the periphery. The empowerment programme should run for a

specific period, after which the entrant will be assessed and assisted to either seek employment or gain access to relevant business support programme. In support of the above, a further recommendation is made that government provides a separate budget allocation for such programmes, instead of increasing the social grants budget each financial year.

6.3.4. Political vs Administrative Interface

It was further emphasized that the starting point should be the political level, a level which should admit that the political policy direction must inform the administrative strategic direction. Thus, the debate to review the current social protection strategy should be driven politically for it to yield the desired results. It is argued that this will contribute a great deal to the economic upliftment of women and communities. It was argued that eventually, each element in a system can play a role for the whole to yield desirable results. In essence, a full overhaul of the social protection strategic direction is recommended.

6.3.5 Access to Resources

The study confirmed the criticality of access to resources such as land and equipment. During the interviews, the respondents emphasised the fact that land serves as a base for food production (food security), but land can work as a means for income generation. Clearly, lack of access to land appeared to be having multiple effects on the society where the study was conducted. Some of the respondents expressed a concern that no accommodation was made for economic development projects such as in. agricultural projects and home gardens when demarcations were made. But some of the respondents who were located in the peri-urban part of Inanda were of the view that access to land without the necessary support such as seeds and equipment is not helpful.

The major part of Inanda is densely populated, with limited access to land for some, and absolutely no opportunity for access to land for other households. The high level

of congestion is clearly visible and unhealthy in the major part of the wards. As an urgent relief, container and roof gardens were suggested, the responsibility to be shared by both the municipality and the Department of Agriculture and Rural Development, In other words, the provincial government should provide the skills and seeds. A suggestion was further made that while the provincial government takes responsibility for the above, the municipality should provide containers, the required material and after care for sustainability of the programme. This will arguably contribute massively to access to basic food and a means for income generation.

6.3.6 Collaborative efforts are required towards devising a development driven social protection agenda

A recommendation is made that the South African Government, through the Department of Social Development, working in collaboration with the Department of Education and the Department of Economic Development, should strategically formulate a development driven social protection agenda, which will focus on the holistic economic empowerment of women through education and skills development. An overall deduction was drawn from this study that education and skills development is a long-term investment (human capital investment), which will ensure sustainable economic empowerment for women. Elaborating on human capital investment, the majority of the respondents raised concerns that access to decent jobs requires job seekers to meet specific requirements and access to business opportunities requires a certain level of education and a reasonable understanding of business processes. Additionally, for an aspiring business woman to qualify for bank loans to fund a small business, sufficient education and a reasonable understanding of business language is an advantage.

To support the above recommendation, it is suggested that more focus be put on adult basic education and training for women who are at an economically active age, that is, women who do not qualify for any government social grant and are below the pension age. This is the category of women which is not eligible to benefit in any of the available social grants, but have basic needs to be satisfied. Equally significant is

the recommendation that government and the private sector should ensure access to bursary schemes for female youth, with the aim to ensure that the forth-coming generation of women parents is appropriately educated for them to participate in all available the economic activities around them. This will progressively ease the load on the shoulders of government in terms of the escalating number of social grant recipients. It will further increase the number of women who independently participate in economic activities.

This recommendation is meant to inculcate the value of education in women and youth for economic independence. It is also based on the understanding that it would be a holistic approach to curb the correlating issues of crime in townships, peri-urban areas and informal settlements, where there is high concentration of women headed households (poverty-stricken communities). The majority of the participants were clear that their children wonder around after completing high school education due to inability to pay for higher education, which adversely lead to the high unemployment rates and crime.

The study found that communities are generally led by councillors who lack educational enlightenment, which has a negative effect on community development and effective leadership on the ground. Research participants were of the view that a less educated leader will not fully appreciate the need for education, community empowerment, sustainable development and most importantly, the management of limited resources and ethics. Further, the respondents were of the view that the technological world and the need for effective communication cannot be over-emphasised, which confirms the need for educationally and technologically inclined local leaders. Based on these critical observations and the general experience of the research participants on the difference between educationally enlightened and educationally challenged local leaders, it is recommended that there must be minimum requirements for local councillors. For instance, a local councillor must have at least a matric certificate to qualify for any community leadership position.

The above recommendation is made noting the provisions of the South African Constitution (1996) that there is no minimum requirement for local councillors. However, the research participants were of the opinion that experience is the best teacher and innovation will always take communities forward. The above is an experience-based recommendation on the part of the research participants, which seeks to support the government's notion of enhanced and effective service delivery.

6.3.7 The Department of Social Development should consider developing sector-specific reporting templates for aligned and more effective monitoring and evaluation.

It is recommended that the Department of Social Development should develop its sector specific templates, which will be aligned to its strategic goals, performance objectives and deliverables (outputs). The view is that these will assist the department in terms of submitting statistical information, supported by the currently omitted diagnostic and contextual narratives. This exercise requires only the effort of internal management, guided by the realities on the ground. The recommendation is informed by the glaring lack of diagnostic reporting on the part of the Social Development Department due to the provided reporting templates which require only quantitative information.

This recommendation does not take away the responsibility from the custodian department to comply with the prescribed monitoring and evaluation templates. However, it is meant to address the diagnostic reporting needs and for the department to benefit from the feedback, which could guide the review process in terms of programme design, implementation and performance measurement. Also, the above recommendation forms part of research and innovation, which is permissible in the field of public administration.

6.3.8 Customised programmes for peri-urban and rural women should be designed and implemented according to the identified needs (geographical identification of different needs for women in different areas)

This study revealed that women are the main beneficiaries of the designed social relief programmes. However, it was found that this was not by design but by default. It could be argued that this was a result of the fact that women are the majority in terms of the statistics, and the fact that they are considered the main caregivers and heads of households. Further, it was indicated earlier that the study revealed an element of the geographical identification of poverty, inequality and underdevelopment. Thus, it is recommended that, programmes which will target women specifically, in rural and peri-urban areas in particular, be designed and customised to suit their specific levels of understanding, thus creating relevant capacitation. This is over and above the available Women Development and Sustainable Livelihoods programmes, which appeared to be catering for women in general, not specifically designed for women with different levels of understanding and different resources available for utilisation.

6.4 CONTRIBUTION OF THE STUDY TO THE BODY OF KNOWLEDGE IN THE PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION DISCIPLINE

This study drew on organisational theories of administration. Further research can use other relevant theories like the principal agency theory as this would provide more in-depth analysis. Against the backdrop of the theories applied in this study, a model is advanced for possible inclusion in planning and designing future social protection programmes. Below is the summary of a recommended strategic model that the provincial government in KwaZulu-Natal could consider. The model is based on the analysis and conclusion of this study. Further, figure 6.1 presents the diagrammatic conclusion and contribution to the body of knowledge in the field of public administration.

CURRENT GOVERNMENT STRATEGY

- A providing government *vs* an empowering government

- A reactive government *vs* a proactive government

- Unsustainable social grants programme *vs* capacitation and skills development for sustainable economic empowerment of women

- Numbers of social grant recipients, women being the main beneficiaries increase each year instead of dropping, all due to lack of strategic analysis on the part of policy makers and administrators.

Figure 6.1. Social Protection Cycle – a summary of observations

01 Inherited economic hardships

02 Women heading house-holds, with social grants as the only economic means to provide for families

03 Needs assessments conducted for sustainable economic empowerment of women

04 exposure to relevant programs/skills development/capacitation

05 after-care/support while finding means to self-sustain

06 Empowered/Ready to be out of the system

07 Exit! Economically Empowered

End of Cycle

government strategy in response

Recomended Social Protection Cycle For Women

Source: Author (2019)

6.5   CONCLUSION

To recap on the study objectives, the study aimed, first, to determine whether or not the KwaZulu-Natal provincial government has in place social protection programmes that are strategically aligned with women empowerment;

Second, the study aimed to establish whether these programmes are strategically implemented with a view to ensure sustainable social protection for women, and

Lastly, the study aimed to understand and explain the extent of engagement by public policy-makers and public administrators in monitoring and evaluation of social protection programmes for women.

In conclusion, the findings of the study suggested that the province of KwaZulu-Natal, under the Department of Social Development, which is the custodian of social protection in the province, has strategically designed programmes and these are effectively implemented. However, the study further concluded that the available programmes are not strategically aligned on the basis that, if the available programmes were aligned, a perfect measure of the alignment would be the decline in the numbers of economically disempowered women in the province of KwaZulu-Natal. However, the majority of women in the province of KwaZulu-Natal are reliant on government social grants for daily survival post-1994. Thus, a conclusion was drawn that the available programmes are not strategically aligned to meet the social protection needs for women on the ground.

Further, the study found that the designed and implemented programmes are not sustainable neither do they have the potential to ensure social protection for women post-1994. An example is the social grants programme which appeared to be the most accepted intervention programme, which is effectively funded through the fiscus, while the economy of the country is also ailing. Of critical importance is the finding that government in the province of KwaZulu-Natal is not benefiting from the implementation of monitoring and evaluation, which results should be informing the review of the policy direction, and ultimately informing the review of the administrative direction. It was

concluded that currently, monitoring and evaluation is implemented for compliance and accountability purposes, whilst it should work as an effective tool for performance measurement, with an intention to drive the alignment of programmes on the ground for efficiency, effectiveness and for constant reviews as and when the need arises. On the basis of the above, a recommendation is made that the custodian department devises its own reporting templates, which will accommodate both statistics and narratives, and then complete the Provincial Treasury templates having provided much clearer depiction of what is happening on the ground.

7. LIST OF REFERENCES

Books and Journal Articles

Alford, J & Greve, C 2017. Strategy in the Public and Private Sectors: Similarities, Differences and Changes. *Admin.Sci.* 7,35; doi:10.3390/admsci7040035. www.mdpi.com/journal/admsci

Al-Roubaie, A. 2013. *Building Knowledge Capacity for Sustainable Development in the Arab World.* Vol. 2 No. 1. Ahalia University, Bahrain

Armat R.M, Assaroudi A, Rad M, Sharifi H, Heydari A. 2018. *Inductive and Deductive: Ambiguous Labels in Qualitative Content Analysis.* The Qualitative Report 2018. Vol. 23, No. 1. Where the World Comes to Learn Qualitative Research.

Beneria, L & Bisnath, S 2001. *Gender and Development: Theoretical, Empirical and Practical Approaches.* Volume II. UK. Edward Elgar Publishing Limited

Braun, V, Clarke, V. 2006. Using Thematic Analy2sis in Psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3 (2) pp. 77-101 ISSN

Checkland, P 2000. Systems Thinking, Systems Practice. London. Wiley & Sons Limited.

Creswell, J W 1994. *Research Design, Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches.* Third Edition. London. Sage Publications.

Christensen, T & Laegreid, P 2011. Complexity and Hybrid Public Administration – Theoretical and Empirical Challenges. Vol. 11, Issue 4, pp 407-423

Christy, R D, 2004. *Achieving Sustainable Communities in a Global Economy.* London. World Scientific Publishing

Copeland, V C & Wexler S. 2015. Policy Implementation in Social Welfare*: A Framework for Analysis.* Vol. 22, Issue 3, Article 4.

De Leon P & De Leon L 2002. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory.* Vol. 12, Issue 4. University of Colorado, Denver

Denhardt, R B & Denhardt, J V 2009. Public Administration: An Action Orientation. Sixth Edition. Wadsworth, USA.

Denhardt, R B & Grubbs, J W 2003. Public Administration: An Action Orientation Fourth Edition. Wadsworth. USA

Doorgapersad, S 2011. Paradigm Shift from New Public Management: Theory and Practice in Africa. The Journal for Transdisciplinary Research in Southern Africa, 7 (2) December 2011, pp. 235-250

Dorrit P, Rogan M. 2009. Women, Income and poverty: Gendered access to resources in Post-Apartheid South Africa. Agenda: Empowering Women for Gender Equity. No. 81

Dupper, O & Garbers, C 2009. Equality in the Workplace: Reflections from South Africa and Beyond. Juta and Co. RSA

Eastin, J & Prakash A 2013. Economic Development and Gender Equality: *Is There a Gender Kuznets Curve*? World Politics. Vol. 65, Issue 01. pp 156-186

Ferrante J. 2008. *Sociology, A Global Perspective*. USA. Thomson Wadsworth Publishers

Gebremendhin, A & Joshi D K 2016. Social Justice and Human Rights Education Policy Discourse: *Assessing Mandela's Legacy*. 20 (1), 172, 198. Singapore Management University

Ghauri, P, Gronhaug, K & Kristianslund, I 1995. Research Methods in Business Studies: *A Practical Guide*, New York: Prentice Hall

Greuning G. 2001. Origin and Theoretical Basis of New Public Management. *International Public Management* Journal No. 4 (2001) 1-25. Elsevier

Hope, K R 2001. The New Public Management: Context and Practice in Africa. *International Public Management* Journal 4 (2001) 119-134

Hughes, O E 2012. Public Management and Administration. Fourth Edition. London, Palgrave Macmillan Publishers

Jackson, M C 2000. Systems Approaches to Management. Kluwer Academic/Plenum Publishers. New York

Jackson, M C 2011. Systems Thinking: Creative Holism for Managers. Eleventh Edition. United Kingdom. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd

Kalimullar, N.A, Ashraf-Alam K.M, Nour M.M.A. 2012. New Public Management: Emergence and Principles. BUP Journal, Vol. 1, Issue 1. ISSN: 2219-4851

Kemp, R, Parto, S, & Gibson R 2005. Governance for Sustainable Development: *Moving from Theory to Practice*. Vol. 8. Nos 1/2.

Kihlstrom, A 2012. Luhmann's System's Theory in Social Work: *Criticism and Reflections*. Journal of Social Work 2012 12: 287. SAGE

Klijn, E H 2008. Complexity Theory and Public Administration: *What's New; key concepts in Complexity Theory Compared to their Counterparts in Public Administration*. Public Management Review, Vol 10. Issue 3: 299-317

Kumar, M & Singh C 2013. Public Administration: New Challenges. Regal Publications. New Dehli

Lay, K & Dayley, J G 2007. *A Critique of Feminism Theory*. Vol. 8. No 1. IN 462002-5156

Lombard, A 2008. The Implementation of the White Paperfor Social Welfare: *A Ten-Year Review*. The Social Work Practitioner-Researcher, Vol. 20 (2),

Matsa, W 2011. Who is Dependent, Third World or First World, Women or Men*: Salient Features of Dependency and Interdependency*. Vol. 13, No 6, ISSN. 1520-5509

Midgley, J 1999. Social Development: The Developmental Perspective in Social Welfare. Second Edition. London. SAGE Publications

Mubangizi, JC. 2018. Poverty and social exclusion in South Africa: Implications for human rights and sustainable development. *Loyola Journal of Social Sciences*. Volume 31 (2), 25-44

Norunzi, M R 2011. Policy Affairs and Policy Implementation Issues*: How Policy Implementation Can Be Effective?* Vol. 1, No.1. ISSN 2161-7104

Nzimakwe, T I & Reddy, P S 2008. Community Participation in eThekwini Municipality. African Journal of Public Affairs

Ozer, B & Seker G 2013. Complexity Theory and Public Policy: *A New Way to Put New Public Management and Governance in Perspective*. Vol. 18, No. 1 pp 89-102. Suleyman Demirel University

Pappas, E 2012. A New Systems Approach to Sustainability: *University Responsibility for Teaching Sustainability in Contexts*. Vol. 3. ISSN: 2151-7452

Pathania, S K 2017. Sustainable Development Goals: *Gender Equality for Women's Empowerment and Human Rights*. Vol. 5 Issue.4. ISSN-2350-0530 (O), 2394-3629 (P)

Peters, B G & Pierre J 2009. The Handbook of Public Administration. *Concise Paperback Edition*. London, Sage Publications Incl.

Phukon D. 2008.   Gender Development Approach and Social Protection: *Understanding the Case of Assam. The Indian Journal of Political Science*, Vol. 69, No. 4 (Oct – Dec, 2008), pp. 771 - 785

Popenoe, R 2005. Feeding Desire: *Fatness, Beauty, and Sexuality among a Saharan People*. USA: Routledge

Potocki, K A & Brocato, R 1995.   A System of Management for Organizational Improvement. Johns Hopkins APL Technical Digest. Vol. 16, No. 4.

Remler, D K, & Van Ryzin G G 2011. *Research Methods in Practice. Strategies for Description and Causation*. London, Sage Publications

Rowan-Campbell, D 1999. Development with Women. UK. Oxfam Publication

Rowlands, J 1997. Questioning Empowerment. *Working with Women in Honduras*. UK. Oxfam Publishers

Roux, N L 2002. Public Policy-Making and Policy Analysis in South Africa Amidst Transformation, Change and Globalization: *Views on Participants and Role Players in the Policy Analytic Procedure*. Journal of Public Administration. Vol. 137. No. 04. December 2002.

Schneider, M & Somers M. 2006. Organizations as Complex Adaptive Systems: *Implication of Complexity Theory for Leadership Research*. Newark, NJ 07102-1982 USA

Sharma, K D, Pathania, M S, Lal H 2006. Farming System Approach for Sustainable Development of Agriculture in Mountain Regions: *A Case of Himachal Pradesh*. Agricultural Economics Research Review. Vol. 19, pp 101-112

Sharp, J A, Peters, J & Howard K. 2006. The Management of a Student Research Project. Third Edition. USA. Gower Publishing Limited

Visvanathan, N, Duggan, L, Wiegersma, N, Nisoff, L, 2011. The Women, Gender and Development Reader. London. 2nd Edition, Zed Books

Wayne, J & Friedmann H 2006. Dependency Theory: *A Critique. Canadian Journal of Sociology*. Vol. 2, No. 4

Williamson, T & Imbroscio D 2003. *Making a Place for Community: Local Democracy in a Global Era*. New York. Routledge

Wrinkler, C Undated. Feminist Sociological Theory. *Historical Developments and Theoretical Approaches in Sociology*. Vol. 11- Encyclopedia of Life Support (EOLSS)

Yin, R K 2009. Case Study Research. *Design and Methods*. Fourth Edition. USA. Sage Publications

Thesis

Buthelezi, R T 2001. Women, Gender and Development in a KwaZulu-Natal Rural Neighbourhood: *Towards Establishing a Social Development Practice Model*. University of Zululand Doctoral Thesis

Cebekhulu, E N 2003. *Gender Inequality: A Sociological Overview of Women's Lives in Maphumulo*. University of KwaZulu-Natal Masters Thesis

Duma, N C 2012. Organizational Learning in the Department of Sport and Recreation, KwaZulu-Natal: *A Case of Junior Sport Development*. University of KwaZulu-Natal Masters Thesis

Groth, L 2009. Women and Livelihoods: *A Qualitative Study of the Impact of Land Acquisition on Livelihood Strategies for Female Beneficiaries in KwaZulu-Natal*. University of KwaZulu-Natal Masters Thesis

Ile, I S 2007.   A Public Administration Approach to Managing Intergovernmental Relations Systems in the Governance of State*: A Case Review of Nigeria and South Africa*. University of Pretoria Doctoral Thesis

Jolayemi, M B 2003. Job Creation for the Empowerment and Development of Rural Women: *The Role of the Working for Water Programme in Umlaas Catchment Area, KwaZulu-Natal*. University of Natal Masters Thesis

Lekezwa, B I 2011. The Impact of Social Grants as Anti-Poverty Policy Instruments in South Africa: *An Analysis Using Household Theory to Determine Intra-Household Allocation of Unearned Income*. University of Stellenbosch Masters Thesis

Manik, S 1999. The Empowerment of Women: *A Case Study of the Women's Initiative in Inanda*. University of Durban Westville Masters Thesis

Moeng, J K 2011.   Land Reform Policies to Promote Women's Sustainable Development in South Africa. University of Pretoria Doctoral Thesis

Mogaladi, R S 2007.   Capacitating Rural Communities for Participation in the Integrated Development Planning Process.   University of Witswatersrand Masters Thesis

Naidoo, I A 2011.   The Role of Monitoring and Evaluation in Promoting Good Governance in South Africa. *A Case Study of the Department of Social Development.* University of Witwatersrand Doctoral Thesis

Ndinda, C 1997. Coping Strategies of Women Micro-entrepreneurs*: The Case of Women Curio Sellers of the Durban Beachfront*. University of Natal Masters Thesis

Ndinda C 2002. Women's Participation in Housing Delivery in South Africa*. The Extent of Empowerment in Post 1994 Era, with Specific Reference to Case Studies in KwaZulu-Natal*. University of Natal Doctoral Thesis

Nelson, C 2016. Exploring Monitoring and Evaluation Within a Good Governance Perspective: *A Case Study of Stellenbosch Municipality*. University of Stellenbosch Masters Thesis

Ntuli, F S 2003.   From Socio-Political Violence (1985-1997) To Community and Economic Development: Analysis of Richmond, KwaZulu-Natal.   *A Pan-African Centred Perspective Approach*. University of KwaZulu-Natal Doctoral Thesis

Rogan, M 2011. The Feminization of Poverty and Female Headship in Post-Apartheid South Africa, 1997-2006. University of KwaZulu-Natal Doctoral Thesis

Slusser, S R 2009. Gender Empowerment and Gender Inequality, the Global Economy and the State: *Exploring the Relationship Between Economic Dependency, the Political Order, and Women's Status*. PhD Thesis, University of Arkron

Papers

Aliber, M 2002. Poverty-eradication and Sustainable Development. Human Sciences Research Council Publishers, South Africa

Barrientos, A 2010. Social Protection and Poverty*. Social Policy and Development* Paper No. 42. United Nation

Devereux, S 2004. Transformative Social Protection. IDS Working Paper 232. England

Devereux, S 2010. Building Social Protection Systems in Sothern Africa. United Kingdom

De Villiers, B 2008. Review of provinces and local governments in South Africa*: Constitutional foundations and practice*. Johannesburg

Duflo, E Undated. Gender Equality in Development*. Massachunetts Institute of Technology

Ewalt, J G 2001. Theories of Governance and New Public Management*: Links to Understanding Welfare Policy Implementation*. Newark NJ

Fedderke, J & Garlick, R 2008. Infrastructure Development and Economic Growth in South Africa*: A review of the Accumulated Evidence*. University of Cape Town, South Africa

Ferreira, L 2017. Social Grants in South Africa. Separating Myth from Reality. www.africacheck.org Downloaded18 October 2017

Gorostiaga, A, Hurst, K, Nelson J, Schappert, J, & Yeager R. 2011. Women and Sustainability*. Investing in Women's Economic Empowerment*. BSR.

Hesselbarth, S 2005. Socio-economic Impacts of Water Supply and Sanitation Projects. KFW

Hintea, C E, Profiroiu, C M, & Ticlau TC 2015. Strategic Planning and Public Management Reform: *The Case of Romania.* Transylvanian Review of Administrative Sciences, Special Issue

Holzmann, R, & Jorgensen S. 2000. Social Risk Management: *A New Conceptual Framework for Social Protection and Beyond.* Paper No. 0006.

Hughes O. 2008. What is, or Was, New Public Management. IRSPM12

Jacobs, P, Ngcobo, N, Hart, T, & Baipheti M. 2010. Developmental Social Policies for the Poor in South Africa: *Exploring Options to enhance Impacts.* Johannesburg, South Africa

Jacquet, P, & Krech R 2009. Promoting Pro-poor Growth Social Protection. Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development

Kabeer, N 2012. Women's Economic Empowerment and Inclusive Growth: *Labour Markets and Enterprise Development.* United Kingdom

Kates, R W, Parris, T M, & Leiserowitz, A A 2016. What is Sustainable Development*? Goals, Indicators, Values, and Practice.* Environment Science and Policy for Sustainable Development

Koliba, C & Zia, A 2011. Theory Testing Using Complex Systems Modeling in Public Administration and Policy Studies: *Challenges and Opportunities for a Meta-Theoretical Research Program.*

Layman, T 2003. Intergovernmental Relations and Service Delivery in South Africa*. A Ten Year Review.* Sanctioned by the Presidency, RSA

Lazlo, A & Krippner S 1998. Systems Theories: *Their Origins, Foundations, and Development.* J.S. Jordan (Ed). Systems Theories and A Priori Aspects of Perception. Amsterdam: Elsevier

Leonard, A & Beer S. 1994. The Systems Perspectives: *Methods and Models for the Future.* Future Research Methodology. AC/UNU Millenium Project

Loncar, D 2015. Prospects for the Application of New Public Management Approach to the Serbian Public Administration. Review Article. UDK: 005.332:35.07 (497.11)

Lutge, E & Friedman I 2010. The Cycle of Poverty, Hunger and Ill-Health. *Health Systems Trust.* 10.

May J, Sulla V, Zikhali P. 2016. South African Poverty and Inequality Assessment Discussion Note. Ccs.ukzn.ac.za/files/World-Bank-South-Africa-CN Discussion 28 January 2016.

Mathers, N & Slater R. 2014. Social Protection and Growth: *Research Synthesis,* Australian Government, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade

Miller D.Y, Dunn W.N. 2006. A Critical Theory of New Public Management. Univ. of Pittsburgh

Mokhele, T, Weir-Smith, G, & Labadarios, D. 2012. Development of Health Sensity Indicators in South Africa Using GIS. GISSA, Ukubuzana

Mutangadura, G 2004. Women and Land Tenure Rights in Southern Africa: *A human rights-based approach.* London.

Ncube, M, Shimeles, A, & Verdier-Chouchane, A 2012. South Africa's Quest for Inclusive Development. Working Paper Series No. 150.

Nerves, D, Samson, M, van Niekerk, I, Hlatshwayo, S, & du Toit, A 2009. The Use and Effectiveness of Social Grants in South Africa. Economic Policy Research Institute. Cape Town. RSA

Norton, A, Conway, T & Foster M 2001. Social Protection Concepts and Approaches*: Implications for Policy and Practice in International Development.* United Kingdom

O'Connell, H 2015. High-level Event on Women's Empowerment and Sustainable Development. Shaping Policy for Development. odi.org

Odeny, M 2013. Improving Access to Land and strengthening Women's land rights in Africa. Washington

Plagerson, S, Ulriksen, M S 2015. Cash Transfer Programme, Poverty Reduction and Empowerment of Women in South Africa. Working Paper 4. ILO, Geneva

Raniga, T, & Ngcobo, N 2014. Economic Experiences of Single Mothers in Bhambayi, KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa. University of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa

Robbins, G 2005. Pro-Poor Urban Led Case Study: Ethekwini Municipality (Durban) University of KwaZulu-Natal

Scott, Z 2012. Topic Guide on Social Protection. *Governance and Social Development Resource Centre.* University of Burmingham, UK

Soderquist, C & Overakker, S. 2010. Education for Sustainable Development*: A Systems Thinking Approach* - USA

Stevens, C 2010. Are Women Key to Sustainable Development*? Sustainable Developments Insights.* Boston University

Townsend, T 2012. Can Applying Complexity Theory to Problems of Public Interest Improve Policy? *A Periodic Publication Highlighting Developments in the Field of Public Management.*

Vigoda, E 2003. New Public Management. Encyclopedia of Public Administration and Public Policy. Israel

Warth, L & Koparanov, M 2012. Empowering Women for Sustainable Development. United Nations

Yoshino, N, & Nakahigashi M 2000. The Role of Infrastructure in Economic Development. Keio University

Government Documents

Annual Performance Plan of KwaZulu-Natal Department of Social Development 2014/15

Annual Report of KwaZulu-Natal Department of Social Development 2012/13

Annual Report of KwaZulu-Natal Department of Social Development 2013/14

Annual Report of KwaZulu-Natal Department of Social Development 2014/15

Budget Speech of the KwaZulu-Natal Department of Health: MEC Dr. S. Dlomo 2014

Constitution of the Republic of South Africa (1996)

Durban Informal Economy Policy (2001)

Key Note Address: National Department of Transport: Minister D Peters 2013

National Development Plan (2013)

New Growth Path (2009)

Policy Brief 1 on the Inter-Regional Inequality Facility. (2006)

Preferential Procurement Regulation (2011)

Reconstruction and Development Programme White Paper (1994)

Social Assistance Act (2004)

Spatial Development Framework: Review (2015-2016)

South African Constitution (1996)

Statistics South Africa Report on Social Profile on Vulnerable Groups (2002-2011)

Statistics South Africa Report on Social Profiles (2002-2009)

Statistics South Africa Report on Social Profiles of vulnerable groups in South Africa (2011-2012)

Statistics South Africa Report on How do Women Fare in the South African Labour Market. August 2018.

Articles

Apleni, L 2012. Women's Role in the Transformation of South Africa. Research Division of Africa Institute of South Africa. Solomon Mahlangu Freedom College Young Writers Competition

Commission on Sustainable Development (CSD) Report. 2004-2005. Making Water a Part of Economic Development. Norway and Sweden Governments

Facts on Social Security, (Undated). International Labour Organisations

Bosch A, 2015. *Women are Still Paid Less than Men in South African Companies.* Disclosure Statement. University of Johannesburg, South Africa

Hurlbut W.B. 2018. *Overcoming Poverty and Inequality in South Africa: An Assessment of Drivers, Constraints and Opportunities.*

International Women's Forum: South Africa. *Joining Forces for Gender Equality and Inclusive Development.* Frontier Advisory

Makhafola G. 2018. *144 Service Delivery Protests Recorded in 2018 so far.* www.iol.co.za – 13/11/2018

Ngwenya N. 2015. *Community Protest: Local Government Perceptions.* South African Local Government Association.

Zuma J.G. 2011. *Social Grants Can't be Sustained.* City Press 2011-11-24 09h42

Zhang Y, Thelen N, Rao A. 2010. *Social Protection in Fiscal Stimulus Packages: Some Evidence.* United Nations Development Programme. New York